Kummissarju għall-Istandards fil-Ħajja Pubblika

ĠABRA TAL-EVIDENZA – KATEGORIJA B, IT-TIENI VOLUM

Każ Nru:	K/036
Ilmenti:	Għoti ta' kuntratt ta' konsulenza fuq bażi ta' ħbiberija personali lil persuna mhix ikkwalifikata
Ilmentaturi:	Alison Bogdanovic Il-Professur Arnold Cassola
Dati tal-Ilmenti:	21 ta' Marzu 2021 22 ta' Marzu 2021
Data ta' Dan ir-Rapport:	10 ta' Diċembru 2021

Dan il-volum ta' evidenza qed jiġi ppreżentat lill-Kumitat għall-Istandards fil-Ħajja Pubblika flimkien mar-rapport tal-Kummissarju għall-Istandards fil-Ħajja Pubblika dwar il-każ K/036. Minħabba l-kwantità u n-natura tal-evidenza, din ġiet maqsuma fi tliet kategoriji:

- **Kategorija A:** dokumenti annessi mar-rapport tal-Kummissarju. Din il-kategorija tinkludi biss l-ilmenti li wassluh biex jinvestiga l-każ, u riproduzzjoni ta' artiklu li deher fil-gazzetta *MaltaToday* u li jirreferi għalih wieħed mill-ilmentaturi.
- **Kategorija B:** dokumenti li qed jiġu pprovduti separatament u li huma miġbura f'żewġ volumi. Din il-kategorija tinkludi traskrizzjonijiet u sommarji ta' xhieda bil-fomm, stqarrijiet bil-miktub, u dokumenti oħra pprovduti mix-xhieda.
- **Kategorija Ċ:** din il-kategorija tinkludi fost oħrajn l-emails li huma rilevanti għall-każ u li ttieħdu mill-mailbox ta' Danijel Bogdanovic; dokument ipprovdut mill-Uffiċċju tal-Prim Ministru li huwa relatat mal-ingaġġ tas-Sur Bogdanovic bħala membru tas-segretarjat tal-Ministru Caruana; u dokumentazzjoni oħra li hija ta' natura privata u għandha biss rabta inċidentali mal-każ. Din l-evidenza m'għandhiex tiġi ppubblikata u qed tiġi ppreżentata separatament għal din ir-raġuni.

3. Dokumenti – Dr Paul Debattista

Dokument	*DOK Nru:*
Sommarju tax-xhieda ta' Dr Paul Debattista, datat l-4 t'Awwissu 2021.	B/PD/1

4. Dokumenti - Is-Sur Kenneth Cutajar

Dokument	*DOK Nru:*
Sommarju tax-xhieda tas-Sur Kenneth Cutajar, fil-5 t'Awwissu 2021.	B/KC/1

5. Dokumenti – Is-Sur John Borg

Dokument	*DOK Nru:*
Sommarju tax-xhieda tas-Sur John Borg, datat it-12 t'Awwissu 2021.	B/JB/1

6. Dokumenti – Is-Sur Johnny Camilleri

Dokument	*DOK Nru:*
Sommarju tax-xhieda tas-Sur Johnny Camilleri, datat it-12 t'Awwissu 2021.	B/JCam/1

7. Dokumenti - Is-Sur Danijel Bogdanovic

Dokument	*DOK Nru:*
Sommarju tax-xhieda tas-Sur Danijel Bogdanovic, datat it-23 t'Awwissu 2021.	B/DB/1
Ittra mingħand is-Sur Danijel Bogdanovic lill-Kummissarju għall-Istandards, mibgħuta b'USB Drive, datata t-30 t'Awwissu 2021.	B/DB/2
Kopja ta' abbozz tar-rapport mingħajr ifformattjar, bit-titlu "Assessment, Review and Recommendations for National Sports School" kif ipprovdut mis-Sur Bogdanovic fuq USB Drive, datata Marzu 2021.	B/DB/3
Kopja parzjalment ifformattjata tal-abbozz tar-rapport bit-titlu "Assessment, Review and Recommendations for National Sports School", kif ipprovdut mis-Sur Bogdanovic fuq USB Drive, datata 23 ta' Marzu 2021.	B/DB/4

8. Dokumenti – L-Onorevoli Dr Justyne Caruana

Dokument	*DOK Nru:*
Sommarju tax-xhieda tal-Onorevoli Dr Justyne Caruana, datat is-26 t'Awwissu 2021.	B/JC/1
Sommmarju ta' laqgħa mal-Onorevoli Dr Justyne Caruana, datat 1 t'Ottubru 2021	B/JC/2
Sottomissjonijiet bil-miktub tal-Onorevoli Dr Justyne Caruana datati l-22 t'Ottubru 2021.	B/JC/3

9. Dokumenti – Is-Sur Joe Caruana Curran

Dokument	*DOK Nru:*
Sommarju tax-xhieda tas-Sur Joe Caruana Curran, datat l-1 ta' Settembru 2021.	B/JCC/1
Screenshots ta' messaġġi li nbtagħtu bil-whatsapp, bejn Dr Paul Debattista u s-Sur Joe Caruana Curran, ipprovduti mis-Sur Joe Caruana Curran fl-istess seduta u vverifikati mill-Kummissarju għall-Istandards.	B/JCC/2 B/JCC/2a

10. Dokumenti – Is-Sur Bjorn Vassallo

Dokument	*DOK Nru:*
Sommarju tax-xhieda tas-Sur Bjorn Vassallo, datat s-16 ta' Settembru 2021	B/BV/1

11. Dokumenti – People and Standards Division

Dokument	*DOK Nru:*
Itta mibgħuta mill-uffiċċju tal-Kummissarju għall-Istandards lil Dr Joyce Cassar, Segretarju Permanenti (People and Standards Division) fl-Uffiċċju tal-Prim Ministru, datata s-6 ta' Settembru 2021.	B/PSD/1
Ittra mingħand Dr Joyce Cassar lill-Kummissarju għall-Istandards, datata s-7 ta' Settembru 2021.	B/PSD/2
Itta mibgħuta mill-uffiċċju tal-Kummissarju għall-Istandards lil Dr Joyce Cassar, Segretarju Permanenti (People and Standards Division) fl-Uffiċċju tal-Prim Ministru, datata t-8 ta' Settembru 2021.	B/PSD/3
Ittra mingħand Dr Joyce Cassar lill-Kummissarju għall-Istandards, datata d-9 ta' Settembru 2021.	B/PSD/4

12. Dokumenti – Accountant General

Dokument	*DOK Nru:*
Ittra mingħand Ms Paulanna Mamo, il-Accountant Ġenerali, lill-Kummissarju għall-Istandards fil-Ħajja Pubblika, datata d-9 ta' Settembru 2021.	B/AcG/1

13. Dokumenti – Misc.

Dokument	*DOK Nru:*
Screenshot ċar tad-direttorju tal-Gvern li juri l-kont tal-email u dettalji tas-Sur Bogdanovic, bħala membru tas-Segretarjat tal-Ministru għall-Edukazzjoni.	B/Misc/1

3. Dr Paul Debattista
Konsulent tal-Ministru
għall-Edukazzjoni

Sommarju tax-xhieda ta' Dr Paul Debattista

Każ: K/036

Data: 4 ta' Awwissu 2021

Preżenti: Dr George Hyzler, Kummissarju għall-Istandards fil-Ħajja Pubblika
Charles Polidano, Direttur Ġenerali fl-uffiċċju tal-Kummissarju
Dr Sarah Pace Warrington, Investigatur u Analista fl-uffiċċju tal-Kummissarju

Dr Paul Debattista, Konsulent, Ministeru għall-Edukazzjoni

Dr Debattista ħalef bil-ġurament li jgħid is-sewwa.

Dr Debattista spjega li l-irwol tiegħu huwa dak ta' konsulent tal-Ministru Justyne Caruana, Ministru għall-Edukazzjoni. Xogħolu hu li jagħti pariri u anki jikkoordina studji li jsiru minn ħaddieħor. Qabel kien konsulent mal-Ministru għall-Finanzi.

Dr Debattista qal li hekk kif il-Ministru Caruana assumiet il-kariga tagħha, hija rċeviet diversi kummenti u ilmenti, "*anki through il-Customer Care*",[1] dwar l-Iskola Nazzjonali tal-Isport. B'riżultat ta' dan il-Ministru qalet lil Dr Debattista li kien hemm bżonn studju biex wieħed jara x'hemm bżonn jinbidel fil-mod ta' kif din l-iskola kienet qed titmexxa wara disa' snin minn mindu twaqqfet. Talbitu jipprepara terms of reference.

Dr Debattista ta parir lill-Ministru li studju bħal dan kellu jsir minn persuna estraneja mill-ministeru sabiex tkun aktar oġġettiva. Ippreżentalha terms of reference għall-istudju, kriterji għall-għażla tal-persuna li kellha tagħmel l-istudju, u stima dwar kemm kellha titħallas din il-persuna.

Il-Ministru aċċettat it-terms of reference u l-kriterji u pproponiet l-isem ta' Daniel Bogdanovic. Dr Debattista qal: "*Jien qatt, fl-aħħar ħamsa u għoxrin sena li ħdimt ma', ma' ministri, qatt ma tajt ismijiet. Nagħti x'għandu jkollu il-kriterji, l-eliġibilità tal-individwu, imma ma nidħolx jiena. Hi semmietli isem, ta' Daniel Bogdanovic.*"[2]

Dr Debattista kien jaf min hu s-Sur Bogdanovic għalkemm ma kienx jafu personalment, u deherlu li s-Sur Bogdanovic kien jaqa' fil-parametri ta' eliġibilità li huwa kien fassal. Għalhekk huwa avviċina l-uffiċċju tas-Segretarju Permanenti tal-ministeru, Dr Frank Fabri, biex dan imexxi l-proċeduri biex is-Sur Bogdanovic jitqabbad jagħmel l-istudju.

---

1 Reġistrazzjoni tax-xhieda, 6:29.

2 Reġistrazzjoni tax-xhieda, 4:14.

Dr Debattista qal li l-kriterji li huwa kien fassal kienu jagħmlu emfażi fuq il-football għaliex sittin fil-mija tal-istudenti tal-Iskola Nazzjonali tal-Isport kienu jipprattikaw dan l-isport. Għoxrin fil-mija oħra kienu jipprattikaw il-waterpolo. Wara li ġie nominat is-Sur Bogdanovic biex jagħmel l-istudju, il-presidenti tal-Aquatic Sports Association u tal-Malta Football Association ġew avviċinati biex jagħtu l-opinjoni tagħhom fuq l-għażla tiegħu (għalkemm ma ntalbux japprovaw l-għażla), u huma indikaw li fil-fehma tagħhom l-għażla kienet waħda tajba. Il-president tal-Aquatic Sports Association kien Joe Caruana Curran u dak tal-Malta Football Association kien Bjorn Vassallo.

Dr Debattista qal li l-istudju kien meqjus urġenti għaliex l-intenzjoni kienet li t-tibdiliet li jiġu identifikati jibdew jiġu attwati mis-sena skolastika li jmiss, jiġifieri dik li tibda f'Ottubru 2021. Qal li għalkemm is-sena skolastika tibda f'Ottubru, l-għażla tat-tfal issir minn Mejju sa nofs Ġunju, u dan kien wieħed mill-aspetti li kellu jiġi indirizzat mill-istudju. Għalhekk l-istudju kellu jkun lest sa Mejju.

Dr Debattista qal li kien hu li pprepara ż-żewġ dokumenti annessi mal-email tiegħu tat-12 ta' Jannar 2021 lil Dr Francis Fabri, is-Segretarju Permanenti. Qal li din id-dokumentazzjoni kienet neċessarja bħala parti mill-proċess ta' approvazzjoni ta' direct order. Biss, il-proċess biex tiġi akkwistata l-approvazzjoni tmexxa mill-uffiċċju tas-Segretarju Permanenti.

Dr Debattista ppreċiża li meta isem is-Sur Bogdanovic ġie propost lilu, ir-reazzjoni immedjata tiegħu kienet li s-Sur Bogdanovic kien prima facie jikkwalifika skont il-kriterji mfassla minnu, iżda imbagħad huwa talab CV mingħand is-Sur Bogdanovic u għamel evalwazzjoni aktar dettaljata.

Mis-CV Dr Debattista ra li apparti l-esperjenza li s-Sur Bogdanovic kellu barra minn Malta, li kulħadd kien jaf biha, huwa kien qed jikkwalifika bħala coach tal-football. Is-Sur Bogdanovic diġà kellu l-Licence C u l-Licence B u kien qiegħed jagħmel il-kors tal-Licence A. Dr Debattista talab ukoll mingħand is-Sur Bogdanovic il-kurrikulu tal-korsijiet tal-Licence C u l-Licence B u ra li dawn jiffokaw fuq it-taħriġ taż-żgħażagħ, inkluż ir-relazzjonijiet bejn il-coach u l-ġenituri tagħhom.

Dr Debattista qal li sew fil-każ tal-Iskola Nazzjonali tal-Isport u sew fil-każ tal-Iskola tal-Arti, ma ġietx imqabbda persuna bi kwalifiki għolja (per eżempju dottorat) biex tagħmel l-istudju "*għaliex il-background tiegħu hu purament akkademiku u jsir żball kbir jekk dawn iż-żewġ branki jitmexxew b'mod akkademiku meta tal-anqas sittin fil-mija tal-ħin assolutament mhuwiex akkademiku.*"[3] Bħala eżempju fil-każ tal-Iskola Nazzjonali tal-Isport, Dr Debattista qal li persuna akkademika mhix se tiffoka fuq in-nutrition tal-istudenti.

Dr Debattista qal li s-Sur Bogdanovic tħallas pagament wieħed ta' €5,000 taħt il-kuntratt. "*Pagament wieħed sar, u jien approvajtu. Għaliex? Għaliex, emm, bħal kull studju ieħor li jsir fil-ministeru, kemm jekk ikun, emm, minn xi fund-out jew anki internal, anki sempliċiment strateġiji, dawk kollha jiġu għandi. Jiena narahom, nivvettjahom, ngħaddi l-kummenti, insaqsi fuqhom, u allura anki dan kellu jiġi għandi u nara jekk hux qiegħed fil-, skont it-terms of*

---

[3] Reġistrazzjoni tax-xhieda, 17:37.

reference. U allura meta wasal għall-pagament, jiena, emm, approvajt li, li jitħallas five thousand euros, u dak kien, emm, jien dak l-uniku wieħed li iffirmajt."[4]

Mistoqsi għalfejn il-pagament kien inqas minn dak ta' €7,000 li kien previst, Dr Debattista qal li hu kien ra x-xogħol li kien sar sa dak l-istadju u deherlu li kellu jitħallas €5,000, u għalhekk talab lis-Sur Bogdanovic jibgħat invoice għal dan l-ammont. Dr Debattista qal: "[...] *jiena kien ikolli meetings regolari miegħu, jiġifieri, jiġifieri, bħal kull, eh, assignment ieħor li qed jagħmlu nies oħra, ikolli meetings regolari magħhom, jiġifieri mhux li tajtek assignment, qgħadt nistenna hemmhekk, wara xi xahrejn ġibtli r-rapport, u għedtlek hawnhekk – jiġifieri jien, kif naħdem jien huwa li jekk hemm assignment, regolarment isir meeting ħalli jekk hemm xi affarijiet li wieħed irid jirranġa, jagħmilhom mallewwel mhux fl-aħħar tal-, tal-perjodu*."[5]

Dr Debattista rrikonoxxa li l-pagament sar fid-19 ta' Frar 2021 avolja l-kuntratt ġie ffirmat biss fis-26 ta' Frar. Qal li f'ħafna ministeri jiġri li l-kuntratti jdumu biex jiġu iffirmati, iżda f'dan il-każ l-approvazzjonijiet neċessarji kienu diġà ngħataw u x-xogħol kien sar.

Mistoqsi jekk ġietx imqabbda xi persuna mill-ministeru biex tgħin fil-preparazzjoni tal-abbozz tar-rapport ippreżentat mis-Sur Bogdanovic, Dr Debattista qal li dan ma kienx il-każ. Huwa ma kienx jaf jekk min-naħa tiegħu is-Sur Bogdanovic kienx qabbad lil xi ħadd biex jgħinu.

Mistoqsi jekk irċeviex ir-rapport mingħand is-Sur Bogdanovic bħala hard copy jew bl-email, Dr Debattista qal: "*Le, bagħatuli*, *bagħatuli* [pawża u ħoss ta' nifs 'il barra], *hard copy. Hard copy bagħatuli. Imbagħad skannjajtu jiena u għaddejtu lill-, lill-, l-uffiċċju tas-Segretarju Permanenti.*"[6] Mistoqsi x'kien li s-Sur Bogdanovic għadda r-rapport fil-forma ta' hard copy, Dr Debattista qal: "*Għax safejn naf jien dak kien diġà tteħidlu l-laptop tiegħu. Ma nafx. Għaddihuli hard copy*."[7] Dr Debattista qal li bħala impjegat fil-Community Work Scheme, is-Sur Bogdanovic kellu laptop tal-ministeru.

Dr Debattista ma ngħatax ir-rapport mis-Sur Bogdanovic direttament iżda permezz ta' individwi Għawdxin li jaħdmu Malta. Madankollu Dr Debattista qal li ma jiftakarx min għaddielu r-rapport.

Dr Debattista qal li hu ma kienx involut fid-deċiżjoni li l-kuntratt tas-Sur Bogdanovic jiġi tterminat. Qal li għad li r-rapport ma kienx komplut, kien jirrappreżenta bażi fuqiex wieħed jimxi. Minkejja dan, wara t-terminazzjoni tal-kuntratt ma sarx xogħol fuq l-implimentazzjoni tar-rapport għaliex kien hemm deċiżjoni tal-Ministru li f'dan l-istadju l-proġett ma jitkompliex. B'hekk intilfet opportunità u l-bidla fil-mod ta' kif isiru l-għażliet se tkun tista' ssir biss għas-sena skolastika li tibda f'Ottubru tal-2022.

---

[4] Reġistrazzjoni tax-xhieda, 20:38.

[5] Reġistrazzjoni tax-xhieda, 23:04.

[6] Reġistrazzjoni tax-xhieda, 27:45.

[7] Reġistrazzjoni tax-xhieda, 35:08.

Fir-rigward tal-allegazzjoni li l-Ministru Caruana kellha relazzjoni intima mas-Sur Bogdanovic, Dr Debattista qal li hu ma kien jaf b'xejn u ma seta' jgħid xejn ħlief li l-Ministru kienet qegħda tgħix mat-tfal tagħha u ma' ommha.

Dr Debattista ma setax jagħti informazzjoni dwar l-ingaġġ tas-Sur Bogdanovic bħala membru tal-Community Work Scheme. L-informazzjoni li kellu Dr Debattista kienet li fil-kapaċità tiegħu bħala membru tal-iskema, is-Sur Bogdanovic kien ġie mqabbad jara x'faċilitajiet sportivi kellhom l-iskejjel.

Dr Debattista ltaqa' mas-Sur Bogdanovic għall-ewwel darba meta beda jitkellem miegħu in konnessjoni mal-kuntratt dwar l-Iskola Nazzjonali tal-Isport. Qatt ma kien rah qabel fis-segretarjat tal-Ministru u ma kienx jaf x'benefiċċji kellu, għalkemm safejn kien jaf hu s-Sur Bogdanovic ma kellux karozza tal-ministeru.

Dr Debattista qal li kien jiltaqa' mas-Sur Bogdanovic in persona biex jiddiskutu x-xogħol tiegħu taħt il-kuntratt, iżda ma kien hemm ebda records uffiċjali tal-feedback li huwa kien ta lis-Sur Bogdanovic f'dawn il-laqgħat.

Sommarju magħmul minn: Charles Polidano

Data tal-aħħar reviżjoni: 24 ta' Awwissu 2021

4. Is-Sur Kenneth Cutajar
CEO District Operations Ltd.

Sommarju tax-xhieda tas-Sur Kenneth Cutajar

Każ: K/036

Data: 5 ta' Awwissu 2021

Preżenti: Dr George Hyzler, Kummissarju għall-Istandards fil-Ħajja Pubblika
Charles Polidano, Direttur Ġenerali fl-uffiċċju tal-Kummissarju
Dr Sarah Pace Warrington, Investigatur u Analista fl-uffiċċju tal-Kummissarju

Is-Sur Kenneth Cutajar, Kap Eżekuttiv, District Operations Ltd.

Is-Sur Cutajar ħalef bil-ġurament li jgħid is-sewwa.

Is-Sur Cutajar spjega li l-kumpanija tiegħu hija nkarigata bl-amministrazzjoni tal-Community Work Scheme.

Is-Sur Cutajar qal li huwa l-kompitu tal-Jobsplus li tidentifika l-individwi li għandhom jidħlu f'din l-iskema u tgħaddi l-ismijiet tagħhom lill-kumpanija. Il-kumpanija timpjegahom fil-Community Workers' Foundation u ssibilhom post tax-xogħol fejn jaħdmu. Il-kriterji għad-dħul fl-iskema huma stabbiliti mill-Jobsplus u l-kumpanija ma tidħolx fihom. Il-pagi tal-ħaddiema fl-iskema jitħallsu mill-kumpanija iżda tiġbor l-ispejjeż lura mingħand il-Jobsplus.

Hemm ukoll kategorija ta' ħaddiema li ddaħħlu fl-iskema mill-Jobsplus fuq ir-rakkomandazzjoni tal-Ministeru għal Għawdex. Dawn il-ħaddiema jitħallsu l-paga tagħhom bl-istess arranġament tal-bqija, iżda l-Ministeru għal Għawdex jirrifondi l-paga tagħhom lill-Jobsplus.

Is-Sur Cutajar qal li Daniel Bogdanovic kien daħal fl-iskema bħala Sports Educator fuq rakkomandazzjoni li kienet saret mill-Ministeru għal Għawdex fit-2 ta' Jannar 2018. Il-Ministeru għal Għawdex kien jirrifondi l-paga tas-Sur Bogdanovic lill-Jobsplus. Dan l-arranġament baqa' fis-seħħ sa Jannar tal-2020, meta kien hemm talba tas-Segretarju Permanenti fil-Ministeru għall-Edukazzjoni biex is-Sur Bogdanovic jiġi trasferit f'dan il-ministeru. Is-Sur Bogdanovic għadu jaħdem fil-Ministeru għall-Edukazzjoni bħala parti mill-iskema, u dan il-ministeru qed jirrifondi l-paga tiegħu lill-Jobsplus.

Is-Sur Cutajar ippreżenta kopji tal-aħħar tmien payslips tas-Sur Bogdanovic, jiġifieri minn Diċembru tal-2020 sa Lulju tal-2021. Is-Sur Cutajar qal li s-Sur Bogdanovic m'għandu ebda perkaċċi bħala parti mill-iskema. Is-Sur Cutajar qal li hemm każi fejn l-entità li timpjega ħaddiema partikolari tirrakkomanda li jingħataw paga ogħla biex tirrifletti r-risponsabbiltajiet tagħhom, iżda dan ma seħħx fil-każ tas-Sur Bogdanovic.

Is-Sur Cutajar ikun jaf li impjegat partikolari jkun daħal fl-iskema fuq ir-rakkomandazzjoni ta' ministeru għaliex is-Segretarju Permanenti jkun ikkomunika din ir-rakkomandazzjoni

direttament lilu. Min-naħa tiegħu is-Sur Cutajar ifittex l-approvazzjoni tal-Jobsplus. Għal dan il-għan huwa jikkomunika mas-Sur Mario Xuereb, li huwa l-kap tat-taqsima relevanti fil-Jobsplus.

B'riferenza għall-payslips tas-Sur Bogdanovic, is-Sur Cutajar qal li l-impjegati kollha fl-iskema huma eliġibbli għal performance bonus ta' €450. Din titħallas lill-impjegat mill-kumpanija, bħall-paga normali, iżda l-kumpanija tieħu rifużjoni tal-bonus mhux mingħand il-Jobsplus iżda direttament mill-entità li tkun qed tħaddem lil dak l-impjegat. Il-ħlas tal-bonus jiddependi fuq performance appraisal li ssir mill-entità. Min iġib tal-anqas sebgħin fil-mija fl-appraisal jieħu s-somma sħiħa ta' €450, mentri min iġib inqas jitħallas somma inqas skont il-kriterji tal-bonus.

Is-Sur Cutajar kompla jgħid li l-appraisal issir mis-supervisor tal-impjegat għan-nom tal-entità li tħaddmu, iżda tkun ibbażata fuq formola maħruġa mill-kumpanija. Il-formola mimlija ta' kull impjegat fl-iskema tintbagħat lill-kumpanija. L-appraisal issir f'Diċembru u tkun tgħodd għas-sena li tkun waslet biex tintemm. Is-Sur Cutajar inkariga ruħu li jibgħat kopja tal-aħħar appraisal tas-Sur Bogdanovic lill-uffiċċju tal-Kummissarju.

Mistoqsi jekk jafx f'liema uffiċċju huwa assenjat is-Sur Bogdanovic, is-Sur Cutajar qal li meta kien mal-Ministeru għal Għawdex is-Sur Bogdanovic kien assenjat fil-Gozo Sports Course. Is-Sur Cutajar qal li meta s-Sur Bogdanovic ġie trasferit għal mal-Ministeru għall-Edukazzjoni, "*oriġinarjament kien li ħarġitlu xi email min-naħa tas-segretarjat*".[1] B'hekk is-Sur Cutajar ingħata x'jifhem li għall-bidu s-Sur Bogdanovic kien assenjat mas-segretarjat tal-Ministru. Qal iżda li aktar tard is-Sur Bogdanovic kien "*roaming*", jiġifieri ma kienx assenjat f'uffiċċju wieħed partikolari.

Sommarju magħmul minn: Charles Polidano

Data tal-aħħar reviżjoni: 16 ta' Awwissu 2021

---

1 Reġistrazzjoni tax-xhieda, 17:56.

5. Is-Sur John Borg
Segretarju Permanenti fil-Ministeru għal Għawdex

Sommarju tax-xhieda tas-Sur John Borg

Data:	Il-Ħamis 12 ta' Awwissu 2021
Preżenti:	Dr George Hyzler, Kummissarju għall-Istandards fil-Ħajja Pubblika Charles Polidano, Direttur Ġenerali fl-uffiċċju tal-Kummissarju Dr Sarah Pace Warrington, Investigatur fl-uffiċċju tal-Kummissarju Is-Sur John Borg, Segretarju Permanenti, Ministeru għal Għawdex
Post:	L-uffiċċju tal-Kummissarju
Għan:	Sabiex is-Sur Borg jixhed bil-ġurament kif mitlub fl-ittra ta' taħrika datata 5 t'Awwissu 2021 dwar il-każ K/036.

Is-Sur Borg ħalef bil-ġurament li jgħid is-sewwa.

Is-Sur Borg spjega li matul iż-żmien, kien hemm skemi f'Għawdex għal dawk in-nies li ma setgħux isibu xogħol. Ikkonferma illi Danijel Bogdanovic daħal f'skema minnhom fl-2017, liema skema saret bi qbil bejn l-ETC (issa Jobsplus) u l-Ministeru għal Għawdex dak iż-żmien. Bħala parti mill-proċess, l-ETC kienet tagħżel kandidati, tintervistahom u tibgħathom f'post tax-xogħol skont il-kapaċità tagħhom. Fl-2018, l-iskemi eżistenti ġo Għawdex, inkluż l-iskema li taħtha daħal is-Sur Bogdanovic, ġew inkorporati taħt l-iskema kurrenti imsemmija l-Community Work Scheme. Is-Sur Borg ikkonferma wkoll li mill-2018 'il quddiem, il-Ministeru beda jħallas lill-Community Work Scheme jew lil Jobsplus u mhux lill-impjegati direttament.

Bħala parti mis-sistema, il-Ministeru jħallas bonuses għall-impjegati fl-iskema, skont persentaġġ ibbażat fuq il-performance tagħhom. Bl-istess mod, dawn il-bonuses jitħallsu lill-Jobsplus u mhux l-impjegati direttament. Is-Sur Borg stqarr li ma jafx kif Danijel Bogdanovic daħal fl-iskema bil-kariga/titolu ta' 'sports educator'. Is-Sur Borg ikkonferma illi s-Sur Bogdanovic baqa' fl-iskema wara l-2019.

Ikkonferma illi meta s-Sur Bogdanovic kien mal-Ministeru għal Għawdex, ma kienx jaħdem mas-segretarjat, ċioe li qatt ma kien wieħed mid-dsatax-il uffiċjal tas-segretarjat. Filwaqt illi qal li huwa possibbli li persuna tiġi mislufa, qal li hu qatt ma kien ra lis-Sur Bogdanovic fis-segretarjat, u lanqas kien misluf hemmhekk taħt ebda Ministru għal Għawdex. Ma setax jgħid però x'kien jagħmel is-Sur Bogdanovic meta kien jaħdem mal-Ministeru għal Għawdex, peress li bħala regola, ċerti gradi ta' impjegati ma jkunx jaf ix-xogħol tagħhom.

Trasferiment ta' Danijel Bogdanovic għall-Ministeru għall-Edukazzjoni

Meta l-Onor. Justyne Caruana laħqet Ministru għall-Edukazzjoni fl-2020, is-Sur Borg induna illi "*dan ma baqax jiġi għandna f'daqqa waħda*". Meta s-Sur Borg staqsa fejn kien, "*kif fittixna, sibnieh li qiegħed … fl-email tal-Gvern mal-ewwel sibnieh illi qiegħed secretariat, qiegħed fis-segretarjat ta' Justyne Caruana*." Wara li indunaw b'dan is-Sur Borg kellem lis-Segretarju

Permanenti tal-Ministeru għall-Edukazzjoni, Frank Fabri, u ġab konferma illi s-Sur Bogdanovic kien ġie trasferit għall-Ministeru għall-Edukazzjoni. Dr Fabri qallu "*eh kont ser ngħidlek ta, biex naqilbuh*". Ikkonferma illi l-proċess biex in-nies jiċċaqalqu minn ministeru għal ieħor normalment jieħu madwar ġimgħa. L-ewwel bniedem imur fil-post, jaqa' taħt proċess ta' screening mill-Uffiċċju tal-Prim Ministru, u wara dan jista' jsir trasferiment formali.

Skont is-Sur Borg, huwa possibbli illi s-Sur Bogdanovic kellu kont tal-email tal-gvern minn qabel, kif inhu l-każ ma' ħafna impjegati li mhux neċessarjament ikollhom xogħol f'uffiċċju. Ikkonferma illi kif sar jaf bil-bidla, "*kellimt lil Frank Fabri, u ddeċidejna ... u sar it-transfer*" u allura kien hu li pprovoka t-trasferiment formali.

Is-Sur Borg informa lill-Community Work Scheme illi s-Sur Bogdanovic ġie ttrasferit għall-Ministeru għall-Edukazzjoni, u min-naħa tagħhom, ġie trasferit fuq il-paylist tal-Ministeru għall-Edukazzjoni. Ma jafx jekk fil-fatt imbagħad is-Sur Bogdanovic daħalx mas-segretarjat jew le. Però ikkonferma illi l-kariga tas-Sur Bogdanovic, kif deher fid-direttorju tal-email tal-gvern, indika li s-Sur Bogdanovic kien ser ikun wieħed mid-dsatax tas-segretarjat.

Qal ukoll illi huwa normali li l-email address ta' persuna jinbidel qabel ma jkun formalment ikkonfermat bħala membru ta' ministeru ġdid. Bħala eżempju, semma' l-każ tas-Sur Johnny Camilleri. Is-Sur Borg qal anki f'dan il-każ huwa nduna mid-direttorju tal-Gvern li dan kien mar mal-Ministeru tal-Edukazzjoni. Bħas-Sur Bogdanovic u s-Sur Camilleri, kien hemm nies oħra wkoll li bidlu l-ministeru.

Ħlas ta' bonus għas-sena 2020

Is-Sur Borg spjega illi għall-finijiet tal-ħlas tal-performance bonus, id-Diretturi tad-dipartimenti li jaqgħu taħt il-ministeru jissottomettu lista ta' impjegati li huma eliġibbli għall-bonus. Fil-każ tas-Sur Bogdanovic, ladarba t-trasferiment tiegħu sar f'Diċembru tal-2020, huwa possibbli illi l-ħlas/pagament ta' dak ix-xahar sar mill-Ministeru għal Għawdex.

Perkaċċi u benefiċċji oħra

Fir-rigward ta' perkaċċi, is-Sur Borg stqarr illi impjegati bħalma hu is-Sur Bogdanovic ma jkollhomx perkaċċi rilatati mal-użu ta' telefown jew karozza. L-unika ħaġa li individwu jista' jkollu f'każijiet rari, huwa ħlas għall-overtime.

Sommarju magħmul minn: Sarah Pace Warrington

Data tal-aħħar reviżjoni: 30 ta' Settembru 2021

6. Is-Sur Johnny Camilleri
Head of Customer Care fil-Ministeru għall-Edukazzjoni

Sommarju tax-xhieda tas-Sur Johnny Camilleri

Data:	Il-Ħamis 12 ta' Awwissu 2021
Preżenti:	Dr George Hyzler, Kummissarju għall-Istandards fil-Ħajja Pubblika Charles Polidano, Direttur Ġenerali fl-uffiċċju tal-Kummissarju Dr Sarah Pace Warrington, Investigatur fl-uffiċċju tal-Kummissarju Is-Sur Johnny Camilleri, Kap tal-Customer Care Unit, Ministeru għall-Edukazzjoni
Post:	L-uffiċċju tal-Kummissarju
Għan:	Sabiex is-Sur Camilleri jixhed bil-ġurament kif mitlub fl-ittra ta' taħrika datata 5 t'Awwissu 2021 dwar il-każ K/036.

Is-Sur Camilleri ħalef bil-ġurament li jgħid is-sewwa.

Is-Sur Camilleri spjega illi jokkupa l-kariga ta' Kap tal-Customer Care Unit tal-Ministeru għall-Edukazzjoni, u kkjarifika li mhuwiex l-ogħla uffiċjal fis-segretarjat, pero li hemm Head of Secretariat li ma jidhirx fuq il-website tal-Ministeru.

Mistoqsi dwar is-Sur Danijel Bogdanovic u l-irwol tiegħu fil-Ministeru, is-Sur Camilleri qal li s-Sur Bogdanovic mhuwiex parti mis-segretarjat. Ikkonferma illi s-Sur Bogdanovic huwa impjegat tal-Community Workers Scheme u li jaħdem mal-Ministeru għall-Edukazzjoni. Is-Sur Camilleri spjega l-kompitu tiegħu huwa *"li nieħu ħsieb it-team tas-segretarjat...ovvjament, aħna, il-parti tagħna huwa illi, illi, xogħolna huwa customer iġġifieri…"*.

Fir-rigward tat-trasferiment tas-Sur Bogdanovic mill-Ministeru għal Għawdex għall-Ministeru tal-Edukazzjoni, is-Sur Camilleri stqarr illi meta inħatar bħala kap tal-customer care unit, il-Ministru tatu lista ħames individwi. Stqarr illi l-Ministru qatt ma indikatlu persuna oħra biex taħdem miegħu. Mistoqsi jekk il-lista kienet biss għall-customer care jew tas-segretarjat kollu, is-Sur Camilleri stqarr li kien biss tal-customer care unit, u li ma kienx jaf min kienu n-nies oħra fis-segretarjat.

Is-Sur Camilleri stqarr illi r-relazzjoni tiegħu mas-Sur Bogdanovic hija waħda ta' ħbiberija, u li sar jafu minħabba li t-tnejn li huma kienu jilagħbu futbol flimkien, u li issa s-Sur Bogdanovic huwa l-kowċ tiegħu ma' Għajnsielem FC. Filwaqt li s-Sur Camilleri ġieli kien jara lis-Sur Bogdanovic il-Ministeru, ma kienx jaf x'inhu l-irwol tiegħu, jew jekk kienx qed jagħmel xogħol għas-segretarjat. Ikkonferma illi m'għandux informazzjoni fuq il-kundizzjonijiet tax-xogħol tas-Sur Bogdanovic.

Is-Sur Camilleri spjega illi llum il-ġurnata s-Sur Bogdanovic qiegħed fl-uffiċċju tal-Ministeru għall-Edukazzjoni ġo Għawdex, minn fejn jopera wkoll il-Customer Care Unit tal-Ministeru. Stqarr illi s-Sur Bogdanovic ikun preżenti kuljum u *"jagħti daqqa t'id lilna ukoll"* u *"peress li*

mhux parti mis-segretarjat, jien ma nistax nobbliga lil xi ħadd li mhux parti fis-segretarjat li jien intih ix-xogħol x'jagħmel tajjeb? Pero, jgħin lilna, jgħinna fil-karti, photocopies, in-nies min jidħol, temperaturi…" Ikkonferma illi s-Sur Bogdanovic mar jaħdem fl-uffiċju tal-Ministeru f'Għawdex mill-ewwel meta dan fetaħ f'Jannar jew Frar tal-2021.

Mistoqsi jekk is-Sur Bogdanovic għandux tag biex jidħol fl-uffiċċji tal-Ministeru, is-Sur Camilleri qal li m'għandux, u huma l-membri tas-segretarjat biss li għandhom tag. Fuq il-kwistjoni ta' jekk is-Sur Bogdanovic għandu karozza mogħtija mill-Ministeru, is-Sur Camilleri spjega li fil-Ministeru, ħadd m'għandu karozza tiegħu, pero li s-segretarjat għandu żewġ karozzi li jiġu użati għall-istaff u għall-bżonnijiet tal-uffiċċju tal-Edukazzjoni f'Għawdex. Ikkonferma illi meta hemm bżonn, Bogdanovic jieħu l-karozza biex jagħmel qadjiet għall-Ministeru.

Is-Sur Camilleri kkonferma ukoll illi fforma kumpanija mas-Sur Bogdanovic li hija intenzjonata li tofri servizzi rilatati mal-propjeta'. Stqarr illi s'issa il-kumpanija ma għamlet xejn, pero li ġiet iffurmata bl-intenzjoni li is-Sur Bogdanovic ikun jista' jiġġenera iktar dħul.

Mistoqsi jekk setax jitfa' dawl fuq l-allegazzjonijiet li l-Ministru Caruana għandha relazzjoni mas-Sur Bogdanovic, is-Sur Camilleri qal *"jien nara, l-istess relazzjoni li għandu hu għandi jien. Il-Ministru għalina, ifhimni, fi żmien ta' Novembru u Diċembru, speċjalment, jiena l-Ministru nafha way back, tajjeb? Dħalt magħha għax konna ħbieb u dħalt magħha, tajjeb? Erm, f'dawk ix-xahrejn marad missierha, wara li ovvjament għaddiet milli għaddiet, reġa', dħalna fil-Ministeru f'Novembru, u marad missierha, iġġifieri, mill-bidu ta' Novembru, sa nofs Jannar, nassigurak illi l-ħin li qattajna magħha u anke Danijel, kien miegħi preżenti, jgħini niġri bil-karozza, iħallina l-isptar, mill-isptar lura, ljieli, sakemm ovvjament wara seba' ġimgħat miet missierha. Iġġifieri jien, bħala relazzjoni, jien għalija relazzjoni normali bħalma għandi jien mal-Ministru, pero, ma nafx għal xiex, għal liema relazzjoni forsi qed tirreferi għaliha"* u *"jien min naħa tiegħi ma narax li għandi nitfa' dawl, peress li l-istess relazzjoni li għandha hi miegħi, hi mal-istaff kollu"*.

Is-Sur Camilleri spjega ukoll l-irwol tiegħu bħala Head of Customer Care tal-Ministeru, li bħala tim jirċievu kummenti, feedback u ilmenti rigward is-settur tal-edukazzjoni. Spjega illi meta jiġi żmien l-elezzjoni jirċievu kummenti dwar diversi affarijiet. Fir-rigward tal-Iskola Nazzjonali tal-Isport, is-Sur Camilleri stqarr hu qatt ma rċieva kummenti jew ilmenti dwar l-Iskola Nazzjonali tal-Isport, u l-istaff tiegħu qatt ma qalulu li kien hemm xi problema bl-iskola.

Sommarju magħmul minn: Sarah Pace Warrington

Data tal-aħħar reviżjoni: 30 ta' Settembru 2021

7. Is-Sur Danijel Bogdanovic

Sommarju tax-xhieda tas-Sur Danijel Bogdanovic

Data:	It-Tnejn 23 t'Awwissu 2021
Preżenti:	Dr George Hyzler, Kummissarju għall-Istandards fil-Ħajja Pubblika Charles Polidano, Direttur Ġenerali fl-uffiċċju tal-Kummissarju Dr Sarah Pace Warrington, Investigatur fl-uffiċċju tal-Kummissarju Is-Sur Danijel Bogdanovic
Post:	L-uffiċċju tal-Kummissarju
Għan:	Sabiex is-Sur Bogdanovic jixhed bil-ġurament kif mitlub fl-ittra ta' taħrika datata 9 t'Awwissu 2021 dwar il-każ K/036.

Is-Sur Bogdanovic ħalef bil-ġurament li jgħid is-sewwa.

Ix-xogħol tas-Sur Bogdanovic fil-Ministeru għal Għawdex

Is-Sur Bogdanovic spjega illi kien ġie Malta u baqa' hawnhekk bħala footballer professjonali. Fl-2015 jew l-2016, meta kien qed jilgħab max-Xewkija Tigers, il-president tal-klabb, Geoffrey Farrugia, staqsieh għaliex ma jidħolx jaħdem x'imkien filgħodu, dan peress illi l-futbol professjonali f'Malta jintlagħab filgħaxijiet u il-plejers mhux dejjem jitħallsu. Spjega illi f'ħajtu qatt ma kien għamel xejn ħlief jilgħab il-futbol. Is-Sur Bogdanovic kien staqsa jekk kien hemm xi xogħol rilatat mal-isports, bagħat is-CV tiegħu lil skema f'Għawdex, u ġie aċċettat. Wara li ġie aċċettat fl-iskema (issa l-Community Work Scheme), ġie assenjat fl-Isports Complex f'Għawdex. "*U ovvjament...poġġewni Sports Complex, still as a Community Work Scheme, iġġifieri jien ma nbdiltx, jien dejjem, sal-lum il-ġurnata dejjem Community kont…u għadni*". Xogħolu kien li jorganizza l-events li kienu jsiru fl-Isports Complex ta' Għawdex, bħal summer school u events li jsiru wara li l-ġurnata skolastika tispiċċa; jorganizza l-coaches li kien hemm; u jieħu ħsieb il-loġistika tal-kumpless.

Is-Sur Bogdanovic daħal fl-iskema meta Anton Refalo kien il-Ministru għal Għawdex, u meta nbidel il-Ministru għal Għawdex, oriġinarjament baqa' hemm fl-istess post, jaħdem taħt l-istess arranġament. Wara li l-Isports Complex ġie imwaqqa' biex tinbena pixxina kbira, kull min kien qed jaħdem fl-Isports Complex kien trasferit għall-iskola ta' ħdejn il-kumpless. F'xi punt irċieva telefonata, li jissoponi li ġiet mill-uffiċċju tal-Community Work Scheme, fejn qalulu li kien ser jiġi trasferit għall-Ministeru tal-Edukazzjoni peress illi kien qed jaħdem ġo skola. Hu ma opponiex it-trasferiment. Mistoqsi jekk kienx jaf il-Ministru Justyne Caruana dak iż-żmien, is-Sur Bogdanovic qal illi kienu ħbieb diġà. Spjega illi kien ħadem magħha, flimkien ma' plejer ieħor, fuq programm ta' inklużjoni tal-Ministru max-Xewkija Tigers (dan meta kien għadu jaħdem taħt il-Ministeru għal Għawdex).

Is-Sur Bogdanovic qal li safejn jiftakar, kien ġie trasferit għall-Ministeru tal-Edukazzjoni meta laħqet Ministru l-Onorevoli Justyne Caruana f'Novembru 2020. Is-Sur Bogdanovic qal

illi ma kinitx l-għażla tiegħu li jiġi trasferit: "*Għax ifhimni dawn tal-…tal-Community Scheme Work, ma naħsibx li tista' titlob fejn trid tmur u tagħmel…*". Ikkonferma ukoll illi l-paga tiegħu dejjem ħarġet taħt l-istess sistema (amministrata mill-Community Work Scheme) u mill-istess post, u dan l-arranġament qatt ma nbidel minkejja li hu ġie trasferit minn ministeru għal ieħor.

Fir-rigward tax-xogħol li beda jagħmel mal-Ministeru għall-Edukazzjoni, is-Sur Bogdanovic qal li dan inbidel ftit, u ġie mitlub iwassal ittri jew jiġbor files minn skola biex jeħodhom għal oħra, u affarijiet simili. Fl-istess ħin, kien qed jieħu ħsieb affarijiet rilatati mal-isports fejn kien possibbli. Qal li għall-bidu baqa' jaħdem fl-istess post, ċioe l-iskola ta' ħdejn l-Isports Complex. Mistoqsi jekk jaf b'ħaddieħor li ġie trasferit bl-istess mod, is-Sur Bogdanovic stqarr li ma jafx. Is-Sur Bogdanovic spjega li baqa' jagħmel l-istess xogħol: "*eżatt kien, l-uffiċċju, l-uffiċċju t'hemmhekk, eżatt, eżatt, eżatt, kont inwassal per eżempju letters l'hawn u l'hinn u imbagħad ovvjament erm, erm, kont xorta kont ngħin fil-qasam tas-sports għax it-...it-tfal li kien jiġu jagħmlu l-lessons u hekk kienu allokati għall-iskola ukoll. Kien hemm żewġ halls, u kont nieħu ħsieb il-coaches ukoll iġġifieri xorta bqajt nagħmlu dak ix-xogħol, allavolja mhux…imma I still helped because they needed help.*"

Perkaċċi u benefiċċji

Mistoqsi jekk ingħatax karozza mill-Ministeru għall-Edukazzjoni meta ġie trasferit, is-Sur Bogdanovic qal "*ifhem, karozza ma tawhiex lili, karozza kien tal-uffiċċju. Kont nużah jien ijja għall-…għall-affarijiet…*" Mistoqsi jekk hu kien l-unika persuna li kien juża din il-karozza, is-Sur Bogdanovic qal "*le mhux jiena biss, kulħadd kien jużah, kulħadd. Kulħadd min kien…min kellu, kellu bżonn jużah jużah, iġġifieri l-karozza dejjem kienet ipparkjata l-office, xi drabi kienet ipparkjata quddiem il-garaxx tiegħi għax l-uffiċċju fejn qegħdin, il-...Għawdex, erm… hemm six parking spaces, u tnejn minnhom allokati għall-Ministeru għall-Edukazzjoni, l-oħrajn ta' Joe Cordina u l-oħrajn tal-Planning, li qegħdin fl-istess, fl-istess blokka, u ovvjament kull darba li aħna niġu…*". Is-Sur Bogdanovic ikkjarifika li meta kien qed jaħdem mill-iskola ħdejn l-Isports Complex qatt ma kellu karozza tal-gvern.

Bħala membru tas-Segretarjat tal-Ministru Justyne Caruana

Is-Sur Bogdanovic stqarr illi ġie avviċinat min-nies tal-Onorevoli Caruana biex jifforma parti mit-tim tagħha malli saret Ministru tal-Edukazzjoni. Hu wera interess minkejja li qatt ma kien għamel xogħol simili, għalkemm kien għenha fil-passat fuq proġetti oħra: "*qatt ma għamiltu dax-xogħol, imma bħala, bħala, bħala ħbieb, kont ngħinha qabel f'affarijiet oħra, erm, fl-inklużjoni u affarijiet ta' charity u affarijiet hekk u I said why not*".

Mistoqsi dwar il-perjodu meta ġie infurmat mill-Community Work Scheme li kien ser jiġi trasferit għall-Ministeru għall-Edukazzjoni, is-Sur Bogdanovic qal li ma jistax jikkonferma jekk sar jaf bit-trasferiment qabel jew wara li ġie avviċinat biex jifforma parti mis-segretarjat, però stqarr li ġraw fl-istess perjodu. Qal "*ifhimni ma niftakarx, ma niftakarx eżatt, hux telefonata saret qabel jew wara, fis-sens, qalulix qabel jew wara biex nifforma parti. Eżatt id-data ma niftakarx imma f'dawk iż-żminijiet kien. Iġġifieri, ma nistax niftakar eżatt…*". Ikkonferma illi dak iż-żmien, il-Ministru għal Għawdex kien l-Onorevoli Clint Camilleri. Mistoqsi jafx jekk it-talba għat-trasferiment sar meta l-Onorevoli Caruana kienet diġà Ministru, is-Sur Bogdanovic qal li jissoponi illi diġà kienet Ministru meta saret din it-

talba. Mistoqsi jekk kienx il-każ illi malli saret Ministru tal-Edukazzjoni, l-Onorevoli Caruana talbet li jifforma parti mit-tim tagħha is-Sur Bogdanovic ikkonferma dan. Ikkonferma ukoll illi kien f'dan il-perjodu li beda juża l-karozza tal-Ministeru.

Is-Sur Bogdanovic ikkonferma illi l-proċess biex jifforma parti mis-segretarjat kien beda u li tħajjar jifforma parti mit-tim. Qal li malli bdew jidhru "*shows*" fil-gazzetti, iddeċieda li ma riedx jifforma parti mis-segretarjat peress li m'għamel xejn ħażin, u iddeċieda jieqaf minn dak ix-xogħol. Skont is-Sur Bogdanovic, dawn l-istejjer dehru fil-gazzetti fl-istess perjodu meta daħal fis-segretarjat. Mistoqsi meta bdew jidhru dan l-istejjer, is-Sur Bogdanovic irrisponda: *"ġraw ħafna, le dak kollu mill-bidu beda jiġri* […] *hekk nissoponi. Jiena kont, kont hemm u ovvjament kien isir ħafna media allegations u ħafna, ħafna affarijiet hekk u jiena ddeċidejt isma, I'm doing nothing wrong, jiena, ppruvajt ngħin, u ovvjament, ma rajtx, ma rajtx li it was something fitting my...".*

Stqarr illi d-deċiżjoni li ma jifformax parti mis-segretarjat kienet tiegħu: *"jien iddeċidejt, għidtilhom, isma, għidtilhom this is not for me. Jiena, jiena bniedem kapaċi ħafna u u u, and I'm very very…very willing to to to... to give a good service, bħalma dejjem tajt lil dan il-pajjiż, għax jiena dan il-pajjiż, ksirt saqajja darbtejn għalih, u u għamilt ħafna sagrifiċċji għal dan il-pajjiż. Qatt ma tlabt xejn lura, iġġifieri, I was always trying to do something for the good. Ovvjament imbagħad iddeċidejt isma, this, this is not for me.*"

Is-Sur Bogdanovic irrefera wkoll għall-football: "*anke ħabba, ħabba raġunijiet ta' football ukoll, li jiena ma kontx naf xi jfisser taħdem dak it-tip ta, fis-sens, tkun involut fis-segretarjat, tkun involut ma', ma', ma' dat-tip ta' xogħol, u l-volum ta'sigħat li li li jirrikjedi".* Mistoqsi kemm għadda żmien minn meta rċieva l-istedina li jaħdem mas-segretarjat sa meta kkommunika d-deċiżjoni tiegħu li jieqaf, is-Sur Bogdanovic qal "*a couple of months, a couple of months probably*" u "*between a month and two, somewhere around that bracket.*" Qal ukoll "*It was not my world, let's put it that way*".

Ikkonferma illi biex tidħol l-uffiċċji tal-Ministeru jkollok card, li hu kellu ukoll meta ġie trasferit għall-Ministeru tal-Edukazzjoni. Ma setax jiftakar min tah il-card. Mistoqsi dwar business cards stampati b'ismu, is-Sur Bogdanovic qall illi l-business cards li ġew preparati b'ismu saru bi żball u cards simili kienu ġew stampati għal kulħadd. Fir-rigward ta' perkaċċi rilatati mal-mobile, is-Sur Bogdanovic ċaħad li ingħata mobile phone jew li kellu l-ispejjeż tal-mobile phone imħallsin mill-Ministeru. Però ikkonferma li kien ingħata laptop mill-Ministeru: *"dawk iż-żminijiet, it was…second week, around the beginning".*

Is-Sur Bogdanovic qal "*ara fil-bidu kienet, li ħa nkun parti minn, mis-segretarjat.*" Mistoqsi x'kien ser ikun l-irwol tiegħu, qal "*kollox naħseb, għax I..I..I… jiena ma kellix, specific, specific erm…task. Jiena kont erm…norganizza eżempju, ejja mmorru event, f'jien naf, ġo skola, u isma' hemm bżonn, hemm bżonn isir, ġorru dawn il-banners, hemm bżonn isir hekk, hemm bżonn isir hekk, hemm bżonn… so I was overseeing everything, coordinating with…with…with others….*" Qal ukoll "*imma ovvjament li imbagħad indunajt li isma, this is not only the working hours, imma, anke ħafna iktar, then, then, it clashed a lot with my…with my…with my…with my football u hekk u iddeċidejt li, li nieqaf".*

Is-Sur Bogdanovic ġie mistoqsi jekk kienx mar il-Libja bħala parti minn delegazzjoni tal-Ministeru tal-Edukazzjoni. Irrisponda "*jien qatt mort il-Libja*".

Fl-aħħar tal-laqgħa, is-Sur Bogdanovic ġie mistoqsi jekk kien qatt iffirma kuntratt ta' ingaġġ mas-segretarjat. Is-Sur Bogdanovic wieġeb li ma jiftakarx li ffirma kuntratt, u jaf biss illi kien ġie avviċinat biex jifforma parti mis-segretarjat. Qal ukoll illi kien iffirma xi formoli, li ma jiftakarx x'kienu eżatt. Fi kwalunkwe każ, il-proċess waqaf meta hu kiteb ittra għaliex ma kienx interessat li ikompli f'dik il-kariga. Huwa ċċara li din ma kinitx ittra ta' riżenja mill-kariga peress illi qatt ma ffirma kuntratt.

Ir-Rapport dwar l-Iskola Nazzjonali tal-Isport

Mistoqsi jekk id-deċiżjoni tiegħu ġiet qabel ma nqalgħet il-kwistjoni tal-kuntratt suġġett tal-ilment, is-Sur Bogdanovic qal illi d-deċiżjoni li jieqaf mix-xogħol tas-segretarjat ġie wara li sar jaf bir-rapport li kien intiż isir dwar l-Iskola Nazzjonali tal-Isport:

> *"Le, National Sports School ġara, ġara qabel, fis-sens jiena ġejt avviċinat minn, minn Paul Debattista, Dr Paul Debattista, qalli 'Dan, isma', qalli. 'Aħna nixtiequ nagħmlu erm…daqsxejn ta' review fuq l-Iskola Nazzjonali tal-Isports, u, u inti ġejt skont skont il-lista li rajna, we s… we deem you fit bħala, bħala persuna li, illi tagħmel dan it-tip ta' xogħol.' Għidtlu, għidtlu 'imma xi tridu eżatt?' Qalli 'we just want fresh eyes.' Qalli 'hemm ħafna nies li huma involuti hemm, u u they've been there for, for ages u ħafna nies li kien involuti fl-Iskola Nazzjonali tal-Isport, we want someone with fresh eyes, with your, with your knowledge bħala athlete, għax fl-aħħar mill-aħħar Skola Nazzjonali tal-Isport, we need to produce athletes.'"*

Aċċetta l-kariga: *"Għidtilhom orrajt, għidtilhom mhux problema, għidtilhom I will, I will gladly do it, u u bdejt, u insomma hekk bdiet…he..hekk bdiet il-… il-ħaġa, u ovvjament tajt rapport, li ovvjament ma ġiex k…mhux mhux rapport komplut għax kien baqa' ħafna x'isir, li sar, imma ovvjament ġie, ġie mwaqqaf u, unfortunately".*

Mistoqsi meta kien beda x-xogħol fuq dan ir-rapport, is-Sur Bogdanovic qal *"kont, eżatt id-data ma nafx imma it was, it was around the beginning…third week, second week, third week* […] *li kemm ilna hemmhekk, kemm kont ilni hemm. Ma nafx eżatt id-data eżatt imma, ma nistax niftakar id-dati*". Mistoqsi jekk kienx beda dan il-proġett f'Jannar tas-sena 2021, qal "*ma nistax niftakar".* Mistoqsi jekk kienx beda wara l-ewwel tas-sena, qal *"dak ehe, dak iż-żminijiet kien iva. Ma nistax niftakar eżatt id-data meta imma, naf il-proċess kif sar, x'għamilt, x'għamilna u…imma d-dati…simply I'm not good with dates ħa ngħidu hekk*".

Is-Sur Bogdanovic ġie mistoqsi ukoll jekk kien qatt kiteb rapport bħal dan qabel. F'dan ir-rigward, irrisponda: "*jiena, le, għamilt ħafna, ħafna rapporti li huma based on scouting, anke l-Ingilterra għamilt ħafna…*[interruzzjoni] *scouting, scouting on teams, għax jiena għamilt erba' courses l-Ingilterra, that include scouting, u u rapport minnhom kien, kien 360 pages, kont għamiltu, iġġifieri for me, doing a report it's it's…on those subjects, it's quite easy, iġġifieri, jiena għamilt rapport fuq scouting fuq fuq, scouting ta' club in general, from, from the basics up to the top how, how they operate, how they do what they do, però I'm very familiar with those, those kind of things, in sports, and, it comes natural to me. Iġġifieri jiena, I know what it takes to, to, to become an athlete, and it's quite simple. Iġġifieri, a lot of common sense, a lot of cooperation u…ifhimni, jiena, it was, it was quite, quite easy for me to do it and simple to be honest".*

Il-mistoqsijiet daru fuq il-kontenut tar-rapport.

i. <u>Rakkomandazzjonijiet fir-rapport ippreżentat</u>

Is-Sur Bogdanovic qal is-segwenti fuq ir-rapport u r-rakommandazzjonijiet li hemm fl-istess rapport:

- *"Waħda mir-recommendations li tajt hija, which, jiena I…I see it as a common sense. Inti għandek is-swimmers, waterpolo players, erm, dawn kollha, rhythmic gymnasts fl-ilma, these are all kids that wake up at 5 o'clock in the morning to go train, two hours of training, so basically they don't sleep, drive, to the school, spend a whole day in school, go back and train, these kids will never make it because the first thing that athlete needs is rest, rest, sleep, nutrition. Issa waħda mir-recommendations li tajt jiena fuq, fuq waħda minn ħafna recommendations, li why are we wasting children's rest time when we can just transfer the kids to their base, which is swimming? Pixxina Nazzjonali tal-isports hemm halls erm, meta kont, kelli laqgħa mas-Sur Joe Caruana Curran, erm, waq…fuq dan ir-rapport għidtlu isma, are there any halls available? Qalli iva mela. So why don't we use…"*

- *"So we transfer those kids from the National School of Sports bħala, bħala study, and we put them there, we create a hall, a a class, classroom where, they can, hemm nutrition, where they can eat, study and train [Kummissarju: Dak qed tassumi li għandek klassi waħda jew tnejn jew tlieta, imma għandek age groups differenti] Ifhimni, aħna, aħna, aħna ħdimnihom skont in-number ta', in-numru ta' athletes li huma fil-…fl-iSkola Nazzjonali tal-Isports, bħala swimmers. So we worked like that. Aħna ma assumejniex li isma, din hija skola normali u għandek ma nafx il-kemm student."*

- *"Dik, dik waħda minn…mir-recommendations li tajt, and automatically, by doing that you free space for other sports that can be in the, in the school u jżidu n-numru ta' tfal".*

- Mistoqsi dwar rakkomandazzjoni li jkun hemm campus, illi tidher fir-rapport, is-Sur Bogdanovic qal: "*ara inti għandek l-Iskola Nazzjonali tal-Isports.* [Kummissarju: Skola fiżika, bini?] *Bini, bini, bini eżatt, issa, ħa, ħa nġibu, mhux ħa nagħmlu the straight numbers, nagħmlu ten, għaxar studenti, mela inti għandek għaxar studenti hawn, li dawn ma jistgħux jittrenjaw hawn, so they need to work up early bla bla bla ma nafx xiex, so, we take three of them of the ten and we put them in the...in the…fil-pixxina nazzjonali. Tkun bħala, bħala, bħala branch tal-Iskola Nazzjonali tal-Isport, xorta Skola Nazzjonali tal-Isport iġġifieri ma jinbidel xejn imma minflok jirrapportaw fl-Iskola Nazzjonali tal-Isport bħala binja, jirrappurtaw fil-binja tal-pixxina".* Mistoqsi kemm ikun hemm studenti fl-Iskola Nazzjonali tal-Isport, irrisponda "*bl-…bl-amment eżatt ma nafx kemm hemm, kemm hemm, kemm hemm studenti imma…"*

Fir-rigward tal-Iskola Nazzjonali tal-Isports, peress li l-maġġoranza tal-istudenti jagħmlu football, aquatics, u athletics, mistoqsi jekk dawn jitilqu fiżikament mill-iskola x'jibqa', is-Sur Bogdanovic irrisponda li jibqgħu studenti ta' dixxiplini sportivi oħra (tennis, volleyball, basketball, bowling, triathlon, martial arts). Minkejja li m'hemmx ħafna studenti f'dawn id-

dixxiplini, is-Sur Bogdanovic qal: "*that is one of the things why I wanted, why I recommended that we do that, because, aħna għandna, martial arts, ħames eżempju, ħames studenti. Issa, why do we choose five students? Why because the number we cannot accommodate more, allura so we are limited, with numbers għax ma nistgħux indaħħlu iktar hemm. So by doing that kind of, of exercise you free a lot of spaces bħala binja, bħala classrooms, which you can from five you make them ten*".

Mistoqsi jekk l-idea kienet li d-dixxiplini popolari (football, aquatic, athletics) jiġu esternalizzati b'mod permanenti, is-Sur Bogdanovic irrisponda "*football no, it's good because there's a pitch next, next door so it's just across the road and you have the football pitch, but you have the athletics, you have the swimming. Athletics they cannot train there. Basically they cannot, there is no facilities for them to train there, so another recommendation was, similar thing to to to, to do with the swimming, we transfer the athletics to Marsa, in the, in the new Marsa complex that they're going to, to build or renew or whatever*". Mistoqsi jekk dan kienx ser ikun pjan sostenibbli fuq żmien twil biex jiddaħħlu l-istudenti, is-Sur Bogdanovic qal "*yes yes because all you need is, the same teachers that report to this block is reporting to this block so yes, and that frees a lot of space in that, in that particular school*".

Mistoqsi jekk kien indika fir-rapport, is-sorsi u l-bażi tar-rakkomandazzjonijiet li ta[1], is-Sur Bogdanovic stqarr "*le jiena, dawk il-…dawk ir-rakkomandazzjonijiet kollha dawk they're all mine iġġifieri jiena, qatt ma tkellimt ma ħadd u qatt ma staqsejt lil ħadd isma x'taħseb hekk hekk u hekk, these were all from my own experience u mill-affarijiet li rajt barra minn hawn, fis-sens jiena, erm, kont involut ħafna fl-Università ta' Sheffield meta kont ma' Sheffield United, erm, u forsi taf għax naħseb issewgi l-football, li players barra minn hawn ikollhom ħafna community work, ikollhom community work allura jibagħtuna per eżempju ġo din l-iskola, jiena llum hawn inti u morna ġo din l-iskola and we play with kids, we, we talk about our life, how we do it, u waħda minn dawn kienet l-Università ta' Sheffield, erm l-isports university. Allura rajt kif jaħdmu hemm u waħda mill-affarijiet li jagħmlu hemm huma li the facilities that they don't have, they report on the, on the national swimming pool or or somewhere else allura ftakar f'dik il-ħaġa għidt isma, so if they are doing it and they are very successful we're talking Olympians, li ħarġu minn hemm, ħażina li nużaw aħna u skantajt kif għadha ma, ma, ma ħareġ biha din l-idea għax jiena, this is basic common sense* [interuzzjoni] *li minn minn minn…mill-binja imorru ġo binja oħra and they study, eat, drink and train over there*".[2]

Mistoqsi dwar artiklu li deher fil-gazzetta[3] The Malta Independent[4] (liema artiklu ġie miktub fl-2012 u huwa kkwotat fit-tul fir-rapport) is-Sur Bogdanovic għall-bidu fehem illi din kienet riferenza għal rapport rilatat mal-problemi fiż-żwieġ tiegħu. Wara spjegazzjoni illi l-mistoqsija kienet rilatata ma' artiklu dwar l-Iskola Nazzjonali tal-Isports, li hu kkwota minnu fir-rapport, is-Sur Bogdanovic qal "*bħalissa ma niftakarx, ma nistax niftakar, ma niftakarx bħalissa. Naf li, naf li, iva naf li, li kien hemm li…iva le le, le nifta…roughly niftakar x'kien il-…il-…l-…l-artiklu,*

[1] 40:05
[2] 40:17
[3] 42:19
[4] Referenza fuq is-sit elettroniku tal-istess gazzetta

kien fuq fuq fuq in-nuqqas ta', ta' suċċess li għandna… insomma affarijiet, kien irqiq, ma nafx, ma nafx eżatt imma naf li , naf li, iva kien hemm, kien hemm erm, kien hemm ċertu ċertu…"

Mistoqsi dwar in-numri, jekk inbidlux minn dak iż-żmien 'l hawn, is-Sur Bogdanovic wieġeb "*fuq dak, fuq dawk in-numri kien aħa, aħa. Fuq in-numri ta' kemm, kemm, kemm ħarġu successful athletes u affarijiet hekk kien hemm, bħalissa qed niftakar*".

Meta reġa' ġie enfasizzat illi dan l-artiklu inkiteb fl-2012, u ċioe meta kienet ser tibda l-Iskola Nazzjonali tal-Isport, is-Sur Bogdanovic qal "*infatti jiena anke jiena rajtha daqxejn…erm…eżaġerata, imma I used it bħala, bħala, bħala, eżempju għax ovvjament illum il-ġurnata jekk tara il-…il-…ir-rifless ta' dak ir-rapport, u llum, ma tantx imxejna 'l quddiem ħa ngħiduha kif inhi*."

Mistoqsi kemm ilha miftuħa l-Iskola Nazzjonali tal-Isport, is-Sur Bogdanovic wieġeb "*Għandi jkun, 20—and, mhiniex ċert, '11, '10? Għax jien kont ġejt avviċinat, kont nilgħab barra dakinhar, kont ġejt lura mill-Ingilterra u kienet qed tinfetaħ l-Iskola Nazzjonali tal-Isport dakinhar, għandi jkun '12, '13, u kont ġejt avviċinat biex nifforma parti mill-Iskola Nazzjonali tal-Isport, niftakar dakinhar, kien ċempilli Joe Micallef, li kien involut fiha bħala, bħala logistics…*"

Mistoqsi biex jispjega x'inhu r-Radtke Report, jew jekk kien qatt rah dan ir-rapport, is-Sur Bogdanovic wieġeb "*bħalissa ma niftakarx bħalissa, Radtke, ma nistax niftakar*". Mistoqsi jekk kien qatt ra rapport maħruġ mill-OFSTED[5], is-Sur Bogdanovic wieġeb "*rajt kollox imma bħalissa ismijiet mhux qed niftakar*". Mistoqsi jekk ra artiklu miktub minn Lavallee[6], is-Sur Bogdanovic ma setax jiftakar. Ir-rapport jirreferi għal kull wieħed minn dawn id-dokumenti.

Is-Sur Bogdanovic ġie mistoqsi jekk tkellimx ma' studenti li kienu marru l-Iskola Nazzjonali tal-Isports. Ikkonferma illi kellimhom hu waħdu waqt telefonati, mhux laqgħat.

Il-mistoqsijiet daru fuq il-kontenut tar-rapport fejn iddiskuta l-element akkademiku u t-timetable għall-istudenti kif propost fir-rapport. Is-Sur Bogdanovic ġie mistoqsi jekk iħossu kompetenti, f'dan il-qasam li jikkonċerna s-suġġetti akkademiċi, li jissuġġerixxi liema suġġetti għandhom ikunu inklużi f'programm akkademiku. Hu rrisponda *"lanqas xejn, no jiena, jiena, jiena li, l-uniku rakkomandazzjoni…fis-sens, l-unika opinjoni li għandi fuqdha dik hi li skola nazzjonali tal-isports, għandha isem, hija skola nazzjonali tal-isports. So we should tackle more the sport part rather than than than, concentrating on the academics bħala overall, erm, overall view of of of, jew modus of operandi kif trid tgħidilha…"*

Id-diskussjoni kompliet fuq dan il-punt:

> ***Kummissarju***: *"Imma, meta qed tgħid li l-istudenti in Year 7 and Year 8 have a choice of which two languages they want to study. In Year 9 students have to choose two additional subjects apart from the core subjects. When it comes to languages Italian remains the most chosen language. Dan, minn fejn ġibtu din l-informazzjoni u kif, kif titfagħha bħala rakkomandazzjoni? Issa apparti li imbagħad, ma tinkludihiex fit-*

[5] 45:30
[6] 45:42

timetable, għax dawk huma żewġ affarijiet differenti, imma possibbli tħossok kompetenti li tagħmel dawn it-tip ta' rakkomandazzjonijiet?"

> ***Bogdanovic:*** *"Ara jiena…"*

> ***Kummissarju**: "Jew tahomlok ħaddieħor? Dik hija d-domanda ta voldieri."*

> ***Bogdanovic**: "Le ħadd ma tahomli. Jiena għalhekk ir-rakkomandazzjonijiet li għamilt huma basically, on what I went through, what I experienced during all these years."*

> ***Kummissarju**: "Sorry mhux qed nisma'."*

> ***Bogdanovic**: Ir-rakkomandazzjonijiet li tajt huma l-esperjenza li għaddejt minnha u l-istudji li għamilt barra minn hawn u affarijiet li, li, li I got erm, involved in, iġġifieri dawk huma, imma bħala suġġetti, bħala skola u hekk, jiena mhux, mhux kompetenti li, li ngħid isma' t-tfal iridu jistudjaw dan jew dak, dak mhux jiena ovvjament."*

Mistoqsi dwar l-istatistika tal-istudenti, u s-suġġetti li jistudjaw, u min fejn ġiet din l-informazzjoni:

> ***Bogdanovic**: "Dik kienet, konna qed nitkellmu, nitkellmu mas-studenti u konna qed nitkellmu mat-teachers, konna qed nitkellmu anke, il-…il-…statistics li kien bagħatli s-Sur Robert Magro bħala, bħala erm, bħala l-Kap tal-Iskola ovvjament aħna rajna…"*

> ***Kummissarju**: "Voldieri dawn il-graphs, Robert Magro tahomlok?"*

> ***Bogdanovic**: "Erm, naħseb Robert Magro bagħtomli naħseb."*

> ***Kummissarju**: "Voldieri mhux inti għamilthom il-graphs?"*

> ***Bogdanovic**: "Le il-graphs jien għamilthom. Il-graphs kollha għamilt jien. Il-…il-…il-…ir-riżultati kien bagħatomli hu fis-sens isma', għandna 50 student eżempju u daqshekk għażlu t-Taljan, daqshekk għażlu l-Ingliż, and then we…jiena ppruvajt nara fejn kien, fejn kienu, l-…fejn kien l-…il-…in-nuqqas, nuqqasijiet, fis-sens fejn kien, hemm l-overload, fejn kienet inqas, what do we need…"*

Mistoqsi jekk kellu jħalli spazju għall-elementi akkademiċi fir-rapport, is-Sur Bogdanovic wieġeb: "*ifhimni, huwa, il-parti tiegħi kienet just to see how we can improve in making athletes issa…"*.[7] Is-Sur Bogdanovic ġie mistoqsi direttament jekk għamel ix-xogħol kollu, inkluż diversi riferenzi għas-suġġetti akkademiċi, waħdu, għaliex ma setax ikun li għamlu kollu hu. Is-Sur Bogdanovic irrisponda: "*jista' jkun*".

Is-Sur Bogdanovic stqarr illi kien hu li kiteb ir-rapport. Ikkonfrontat bil-fatt li ma seta' jirrispondi għall-ebda mistoqsija dwar ir-rapport, is-Sur Bogdanovic qal: *"ara jien, ismijiet, ekk tgħidli isma, dak, dak u dak, ma nafx, imma inti jekk titfa' karti quddiemi, I will, I will explain*

[7] 51:32

to you exactly what, what we're talking about. Imma ismijiet jiena, it-titoli ta' dawn l-affarijiet, ma…mhinix...ma nif...ma tantx għandi memorja tajba fuq hekk".

Mistoqsi jekk ir-rakkomandazzjonijiet tiegħu huma bbażati fuq l-esperjenzi u analiżi tiegħu u mhux fuq ir-riċerka inkluża fir-rapport kif ippreżentat, is-Sur Bogdanovic wieġeb:

> "*ara the recommendations that I, I, I put, basically the report isn't complete. I had other things to put on, more research to do, obviously, I couldn't do...but the recommendations were done on a, erm, kif ħa naqbad…common sense thing li isma' this is what needs to be done for us to improve. I started from the basics of how can we improve, more hours by practising the sports, that is a must and more hours to rest. So I started from that basics and started doing the, the, the research, isma how much do they sleep, so why, how much do they travel, what is the time of travel from point A to point B, so when you start adding all those things up it becomes that kids spend a lot of hours travelling when they could be training those hours, a lot of hours resting, not resting, you don't make it, so konna ħdim...kont ħdimt fuq that kind of approach. I am an athlete, jiena mhinix avukat, miniex accountant, miniex…I just see the sports part and I reason as an athlete so how can I improve this person to do what I did. And I just start from that base and isma', let's, this has to be done, at least to give them a chance to do it, to succeed…"*

Fir-rigward tal-laqgħat li saru mal-istudenti tal-Iskola Nazzjonali tal-Isport, is-Sur Bogdanoviċ spjega illi l-għażla tal-istudenti għall-intervisti ma saritx min-naħa tiegħu: *"aħna ma għażilnihomx, aħna tlabna laqgħa ma' ma' ma', studenti minn kull klassi, u imbagħad min ġie quddiemna ġie quddiemna, iġġifieri aħna ma, fis-sens jiena ma tlabtx iva ġibli 'l Andre u 'l Michael for example, jiena kont hemm u fetħu l-bieb u daħlu dawn iż-żewġ studenti u imbagħad tkellimna magħhom, daħlu tnejn oħra, ifhimni ma konniex nafu min kienu…"* Mistoqsi dwar il-perjodu meta saru dawn il-laqgħat, is-Sur Bogdanovic qal li ma jistax jiftakar.

ii. <u>Proċess ta' abbozzar tar-rapport</u>

Is-Sur Bogdanovic ġie mistoqsi jekk xi ħadd mill-Ministeru għenu b'xi mod fl-ippreparar ta' dan ir-rapport.[8] Stqarr *"no, absolutely not, jiena, jiena ara kull ma, kull ma kien jiġri kont nagħmel ir-rapport jien, kont is-studji ovvjament, l-unika affarijiet li kien hemm, Dr Paul Debattista, erm, kien jiġi miegħi fl-Iskola Nazzjonali tal-Isport, meta konna nagħmlu l-interviews one on one fis-sens face to face, ma' student għax kont, kont għażilt li nagħmel dat-tip ta' xogħol, I wanted their feedback u what they want from from from from the school, what is their aim, x'iridu minnu dan…"*

Mistoqsi jekk kien hu li għamel ir-riċerka għar-rapport, is-Sur Bogdanovic qal: "*ir-research għamiltu jien, erm, u imbagħad ovvjament kien hemm, kien hemm, kont nirrapporta ma' Dr Paul Debattista u kont ninfurmah, ngħidlu isma', illum mort hemm, illum għamilt hekk, u kien hemm drabi li hu ġie miegħi bħalma għidtlek, fl-Iskola Nazzjonali tal-Isport biex niltaqgħu mat-teachers*".

---
[8] 29:12

Mistoqsi jekk ta r-rapport lil Dr Paul Debattista bħala kopja stampata (hard copy), is-Sur Bogdanovic qal *"erm, karta, karta, kont ipprintjajt kollox jien, ktibt u dan u ipprintjajtu għandi jkun xi 80, 80 xi ħaġa pages kien hemm".* Mistoqsi jekk kellu kopja diġitali tar-rapport, is-Sur Bogdanovic qal: *"No no".* Mistoqsi għalfejn m'għandux kopja diġitali, s-Sur Bogdanovic irrisponda: *"Jiena old school I prefer to, to see everything in front of me"*. Spjega illi *"kont nikteb kollox fuq il-laptop u kont nitfa' fuq il-USB. Jien hekk naħdem, jiena hekk...I put everything on the USB and then the USB, ipprintjajt kollox".*

Mistoqsi jekk dan il-USB kien għadu fil-pussess tiegħu, is-Sur Bogdanovic qal "*m'għandix idea, x'imkien, x'imkien id-dar forsi qiegħed*". Is-Sur Bogdanovic ġie mistoqsi biex jippreżenta dak il-USB u kkommetta ruħu kif ġej: "*nipprova nfittxu, insibu nibgħatulkom*".

Is-Sur Bogdanovic spjega wkoll li kien iltaqa' ma' Dr Dawn Aquilina, akkademiku li taħdem mal-Malta Football Association: *"kont tkellimt magħha, konna ltqajna l-MFA, tkellimna ukoll, u u rajt l-istudju tagħha fuq il-...erm, fuq il-… li għamlet it-teżi fuq, fuq il-universitajiet, fuq il-…fuq l-affarijiet li ħadmet hi insomma u, and I took, I took a lot of things from from from that part as well because it was it was it was, erm, on the same lines li.. kif kont naħseb jien*".

Fir-rigward ta' riċerka u rapporti li saru qabel fuq l-Iskola Nazzjonali tal-Isport, issemma illi l-unika rapport li kien sar kien meta l-Iskola Nazzjonali infetħet. Mistoqsi fuq dan ir-rapport jew studju li sar meta bdiet l-iskola, is-Sur Bogdanovic qal li ma rahx. Irrisponda "*I wanted to start, ma nafx, qas staqsejt x'hemm u x'm'hemmx, għax jiena hekk nemmen, I wanted to see myself"*. Mistoqsi jekk ħax informazzjoni minn dan ir-rapport, is-Sur Bogdanovic qal le. Is-Sur Bogdanovic qal li ħadem fuq persentaġġi u hard copies ta' dokumenti u booklets li irċieva mill-Iskola Nazzjonali tal-Isports. Ikkonferma illi ma rax rapport tal-istess tip li kiteb hu. Is-Sur Bogdanovic qali li kien irċieva emails mill-Kap tal-Iskola Nazzjonali tal-Isports, is-Sur Robert Magro. Stqarr illi talbu informazzjoni dwar l-Iskola Nazzjonali tal-Isport:

> "*kif saru affarijiet qabel, coaches, ovvjament, l-affarijiet kollha li, li kien hemm fl-Iskola Nazzjonali tal-Isport għax I needed it for the, for the research u hu kien ovvjament ġentili biżżejjed li bagħatli, bagħatli l-affarijiet li tlabtu u bħalma għidtlek, kien hemm ħafna, erm, ma nafx jekk nistax insejjaħlu booklet jew jew, ma nafx kif ħa naqbad ngħidlu, imma ħafna pages ta' ta' affarijiet ta' isma' hemm daqshekk tfal, hemm daqshekk dak, dawk huma l-coaches, il-percentages, l-age groups, daqshekk studenti, dawk ħarġu, dawn marru hemm, dawn dawn saru plejers professjonali, insomma, dawn, dawn l-affarijiet kollha*".

Mistoqsi jekk seta' jifforwardja din l-informazzjoni li rċieva bl-email, is-Sur Bogdanovic qal: "*Ma nistax għax jiena l-email ingħalaqli kollox hu",* b'riferenza għall-indirizz/kont tal-email tal-gvern li kellu.

Mistoqsi dwar l-inklużjoni ta' Ċipru fit-terms of reference tal-istudju dwar l-Iskola Nazzjonali tal-Isport, is-Sur Bogdanovic stqarr illi kienet l-għażla tiegħu li studju fuq Ċipru jkun inkluż fir-rapport, peress illi l-popolazzjoni tiegħu huwa simili ta' dik ta' Malta, u hu kien ra l-bidla fil-faċilitajiet sportivi u atletiċi li saru f'dak il-pajjiż. Ikkonferma diversi drabi illi l-idea li Ċipru ikun inkluż fir-rapport kienet tiegħu. Mistoqsi jekk jaf kemm-il darba fil-fatt Ċipru jissemma' fir-rapport, is-Sur Bogdanovic qal: *"jiena naf li sar, naf li ktibt Ċipru,*

naf li semmejtu Ċipru, naf li semmejtu" u "*…naf li semmejt Ċipru, miljun darba semmejt Ċipru, issa ktibtux fir-rapport jew le ma nistax niftakar, dak kollox kien bl-għaġla, l-printer…".*

Is-Sur Bogdanovic stqarr lili jiftakar illi kellu diversi diskussjonijiet rigward Ċipru, anke ma' kapijiet tal-iskola, studenti u ġenituri. Qal ukoll illi kellu diskussjonijiet ma' nies minn Ċipru biex jorganizza żjara u jmur jara s-sistema tagħhom, u dan kien ser ikun it-tieni parti tar-rapport. Stqarr illi l-verżjoni tar-rapport li hu ppreżenta kien ilu għandu, u li kulma għamel meta ġie mitlub jippreżenta l-abbozz tar-rapport hu li ħa l-USB drive li fuqu kien hemm ix-xogħol kollu tiegħu u ipprintjah. Qal illi huwa possibbli illi ħalla ċerti affarijiet barra mir-rapport peress li ġie sottomess bl-għaġġla.

Mistoqsi dwar l-użu ta' kliem fil-plural ("*konna qed nitkellmu mal-istudenti*" eċċ) meta kien qed jitkellem dwar il-proċess u r-riċerka li kien għamel fuq l-Iskola Nazzjonali tal-Isport, is-Sur Bogdanovic qal "*ifhimni meta konna, meta kont qed nagħmel dan it-tip ta' xogħol, ovvjament imbagħad kont nirra…ngħid isma' Paul jien għamilt hekk illum, is-Sur Debattista, Paul, jien għamilt hekk illum. Konna qed nitkellmu għaliex ta, ara x'taħseb u hekk, it wasn't a formal discussion fis-sens*." Ikkonferma li kien akkumpanjat mis-Sur Debattista meta mar l-Iskola Nazzjonali tal-Isport għaliex ma setax jintervista tfal waħdu minħabba protokolli.

iii. <u>Formatting u preżentazzjoni tar-rapport</u>

Is-Sur Bogdanovic intwera kopja tar-rapport li kien ġie ppreżentat lill-Kummissarju għall-Istandards minn xhud ieħor. Is-Sur Bogdanovic qal illi kien l-istess verżjoni tar-rapport li hu kien ippreżenta lill-Ministeru meta l-kuntratt ta' servizz ġie tterminat.[9] Qal ukoll li r-rapport kien għadu abbozz u ma kienx komplut. Mistoqsi dwar ir-rapport, is-Sur Bogdanovic qal li elementi tar-rapport, per eżempju l-paġna ta' quddiem, tlestew peress illi ġie infurmat illi l-kuntratt ġie terminat kmieni u kellu jissottometti x-xogħol komplut. Mistoqsi jekk jaf kif għamel il-paġna ta' quddiem tar-rapport is-Sur Bogdanovic qal "*u żgur li naf kif nagħmel dawn l-affarijiet, mhux kif tiddownloadja google, u u edit to Word u u…mhux you just go on Word you can go on Word, you can go on on on Powerpoint, you can go on many things and do those things.*" Mistoqsi jekk dan kien il-metodu li uża, is-Sur Bogdanovic wieġeb: *"Naħseb Word kien, ma nistax niftakar eżatt imma…kont downloadjajt ċerti pages u…"*

Meta ġie mistoqsi dwar ix-xogħol ippreżentat, u kif ir-rapport ġie ppreżentat bħala abbozz meta l-formatting, il-paġna ta' quddiem u r-rakkomandazzjonijiet kienu lesti (meta hu stqarr illi kien għad fadal xogħol x'isir), is-Sur Bogdanovic qal "*għax dawk huma rakkomandazzjonijiet li jien stajt tajt wara one week's of work, because they were plain and simple. Iġġifieri rakkomandazzjonijiet, jiena stajt tajthom, after two, three visits in the school…"*

Is-Sur Bogdanovic kompla jgħid *"infatti dak huwa, dak huwa r-raġuni l…, huwa mhux komplut. Jiena ma kontx ħa nagħti rakkomandazzjonijiet dak il-ħin, jiena rakkomandazzjoni I left them for the last, imma ovvjament qaluli isma', agħlaq ir-rapport kif inhu. Ħeqq jiena qbadt u ktibt…għidtilhom ir-rakkomandazzjonijiet."*

---

[9] 55:51

iv. Għajnuna fix-xogħol rilatat mar-rapport

Is-Sur Bogdanovic ġie mfakkar illi hemm allegazzjonijiet li hu ma kitibx ir-rapport jew li ħafna mix-xogħol ma ġiex magħmul minnu. F'dan ir-rigward is-Sur Bogdanovic qal "*ara jiena jiena jiena, jien, jiena naf ara, jiena naf, jiena ma nafx x'nista', x'nista' ngħidlek x'jikkonvinċik imma jiena naf x'għamilt u r-rapport għamiltu jien, is-sigħat għamilthom jien u u, u mhux sigħat, sigħat qed nitkellmu three working hours, jiena ġieli kont nibqa' sal-erbgħa ta' filgħodu, naħseb u nara u x'nista' nagħmel u, u u nara u nara kif jaħdmu barra u u, u nikkuntattja nies minn barra, ġo universitajiet barra*".

Mistoqsi jekk kien irċieva feedback min-naħa tal-Ministeru fil-kors tal-abbozzar tar-rapport, is-Sur Bogdanovic qal "*lanqas xejn, jiena, jiena qaluli isma', qaluli l-kuntratt tiegħek ġie imwaqqaf, u please, erm, submit the work done. Jiena qbadt, printjajt, ħallejtu fuq id-desk ta', tal-uffiċċju għal Għawdex, ġabruh, ma nafx x'ġara, ma nafx min ħadu ma nafx għand min mar. Ifhimni r-rapport huwa mhux komplut għax għandi biżibilju xogħol ieħor fejn saru u…u, u laqgħat ma' nies, li huma involuti fl-isports clubs, sports clubs, sports associations, u ovvjament jiena ma stajtx inkompli.*"

Stqarr ukoll illi x-xogħol fuq dan ir-rapport issa waqaf:

"Allura kelli kelli, jiena r-rakkomandazzjonijiet diġà kien biċċa kbira clear to me, allura imbagħad ħa ntihom rapport hekk, without anything of what I'm honestly thinking, allura qbadt għamilt dawk ir-rakkomandazzjonijiet li jiena I deemed fit for for for the purpose, u tfajthom hemm u jiena, kieku kien… kieku tħallejt inkompli kien, kien ikun naqa differenti imma…"

Dokumenti Sekondarji[10]

Mistoqsi dwar il-kwalifiċi li ġew ippreżentati mas-CV tiegħu, is-Sur Bogdanovic ikkonferma illi kkwalifika bil-liċenzji A, B u Ċ tal-UEFA wara li għamel korsijiet organizzati mill-MFA. Mistoqsi dwar is-CV tiegħu, u n-nuqqas ta' riferenza għall-iktar xogħol rilevanti li s-Sur Bogdanovic stqarr li kien għamel mal-Iskola Sport u Sports on the Move, is Sur Bogdanovic qal: "*Ifhimni jiena dak kien xogħoli*". Fil-kuntest tal-esperjenza tiegħu, ġie mistoqsi għaliex esperjenza bħax-xogħol li għamel mal-Iskola Sport u f'inizzjattivi oħra rilevanti ma jidhrux fis-CV, u kien ibbażat biss fuq l-esperjenza li kellu ma' diversi klabbs tal-football. Is-Sur Bogdanovic irrisponda "*ara jiena kont in charge of coaching, organising events fl-Iskola…haw fil-Sports Complex iġġifieri dak, dak kien xogħoli hemmhekk, u anke coaching jiena kont nikkowċja nurseries qabel* […] *ifhimni, I know, in this, in this, in this world I mean in this kind of, of job, I know what I'm doing*".

Xogħol normali fil-Ministeru tal-Edukazzjoni

Is-Sur Bogdanovic stqarr illi matul il-perjodu fejn kien qed jikteb ir-rapport dwar l-Iskola Nazzjonali tal-Isports, baqa' għaddej bix-xogħol normali tiegħu bħala ħaddiem tal-Community Work Scheme. Ikkonferma ukoll li f'dan il-perjodu kien qed jaħdem fl-uffiċċju tal-Ministeru għall-Edukazzjoni f'Għawdex, minkejja l-fatt li ma baqax interessat fix-xogħol tas-segretarjat.

[10] 35:59

Mistoqsi x'kien ix-xogħol li kien jagħmel bħala ħaddiem tal-Community Work Scheme assenjat mal-Ministeru tal-Edukazzjoni f'Għawdex, is-Sur Bogdanovic qal "*meta jkun hemm il-bżonn photocopies, niġbor il-photocopies, nagħmel il-photocopies, inwassal 'il dak imur jagħmel il-…jiġbor x'imkien, għandu laqgħa, kollox kont nagħmel*". Ġie mistoqsi ukoll dwar il-fatt illi persuna li kienet kapaċi tikteb rapport bħalma hu r-rapport fuq l-NSS kienet assenjata biex tagħmel photocopies. Is-Sur Bogdanovic irrisponda: *"Naf u anke jien inħossni stramb, nagħmel dak ix-xogħol, imma fis-sens, imma, dak huwa xogħoli, I don't have any other, other options".*

Is-Sur Bogdanovic kompla jispjega x-xogħol normali tiegħu: "*hemm hemm hemm ċerti nies mill-uffiċċju per eżempju għandhom meeting Ministeru għal Għawdex, hemmhekk parking ma tistax issib, allura jitfagħni, ah jien inwasslu. Nistennieh, ma ġara…jiena dak dak. Ikun hemm event fuq l-iskejjel, meta jkun hemm eżempju press conferences ta'… tal-Ministru u hemm bżonn inġorru xi affarijiet u hekk, jiena nwassal n-nies, niġbor in-nies, inwassal l-affarijiet, u affarijiet hekk nagħmel, u fuq fuq dak li li jekk jaħsbux jiena kapaċi jew le ifhimni, jiena iddeċidejt li mhux ħa, mhux ħa nkompli f'dik il-ħaġa iġġifieri, that was my decision, jiena, fis-sens, it was not my line of work, jekk xi ħadd jiġi jgħidli isma' tridx tkun parti minn xi ħaġa, xi ħaġa rilatata mal-isport, ngħidlu iva imma, affarijiet oħra bħal dak jiena it's not my, it's not my, my, my world fis-sens. Inkun qed nigdeb jekk ngħid I want to do it. I don't*".

L-allegazzjoni ta' relazzjoni mal-Ministru Caruana

Is-Sur Bogdanovic ġie mfakkar illi l-bażi ta' dan l-ilment hija l-allegazzjoni illi hu għandu relazzjoni mal-Ministru Justyne Caruana, u allura illi ngħata l-kuntratt ta' servizz minħabba din ir-raġuni. Mistoqsi direttament dwar ir-relazzjoni tiegħu mal-Ministru, s-Sur Bogdanovic stqarr is-segwenti: *"ara, fil-perjodu meta ngħatajt dak il…dak il-, dak l-inkarigu, u meta ġejt offrut biex nifforma parti mill-…mit-team ta' Justyne Caruana, jiena ma kelli l-ebda relazzjoni magħha, ħlief ta' ħbiberija u ta' rispett li dejjem kien hemm. Iġġifieri jiena, erm, allegazzjonijiet dawk huma, allegazzjonijiet. Iġġifieri jiena, jiena u naf minn fejn ġejjin l-allegazzjonijiet, erm, u ħa, ħa ngħidilkom din għax, jiena qatt ma kont bniedem li indur mal-lewża, jiena dak li naħseb dejjem ngħidu, b'rispett kollu lejn kulħadd iġġifieri I've always respected everyone. Jiena kont dehert fil-gazzetti fuq kawża kontra l-ex mara tiegħi, erm, u, that was a big frame up, a big frame up għax jiena dik il-mara kont għidtilha isma', that things are not working out, we need to split.*" Is-Sur Bogdanovic spjega fit-tul iċ-ċirkostanzi tal-arrest tiegħu ftit snin ilu, l-allegazzjonijiet li kienu dehru fl-gazzetti, l-akkużi kontrih fil-Qorti li ġie liberat minnhom, u s-separazzjoni eventwali minn mal-ex mara tiegħu.

Mistoqsi biex jispjega għalfejn ċaħad li kellu relazzjoni mal-Ministru fil-perjodu meta ingħata l-kuntratt, qal is-segwenti:

***Bogdanovic**:* *"Qatt ma għidt li kien hemm relazzjoni mal-Ministru Caruana jien."*

***Kummissarju**:* *"Le, inti għidt li dak iż-żmien ma kienx hemm."*

***Bogdanovic**:* *"Inti staqsejtni dak il-…meta ġejt ingħatajt dak il-karigu, tal-… ta' dik il- l-NSS."*

Kummissarju: *"U inti laqqajtli żewġ dati f'daqqa, inti meta bdejt tattendi l-Ministeru, u d-data ta' meta ingħatajt l-inkarigu tar-rapport."*

Bogdanovic: *"Eżatt."*

Kummissarju: *"Li hemm xahrejn prattikament differenza."*

Bogdanovic: *"Eżatt."*

Kummissarju: *"Jew xahar u nofs."*

Bogdanovic: *"Ma kellix, ma kelli l-ebda relazzjoni mal-Ministru Caruana."*

Kummissarju: *"Voldieri qed tgħidilna, bil-ġurament, li meta ingħatajt l-inkarigu biex tagħmel ir-rapport fuq l-Iskola Nazzjonali tal-Isport, inti ma kellekx relazzjoni mal-Ministru Caruana."*

Bogdanovic: *"Le ma kellix relazzjoni dakinhar."*

Kummissarju: *"Ħlief ir-relazzjonijiet li inti ddeskrivejthom."*

Bogdanovic: "*Ovvjament ħbiberija, rispett u ppruvajt ngħin bħalma, bħalma nipprova ngħin lil kulħadd."*

Sommarju magħmul minn: Dr Sarah Pace Warrington

Data tal-aħħar reviżjoni: 30 ta' Settembru 2021

Danijel Bogdanovic

30th August 2020

Commissioner for Standards in Public Life

11, St Paul's Street

Valletta

Dear Commissioner

Further to your letter and request, please find the USB I mentioned.

Thank you and kind regards

Yours sincerely

Danijel Bogdanovic

Assessment, review and recommendations for National Sports School

Danijel Bogdanovic

March 2021

Table of contents

1. Executive Summary 5

2. Brief and Methodology 9

3. Introduction 11

4. Meetings with stakeholders and outcomes 21

5. Information Data Gathering and Analyses 27

6. Recommendations 63

7. Annex of documents 71

1. Executive Summary

Since the opening of the “Skola Nazzjonali tal-iSport”, way back during the scholastic year 2012/2013, there has been development within both the sports sector and the academic sector.

This study, commissioned by the Minister for Education, Hon. Justyne Caruana, focused on the assessment of whether the goals which were set when the school was opened, were achieved and came up with the needed improvements for the school to address the needs of the students who will be attending the school in the coming decade.

International scholars emphasized how athletes who follow a dual career pathway, may have a more balanced lifestyle, enhanced employment prospects and enhanced support systems.

Another important factor which emerges from studies, shows that ddespite the commitment to sports schools in many countries, the post-secondary school arrangements for combining sport with academic studies is more limited and this should be looked at to offer such students continuity in their practiced sports so as to have a potential elite athlete. This includes encouraging universities to support elite-level student athletes in post graduate studies.

This report includes extensive sports and academic data about the students, past and present, who attending the Sports School.

To come up with the recommendations, focus groups, questionnaires and one-to-one interviews were carried out with students; Sports School administration; coaching personnel; and Sports Associations.

The outcome of the report can be summarized in the following recommendations:

1. Having a National Sports School administered autonomous from the present Colleges' structure.

2. The construction of a new sports, purpose built, School Campus, sited into a more central area of Malta.

3. The site must have ample grounds to build a "mini sports village".

4. Finding a strategic partner to invest and possibly administer this sports school complex.

5. Considering having an International Sports University, built on this new campus.

6. At least sixty-five percentage points of the entry assessment marks, should be assigned to the sports abilities of the prospective candidate.

7. Every applicant should undergo a one-week trial period before an assessment is given.

8. There should be an option for the student to opt out from the sports school and go to a mainstream school, in the eventuality that the student does not perform.

9. Students attending the sports school, will follow a 7-year course. Thus, students will leave the school at the age of 18.

10. School hours are to be between 08:00 and 16:00 from Monday to Fridays.

11. Students will have to follow a healthy diet and to do so, the school is to provide a healthy breakfast; lunch and a snack before leaving school.

12. Following the school diet and eating at the school canteen facilities, should be a must and not an option.

13. Students will train at the school from Monday to Thursdays and will train with their clubs on Fridays and over the weekend, for the athletes to play the competitive matches.

14. The Sports School should have its own various sports teams, which should participate in various National Associations' competitions.

15. As from the age of 16, the students should also be entitled to the students' maintenance grants/stipends which other students attending the Junior Colleges, are getting.

The implementation of these recommendations should result in having a quantum leap in the standards of our National Sports School, for it to be in a better position to prepare our prospective young students becoming elite athletes.

2. Brief and Methodology

2.1. An Overview of the modus operandi of the “Skola Nazzjonali tal-isport”

2.1.1 Background

The “Skola Nazzjonali tal-isport” welcomed the first students during the scholastic year 2012/2013.

The idea behind the school was to prepare students for a dual career path, so there will be a sense of flexibility and balance between academic subjects and sports. Children attending the school would serve as role models for other children in terms of adopting a physically active and healthy lifestyle.

Over these last nine years of its inception, there has been development within both the sports sector and the academic sector. It is thus the opportune time to assess whether, the goals which were set when the school was opened, were achieved and to come up with the needed improvements for the school to address the needs of the students who will be attending he school in the coming decade.

While we need to motivate and attract more people to be involved in physical activity and sports throughout their life, we need to structure our “Skola Nazzjonali tal-isport” to prepare our young generations, become elite athletes. This can only be achieved by providing the right platform for high-performance individuals.

2.1.2 Terms of Reference

The report, commissioned by the Minister for Education, Hon. Justyne Caruana, had to cover the

following areas:

1. Assess the standards of the present academic and sports curriculum being taught at the school;

2. Evaluate the students' selection criteria in place;

3. Carry out a survey, with past and present students and educators, on their experience at the school;

4. Look into the organisational structure of the school;

5. Compare both the academic and sports curriculum and selection criteria of the school with curricula and selection criteria in place by similar international sports schools – in particular, those operating in the United Kingdom; Germany; Italy; Spain and ideally in Cyprus;

6. Come up with recommendations and initiatives to improve the "Skola Nazzjonali tal-isport" for it to deliver on the mission for the school to produce elite athletes.

3. Introduction

3.1 International Studies

In a 2014 study prepared by Ofsted, UK, and entitled "Going the extra mile. Excellence in competitive

school sport", in its introductory forward, Sir Michael Wilshaw, UK's Chief Inspector, said: "Children's education is the poorer if they are deprived of the chance to compete. Children enjoy competition. It pushes them to do better and try harder. Of course, it also carries with it the risk of defeat, but how better to prepare pupils for the setbacks that life will inevitably throw at them? Not every child can or will go on to become a world champion, but every child will experience victories and defeats. And every student, wherever they are educated, deserves the opportunity to have their sporting passion identified and nurtured."

Sports Schools are mostly mainstream secondary schools which have a systematic and flexible approach to assisting young elite athletes to pursue their secondary education, while also training and competing at an elite level.

A study carried out by Dr Sabine Radtke and Prof. Fred Coalter (Sports Schools: An International Review -University of Stirling, August 2007), in which the authors have gathered information on sports schools administered in the following countries: Australia, Belgium, Canada, Finland, France, Germany, Italy, Netherlands, Singapore and Sweden, have identified a number of key issues which such schools must adopt. Some of these key issues, are:

- The need to integrate young athletes within standard secondary schools for their own educational and social benefit;
- The need to include students of all abilities and educational levels;
- Possibility of permitting students' athletes to extend the duration of their studies;
- The need to provide boarding facilities;
- Close working relationships with sporting federations – especially when it comes to selection of students, provision of elite coaching and assessment of students' progress.

The need for the school to provide a good secondary education for the elite student athletes, stems from the fact that sporting success cannot be guaranteed because a student is attending such a school.

Research carried out by a number of international scholars, amongst them Dawn Aquilina, shows that athletes who follow a dual career pathway, may have a more balanced lifestyle, enhanced employment prospects and enhanced support systems.

Such studies also revealed that engaging oneself in other activities (for example education) alongside sport, can help athletes avoid the development of identity foreclosure (This is a psychological term that describes one of the key steps young people experience in the process of finding a sense of self) that has the potential to lead to mental health issues.

Facilitating dual career opportunities, may be an important factor that can prolong and positively impact athletes' sporting career (studies by Lavallee & Robinson, 2007). On the other hand, a lack of dual career support has also been associated with premature retirement from high-level sport (Aquilina, 2013).

The same studies encourage universities that currently do not support elite-level student athletes in post -graduate studies, to do so and accommodate such students within their fold.

Dawn Aquilina, 2013, Debois, Ledon & Wylleman, 2015, and other authors, mention that there are two main psychological attributes to balance athlete commitments with the academic duties or vice versa: (1) how student-athletes identify themselves; whether they are students, athletes or both; and (2) how students – athletes feel about their motivation in both contexts. It was shown that these psychological attributes are related to each other and likely have a major influence on student-athlete decision to pursue a dual career or choose one career over the other.

Despite the persistence of cultural narratives that portrait a sporting performance as the main priority of student-athletes, research is increasingly showing that young athletes aspire to equal levels of achievement in both their academic and sports career. The studies further highlight that to be successful in both and to achieve a balanced dual career path, athletes must develop the right skills and employ the right strategies. Dawn Aquilina's study showed that the practicing of sports benefits the student-athlete by having better intellectual stimulation, better learning abilities, the acquisition of better coping strategies facing injury recovery. Moreover, maintaining a balance between sports and academic life, brings other benefits for social life and the development of strategies that help individuals manage their sports life.

Finally, one must mention what the European Commission has highlighted in its "EU Guidelines on Dual Careers of Athletes", 2012, namely health-related benefits (balanced lifestyle); developmental benefits (development of personal identity); social benefits (expanded social networking) and benefits related to athletic retirement (better adaptation).

The amount of time dedicated to sports and to academia, differs from one country to another.

In Sweden, approximately one third of the time is dedicated to training and related activities; in France there are 24 hours of lessons and 20 hours of training per week; in Belgium students have 20 hours of lessons and 12 hours of sport.

In general, sports training takes place at the school sports facilities and at local centers of excellence. It is to be noted that in case of Canada, the Canadian National Sport School offers year-round schooling.

In most countries (Australia, Belgium, Germany, Finland, Netherlands, Singapore, and Sweden, to mention a few) student athletes are allowed to extend the duration of their studies by one year.

When it comes to the selection process, in all countries, sports federations are involved in the selection process, whereby the young athletes needing to achieve some form of sporting excellence status from their relevant sports federation in order to be considered for admission as a student athlete. In addition to this, the student’s academic merit is also considered.

The most widespread model in the number of sports offered at sports schools, is that of having a variety of core sports (Australia, Singapore, Canada, Germany, Netherlands, Belgium, France, Italy).

High emphasis is placed on the coaches who train at sports schools. The coaches should be of high standard and qualified in the sports they train and are approved coaches by the sports federation of that particular sport.

It should be noted that despite the commitment to sports schools in many countries, the post-secondary school arrangements for combining sport with academic studies is more limited.

The Ofsted report, already mentioned here above, carried out a study by assessing the achievements in sport by the ten independent schools with a strong track record of sporting excellence to explore the factors underpinning their sporting success. They have also looked at 35 state schools.

The study revealed that where there was a strong sporting ethos and culture based on the sustained commitment of school leaders and teachers to provide the ideal conditions for students to practice, train for and take part in competitive sport, irrespective of the background of the school, success was achieved and the schools provided elite sportsmen.

The report highlights a variety of interlocking elements which underpin sporting success. One can list such components as being:

✓ Investment in excellent sports facilities and effective expert coaching staff;

✓ Having separated responsibility for teaching physical education (PE) and coaching sport, which gave PE teachers and coaches the time to do both well;

✓ Having a director of sport – a full-time position with responsibility for organising teams and coaches. Teams of teachers and coaches ran house competitions and school teams that all students were expected to take part in;

✓ Instilling a strong recognition of the wider benefits of competitive school sport in building school culture and identity, ensuring academic achievement and developing well-rounded individuals.

3.2 Local Scenario

In Malta the National Sports School was first established in 2012 and the inherent concept was to provide a specialized institution dedicated to sports. At a policy level there was a clear understanding and agreement that sports in Malta had potential which was not being tapped. This happened at a time when Maltese athletes were experiencing successes at international level. For example, Carmel Busuttil, Johnny Buttigieg, Noel Turner, Stefan Giglio, Justin Haber, Andrew Hogg, Andre' Schembri, Michael Mifsud and Danijel Bogdanovic in football and William Chetcuti in shooting. This triggered an unprecedented drive for investment in the sports sector. This occurred both at an infrastructural level as well as with regards to the athletes themselves and sports programmes and policy implementation.

With regards to capital and infrastructural projects, there was an investment in:

To list projects

The main and major investment at the time was obviously the National Sports School in Pembroke to the amount of ……..

The initial days of NSS were characterized by the formulation of a curriculum, identification of stakeholders and academic staff as well as identification of resources both human and capital involved in the running of such institution.

However as for from day 1 there was a fallacy – the focus was not based on sports with the academic aspect as complimentary but the other way round or equally. In fact, according to the mission statement:

'In collaboration with parents and sports associations, the mission of the National Sports School is to provide as students with exceptional education that motivates them to reach their full potential and which will enable them to develop their sporting talents, pursue their goals and dreams, succeed at post-secondary and tertiary education and thrive in the workforce and as engaged and productive citizens".

In fact during the inaugural speech Hon Clyde Puli Parliamentary Secretary responsible for sports said that the newly opened National Sport School, which forms part of St Benedict College in Kirkop, has welcomed its first group of 38 students (25 boys), who were selected for having exceptional talent in the sport they practise.

Clyde Puli stressed that the idea behind the school is to prepare students for a dual career path, so there will be a sense of flexibility and balance between academic subjects and sports. He said the new school is one of many strategic initiatives and measures that the government has been working on to give the sports sector a boost. He mentioned, in particular, the sports scholarships, the Armed Forces of Malta (AFM) sports scheme (which offers athletes the opportunity to take up a career with the AFM, applying their expertise acquired from the world of sports to their daily tasks in the army), as well as the 20/20 scheme (whereby athletes work for 20 hours and train for 20 hours as part of their normal working week).

The students who were selected to join the school practise eight different sports: football, athletics,

swimming, gymnastics, karate, basketball, rugby and bowling. However, football is the most popular, with 18 boys and five girls practising the sport.

The students will have 28 lessons per week in academic subjects and 12 linked to sport; eight of these (four double lessons) will be in the sport they practise, three will be lessons in the basic sport fundamentals (athletics, swimming and gymnastics) and one will be about the students' holistic development.

The students will also have regular visits by a sports psychologist and a nutritionist. They will have the same number of lessons as other schools in the following subjects: Maths, English, Maltese, Science and Religion.

As for the other subjects, the students will naturally not have any Physical Education lessons and will have one lesson per week in each of the following: History, Geography, Personal and Social Development (though the holistic development sessions will make up for this), and Information and Communication Technology. Some other state schools have one extra lesson per week in each of these subjects.

3.3 Conclusions

Research carried out by a number of international scholars, shows that athletes who follow a dual career pathway, may have a more balanced lifestyle, enhanced employment prospects and enhanced support systems.

Other studies encourage universities that currently do not support elite-level student athletes in post graduate studies, to do so and accommodate such students within their fold.

When it comes to the selection process, sports federations should be involved in the selection process, whereby the young athletes needing to achieve some form of sporting excellence status from their relevant sports federation in order to be considered for admission as a student athlete. In addition to this, the student's academic merit should also be part of the eligibility criteria, albeit at a lower weighting.

The coaches engaged by Sports Schools, should be of high standard and qualified in the sports they train and are approved coaches by the sports federation of that particular sport.

Despite the commitment to sports schools in many countries, the post-secondary school arrangements for combining sport with academic studies is more limited and this should be looked at to offer such students continuity in their practiced sports so as to have a potential elite athlete.

4. Meetings with stakeholders and outcomes

4.1 Focus Groups - present students attending the National Sports School

Five focus groups, one focus group for each scholastic year level, were scheduled. The interviews were carried out by Dr Paul DeBattista and Danijel Bogdanovic and held on the 1st March 2021.

The National Sports School administration were asked to choose two students, a male and a female, from each form, for the interview session.

The feedback from the interviews can be summarized as follows:

- All the students interviewed, except those of form one, are national players within their sports discipline and practice their sports with a local team.

- They all praised the level of the coaching staff and mentioned that a good number of the coaches are also national coaches of the particular sports.

- All students, when asked about nutritional information and diets, commented on lack of such a direction. They highlighted this as an area where one can improve upon.

- The majority of the students interviewed do not use the canteen facilities, mentioning that they prefer to bring food from home since they belief that the food will be more genuine.

- The absolute majority think the sports to academic curriculum ratio is balanced and if they had to improve, they would allocate additional time for the sports activities.

- The training camps abroad are being missed and all students look forward to such opportunities.

- When asked whether they would welcome the school having the facilities to have live-ins for a week or two, the students from form three upwards, were in favour while the younger ones expressed themselves that they would be home-sick, even for a week.

- The absolute number of students remarked that they are not asked from their coaches (NSS coaches and their team's coaches) of what training sessions they are doing when they are not training with them – only a couple said that they are asked about the training programmes.

- All students do daily training with their team and three-day training with the school.

- A couple of students raised concern about the selection criteria stating that there are a couple of students who should not have made the grade and should not have been accepted to be enrolled,

stating also that these students are the least disciplined.

- On improvements of facilities, a couple of students mentioned that they would welcome if there is a swimming pool on the premises to eliminate the time it is taking them to go to the Tal-Qroqq National Pool. They mentioned that it takes them 20 to 30 minutes each way travelling time.

- 6 out of 8 students (form two upwards) mentioned that they would like to eventually play abroad. This trend was mainly witnessed in those students who are practicing waterpolo and football.

- 4 students out of 8 (form two upwards), when asked what they would like to do after they finish school, mentioned that they would like to pursue a professional academic career – architect; medical doctor or an accountant.

- Of those interviewed, 5 students practice waterpolo/swimming; 2 students practice football and 3 students practice other sports (bowling; basketball and triathlon).

4.2 Interviews with past students

Out of the one hundred eighty-seven past students, I have interviewed them to trace the success that each of the past student had achieved, both in the sports scene and in the academic/employment environment.

One has unfortunately to register that the sports achievements by past students, do not follow the expectations for which the National Sports Schools was founded for, that of producing elite sportsmanship.

(to include a paragraph or two about the results)

More data is given in section 5.4 of this report.

4.3 Questionnaires

A number of questionnaires were sent to all present students attending the National Sports School; their parents and past students.

Regrettably, it is to be reported that the reply was non-existent, where only one student had replied to the questionnaire.

I am reproducing here below the questions which were posed in the mentioned questionnaires.

____QUESTIONAIRE FOR STUDENTS AND EX -STUDENTS OF NSS

1. What made you opt to attend NSS in your educational pathway?
2. Are you satisfied with the choice you made? YES NO
3. Why?
4. Are you/were satisfied with the mix between hours dedicated to academic and sports components?
5. Why?
6. What improvements would you like to see at NSS to enhance its mission statement?
7. As an ex-student of NSS did the education experience acquired from the school help

you achieve your aspirations in your professional career?

From an academic aspect:

Why/How?

From a sports aspect YES NO

Why/How

8. As a student of NSS are you satisfied with the structure and what level of confidence do you have that NSS will help you achieve your aspirations in a professional career?

From academic aspect rate from 1 to 10 ____

From sports aspect rate from 1 to 10 ____

9. Would you recommend to other students to attend the NSS?

YES NO

10. Why?

THIS QUESTIONAIRE HAS TO BE SUBMITTED BY 26.2.2021

___

4.4 Focus Group with Administration personnel and sports teaching personnel

4.5 Focus Group with Sports Associations

5. Information Data Gathering and Analysis

The data in this study, as furnished by the National Sports School, refers to students who enrolled with the school since the foundation of the school in 2012 and includes all the present students who are attending the school.

5.1 Student Population

In the nine years since the sports school opened its doors, it welcomed two hundred and sixty-six (266) male students and one hundred and fifty-two (152) female students, for a total of four hundred and eighteen (418) students.

The intake by gender is that of 64% male students and 36% female students.

The average students' intake per scholastic year, is of 46 having a mix of 29 male students and 17 female students. It is worth noting that for scholastic year 2014/15, there was almost an equal gender intake (49% female and 51% male students).

5.2 Sports Disciplines

The number of different sports disciplines chosen by the students in any particular scholastic year, saw a sharp increase during the last two years.

For seven out of the nine scholastic years, the number of different sports disciplines chosen by students never exceeded ten in a scholastic year. Scholastic years 2015/16 and 2020/21 were exception to this trend, whereby enrolled students came from 13 and 15 different sports disciplines, respectively.

Presently, students are following 19 different sports disciplines.

The different sports disciplines have been classified according to whether it is a team sport or an individual sport activity.

Based on this definition, there are 5 team sports disciplines (Football; Basketball; Waterpolo; Handball and Rugby) presently being practiced by students and 14 individual sports disciplines (Athletics; Judo; Swimming; Table Tennis; Badminton; Karate; Triathlon; Squash; Tennis; Bowling; various types of Gymnastics; Synchronised Swimming and Taekwondo).

Over the years, the ratio between intake of team sports disciplines to individual sports disciplines was 3 to 2 (60% of intake came from team sports disciplines against the 40% of students practicing individual sports disciplines). Recently one is noticing a shift in students intake practicing individual sports disciplines – in fact, during this current scholastic year, 55% of the students’ intake are practicing individual sports disciplines.

74% of the students practicing team sports disciplines, come from the field of football. It is to be highlighted that there were years where, although a student practices a team sports, only one student was enrolled for a particular sports discipline.

When it comes to individual sports disciplines, 30% of the students come from Athletics’ sports discipline. This discipline is followed by students practicing Karate and Gymnastics, each with 12% of the total students.

More details can be found in Graphs 1 to 11.

5.3 Academic Studies

Students in Year 7 and Year 8 have a choice of which two languages they want to study. In Year 9, students have to choose two additional subjects, apart from the core subjects.

The statistics refer to the students who currently are attending the National Sports School.

When it comes to languages, Italian remains the most chosen language. In fact, on average, for 54% of students, Italian is the first foreign language choice. This is followed by Spanish (22% of the students); French (16% of the students) and German (8% of the students).

Chemistry (22% of students) and Biology (19% of students) are the two most chosen subjects as First Option from the two additional subjects, students have to choose to study during Years 9, 10 and 11. Physical Education is chosen by 13% of the students, followed by Accounts (11% of students) and Business Studies (8% of students). 27% of students chose a subject from the other six subjects offered by the school (Graphical Communication; Home Economics; History; Art; Spanish and Computer Studies).

As the second subject chosen by the students, 36% of students chose Biology, followed by Physical Education (24% of students) and Graphical Communication (18% of students). The other 22% of students chose a subject from the other eight subjects offered.

Grouping both subject options, it shows that 27% of students chose Physical Education; 21% chose Biology; 15% chose Graphical Communication; 12% Chemistry and 9% Accounts. The other subjects were chosen by 16% of the students.

More details are given in Graphs 12 to 17.

5.4 Demographic Distribution of Students

Since its opening, the intake of students at the National Sports School, came from almost all the localities found in Malta and Gozo. In fact, students came from forty-nine localities from Malta and from five localities from Gozo.

Even when it comes to demographic distribution by region, one can highlight that intake of students from all the six districts had the opportunity to enroll at the School, with the percentage of students from each region, reflecting the population density of that region.

The Northern Harbour region supplied the most students (32% of all students who attended the School over the years), followed by the Southern Harbour region. (22%).

When it comes to the localities, Birkirkara had the highest number of students who attended the School (twenty-six students0, closely followed by Marsascala, with twenty-four students.

Further details can be found in graphs 18 to 21.

5.5 Sports and Academic achievements of past students

One hundred and eighty-seven (187) students had so far pursued their studies at the National Sports School and finished their schooling years between 2017 and 2020.

This study traced both the sport and the academic achievements of those past students who have reached the eighteen years of age, since they left the School.

For this study, by sports' achievements, the understanding is that the past student would have joined and played with a club of Premier or Challenge League status in Malta or played abroad. The same

applies for Waterpolo; while in the case of other sports, the past students should have represented Malta in International competitions.

The survey shows that only xxxx of past students achieved the desired results after finishing their studies at the National Sports School.

Further details are given in graphs 22 to 2X.

5.6 Administrative and Teaching Personnel of School

(to include write up which I did on this section)

Further details are given in graphs 2X to 2Y.

5.7 Teaching Timetable

One should consider having the following daily timetable:

08:00 – 08:30: Breakfast

08:30 – 09:15: Academic Lesson 1

09:15 – 10:00: Academic Lesson 2

10:00 – 12:00: Sports Session 1

12:00 – 12:45: Lunch

12:45 – 13:30: Academic Lesson 3

13:30 – 14:45: Sports Session 2

14:45 – 15:30: Academic Lesson 4

15:30 – 16:00: Snack

5.8 School Facilities

Following a visit to the National Sports School, carried out during March 2021, the following observations were made:

1. The premises are well kept and there is no need for an extensive maintenance but there is a need for more investment in facilities.

2. The school needs a facelift.

3. The roof of the main building can be better utilized by adding more sports facilities.

4. The present athletics track should be removed from its present allocation and integrated within the development of a new football pitch in the derelict area.

5. One should consider having dormitories; rest areas and dining rooms for eventual live-ins.

6. No filming facilities within the training areas exist; and training sessions are not filmed.

7. Classrooms still have the whiteboards technology.

8. One is to make sure that the progress made by the students is electronically kept and eventually forwarded to the coaches who will train the students once they leave the school.

9. More investment is needed in the physiotherapy area.

10. The nutritional and dietary aspects should be taken more seriously – the engagement of nutritionists (even on a part-time basis) is a must.

11. Although the school focusses mainly on sports, the school should make sure that the necessary material, including the equipment used at the science oratories, will be equipped in the same way other mainstream schools are being equipped.

6. Recommendations

6.1 School's Autonomy

A Sports School is a very specialized institution and for it to deliver its main mission, it cannot be administered like any mainstream school.

Currently, the National Sports School falls under the jurisdiction of a College and is, for all intends and purposes, another normal mainstream school. This could lead to an increase in bureaucratic processes when it comes to investment and onerous when it comes to taking of decisions. This type of management style might manifest itself in hindrance for the school's administration to implement necessary initiatives.

It is thus being recommended that the National Sports School will be run autonomous from the present Colleges' structure.

There should be a Board of Governors, made of a chairperson and four Board Members. The Board of Governors should be answerable to the Minister responsible for Education. The Minister for Education will appoint the chairperson and two other Board members. Another Board member is to be nominated by the Minister responsible for Sports, while the other member should be nominated by the Malta Olympic Committee.

The answerability of the Board of Governors should be directly answerable to the Minister Responsible for Education. The Board of Governors will have the responsibility to propose to the Minister for Education, a periodic 5-year strategic plan for the School; oversee that the School administration is implementing the approved policies and oversee that the School administration is running the school in a professional manner.

For day to day management, the school should employ a Chief Executive Officer, who will be directly

answerable to the Board of Governors.

Government should finance the operations of the School, both recurrent and capital expenditure, through a direct subvention.

6.2 School Campus

The existing school building complex, although it could have served its purpose during this last decade, is going to be a bottleneck for the school to expand and meet the strategic plans which this report is proposing.

To transform the National Sports School into a state-of-the-art regional sports school, it is imperative to look for an alternative site where a new Sports School campus will be built.

The new Sports School Campus should be sited into a more central area of Malta, whereby one would go for a sports purpose building, and not refurbish an existing building. The site to be chosen must have ample grounds to build a “mini sports village”, while catering for a higher intake of students.

The Sports Complex should include not just classrooms and indoor/ outdoor sports grounds/facilities, for various sports disciplines, but also clinics, canteens, audio visual center and dormitories, amongst other facilities.

It is a must that all training areas and training sessions, be filmed so that the coaches can discuss the techniques used by the students when they were practicing their sports activities and thus improve on their techniques.

6.3 Internationalization of the Sports Campus

It is being recommended that in the building of this Sports Campus, one is to consider finding a strategic partner to invest and possibly administer this sports school complex.

Other Mediterranean countries/ regions have such sports campuses and these campuses are attractive to international students. Malta should study whether there are interested parties who are willing to not only invest but offer their expertise in this economic activity.

The idea of having an International Sports University, built on this campus should not be discarded.

6.4 Students’ eligibility criteria to enroll to the Sports School

The Sports School should mainly focus on the sports ability of the prospective student. Thus, more importance should be given on the sports abilities of the student.

It is being recommended that at least sixty-five percentage points of the assessment marks, should be assigned to the sports abilities of the prospective candidate.

Moreover, it is being recommended that each applicant, should undergo a one-week trial period before an assessment is given.

6.5 Exit Criteria

Assessing the capabilities of a student at a tender age of 11 year, is a mammoth task and there is a possibility that the promising student will fail to perform along the years.

All avenues for the student to opt out from the sports school and go to a mainstream school, in the eventuality that the student does not perform, should be an available option.

At present, such an option is not available.

It is being recommended that such an option be introduced as from the forthcoming scholastic year.

Any vacancy thus created, should be filled by another promising student who would have originally obtained the next highest marks during the one-week trial test.

6.6 Extending the school years

At present, a student leaves the sports school at the age of 16, when he is still an amateur sportsman. There is a two-year gap, until the student reaches the 18 years of age when he/she can register as a semi-profession/ profession status.

Moreover, due to the cramped schedule of study and sports activities, a high percentage of such students find it difficult to cope with the academic studies.

It is thus being recommended that a student attending the sports school, will follow a 7-year course. The student will leave the school at the age of 18.

The two additional years, can either be an extension of the secondary school, for the student to sit for his SEC exams; or if he/she would have been successful to sit for the SEC exams at the 5th year, he/she would be given the opportunity to prepare for the MATSEC exams.

6.7 School hours

The Sports school should adopt a holistic approach to prepare the student to become a professional athlete.

This entails, coaching the student not just from an academic and sport curriculum, but instill discipline;

time-management and educate him to follow a healthy lifestyle.

It is thus being recommended that the school hours would be between 08:00 and 16:00 from Monday to Fridays.

The school will provide a healthy breakfast; lunch and a snack before leaving school. Following the school diet and eating at the school canteen facilities, should be a must and not an option which the student can decide whether to follow or not.

6.8 Training with local sports clubs

The idea behind extending the school hours, is also intended to have the students engaged into a professional training environment, whereby the student will not be allowed to train with their clubs from Monday to Thursdays. The necessary training sessions that the student athlete needs, would have been covered by the training done at the school.

On Fridays and over the weekend, the athlete can join the club to play the competitive matches.

6.9 Competitive Sports

The importance of participating at competitive matches, must be highlighted. Presently, the National Sports School, does not have its own teams participating at National level competitions organized by the individual Sports Associations. This is a missing link if one wants to have the formation of a complete athlete.

It is recommended that the Sports School should have its own various sports teams, which should participate in various National Associations' competitions.

6.10 Maintenance Students Grants/Stipends

Students attending the sports school should be treated like all other students following courses at mainstream schools.

Thus, if the recommendation to extend the school years till the student reaches the age of 18, as from the age of 16, the students should also be entitled to the students maintenance grants/stipends which other students attending the Junior Colleges, are getting.

6.11 Collaboration with National Sports Associations

6.12 A holistic approach to sports

Sports should not be considered as an activity reserved for those aspiring to practice it at a competitive level or aspire to become elite athletes

Sports must be seen as one of the first building blocks for a healthy lifestyle; an important tool to address the issue of obesity.

To achieve such aims, one should seriously recommends having a more structured physical education sessions, FOR ALL, from an early age – thus having these sessions from pre-primary school education, right through to secondary level education.

One also recommends that there should be inter-school competitions, for a number of team sports' disciplines.

To achieve the utmost positive results from all such activity, the collaboration with Sports Associations is a must. Education Institutions and Sports Associations complement each other.

Finally, it is recommended that there should be in place a mechanism, short of having profession set-up in our sports clubs, for the promising students who would have successfully finished the National Sports School, at the age of 18, to join the Armed Forces Sports scheme.

In the eventuality that Malta would have its own Sports University, such promising athletes, could enroll with this University to continue to practice their sports leading to elite level. The Sports University would be ideal for individual sports disciplines.

B/DB/4

Assessment, review and recommendations for National Sports School

Danijel Bogdanovic

23 March 2021

Table of contents

- Executive Summary 5
- Brief and Methodology 9
- Introduction 11
- Meetings with stakeholders and outcomes 21
- Information Data Gathering and Analyses 27
- Recommendations 69
- Annex 1 – Proposal by Malta Football Association 77
- Annex 2 – Proposal by Aquatic Sports Association 81

- **Executive Summary**

Since the opening of the "Skola Nazzjonali tal-iSport", way back during the scholastic year 2012/2013, there has been development within both the sports sector and the academic sector.

This study, commissioned by the Minister for Education, Hon. Justyne Caruana, focused on the assessment of whether the goals which were set when the school was opened, were achieved and came up with the needed improvements for the school to address the needs of the students who will be attending the school in the coming decade.

International scholars emphasized how athletes who follow a dual career pathway, may have a more balanced lifestyle, enhanced employment prospects and enhanced support systems.

Another important factor which emerges from studies, shows that despite the commitment to sports schools in many countries, the post-secondary school arrangements for combining sport with academic studies is more limited and this should be looked at to offer such students continuity in their practiced sports so as to have a potential elite athlete. This includes encouraging universities to support elite-level student athletes in post graduate studies.

This report includes extensive sports and academic data about the students, past and present, who attending the Sports School.

To come up with the recommendations, focus groups, questionnaires and one-to-one interviews were carried out with students; Sports School administration; coaching personnel; and Sports Associations.

The outcome of the report can be summarized in the following recommendations:

- Having a National Sports School administered autonomous from the present Colleges' structure.
- The construction of a new sports, purpose built, School Campus, sited into a more central area of Malta.
- The site must have ample grounds to build a "mini sports village".
- Finding a strategic partner to invest and possibly administer this sports school complex.
- Considering having an International Sports University, built on this new campus.
- At least sixty-five percentage points of the entry assessment marks, should be assigned to the sports abilities of the prospective candidate.
- Every applicant should undergo a one-week trial period before an assessment is given.
- There should be an option for the student to opt out from the sports school and go to a mainstream school, in the eventuality that the student does not perform.
- Students attending the sports school, will follow a 7-year course. Thus, students will leave the school at the age of 18.
- School hours are to be between 08:00 and 16:00 from Monday to Fridays.

- Students will have to follow a healthy diet and to do so, the school is to provide a healthy breakfast; lunch and a snack before leaving school.
- Following the school diet and eating at the school canteen facilities, should be a must and not an option.
- Students will train at the school from Monday to Thursdays and will train with their clubs on Fridays and over the weekend, for the athletes to play the competitive matches.
- The Sports School should have its own various sports teams, which should participate in various National Associations' competitions.
- As from the age of 16, the students should also be entitled to the students' maintenance grants/stipends which other students attending the Junior Colleges, are getting.
- National Sports School should enter into agreements with Associations to have a number of student athletes training at the Associations' premises while the School would give the teachers to cover the academic part of the curriculum.
- A pilot project of the collaboration with Associations' concept, has been discussed with the Aquatic Sports Association of Malta and there is agreement in principle.
- Similar proposed agreements were scheduled to be discussed with other Sports Associations, but due to circumstances, had to be cancelled.
- Other scheduled meetings with the Malta Olympic Committee and Sports Associations had also to be cancelled, for the same reason given here above.

The implementation of these recommendations should result in having a quantum leap in the standards of our National Sports School, for it to be

in a better position to prepare our prospective young students becoming elite athletes.

2. Brief and Methodology

2.1. *An Overview of the modus operandi of the "Skola Nazzjonali tal-isport"*

2.1.1 Background

The "*Skola Nazzjonali tal-isport*" welcomed the first students during the scholastic year 2012/2013.

The idea behind the school was to prepare students for a dual career path, so there will be a sense of flexibility and balance between academic subjects and sports. Children attending the school would serve as role models for other children in terms of adopting a physically active and healthy lifestyle.

Over these last nine years of its inception, there has been development within both the sports sector and the academic sector. It is thus the opportune time to assess whether, the goals which were set when the school was opened, were achieved and to come up with the needed improvements for the school to address the needs of the students who will be attending he school in the coming decade.

While we need to motivate and attract more people to be involved in physical activity and sports throughout their life, we need to structure our "***Skola Nazzjonali tal-isport***" to prepare our young generations, become elite athletes. This can only be achieved by providing the right platform for high-performance individuals.

2.1.2 Terms of Reference

The report, commissioned by the Minister for Education, Hon. Justyne Caruana, had to cover the following areas:

- Assess the standards of the present academic and sports curriculum being taught at the school;
- Evaluate the students' selection criteria in place;
- Carry out a survey, with past and present students and educators, on their experience at the school;
- Look into the organisational structure of the school;
- Compare both the academic and sports curriculum and selection criteria of the school with curricula and selection criteria in place by similar international sports schools – in particular, those operating in the United Kingdom; Germany; Italy; Spain and ideally in Cyprus;

- Come up with recommendations and initiatives to improve the "***Skola Nazzjonali tal-isport***" for it to deliver on the mission for the school to produce elite athletes.

3. Introduction

3.1 ***International Studies***

In a 2014 study prepared by Ofsted, UK, and entitled "Going the extra mile. Excellence in competitive school sport", in its introductory forward, Sir Michael Wilshaw, UK's Chief Inspector, said: "Children's education is the poorer if they are deprived of the chance to compete. Children enjoy competition. It pushes them to do better and try harder. Of course, it also carries with it the risk of defeat, but how better to prepare pupils for the setbacks that life will inevitably throw at them? Not every child can or will go on to become a world champion, but every child will experience victories and defeats. And every student, wherever they are educated, deserves the opportunity to have their sporting passion identified and nurtured."

Sports Schools are mostly mainstream secondary schools which have a systematic and flexible approach to assisting young elite athletes to pursue their secondary education, while also training and competing at an elite level.

A study carried out by Dr Sabine Radtke and Prof. Fred Coalter (Sports Schools: An International Review -University of Stirling, August 2007), in which the authors have gathered information on sports schools administered in the following countries: Australia, Belgium, Canada, Finland, France, Germany, Italy, Netherlands, Singapore and Sweden, have identified a number of key issues which such schools must adopt. Some of these key issues, are:

- The need to integrate young athletes within standard secondary schools for their own educational and social benefit;
- The need to include students of all abilities and educational levels;
- Possibility of permitting students' athletes to extend the duration of their studies;
- The need to provide boarding facilities;
- Close working relationships with sporting federations – especially when it comes to selection of students, provision of elite coaching and assessment of students' progress.

The need for the school to provide a good secondary education for the elite student athletes, stems from the fact that sporting success cannot be guaranteed because a student is attending such a school.

Research carried out by a number of international scholars, amongst them Dawn Aquilina, shows that athletes who follow a dual career pathway, may have a more balanced lifestyle, enhanced employment prospects and enhanced support systems.

Such studies also revealed that engaging oneself in other activities (for example education) alongside sport, can help athletes avoid the development of *identity foreclosure* (This is a psychological term that describes one of the key steps young people experience in the process of finding a sense of self) that has the potential to lead to mental health issues.

Facilitating dual career opportunities, may be an important factor that can prolong and positively impact athletes' sporting career (studies by Lavallee & Robinson, 2007). On the other hand, a lack of dual career support has also been associated with premature retirement from high-level sport (Aquilina, 2013).

The same studies encourage universities that currently do not support elite-level student athletes in post -graduate studies, to do so and accommodate such students within their fold.

Dawn Aquilina, 2013, Debois, Ledon & Wylleman, 2015, and other authors, mention that there are two main psychological attributes to balance athlete commitments with the academic duties or vice versa: (1) how student-athletes identify themselves; whether they are students, athletes or both; and (2) how students – athletes feel about their motivation in both contexts. It was shown that these psychological attributes are related to each other and likely have a major influence on student-athlete decision to pursue a dual career or choose one career over the other.

Despite the persistence of cultural narratives that portrait a sporting performance as the main priority of student-athletes, research is increasingly showing that young athletes aspire to equal levels of achievement in both their academic and sports career. The studies further highlight that to be successful in both and to achieve a balanced dual career path, athletes must develop the right skills and employ the right strategies. Dawn Aquilina's study showed that the practicing of sports benefits the student-athlete by having better intellectual stimulation, better learning abilities, the acquisition of better coping strategies facing injury recovery. Moreover, maintaining a balance between sports and academic life, brings other benefits for social life and the development of strategies that help individuals manage their sports life.

Finally, one must mention what the European Commission has highlighted in its "EU Guidelines on Dual Careers of Athletes", 2012, namely health-related benefits (balanced lifestyle); developmental benefits (development of personal identity); social benefits (expanded social networking) and benefits related to athletic retirement (better adaptation).

The amount of time dedicated to sports and to academia, differs from one country to another.

In Sweden, approximately one third of the time is dedicated to training and related activities; in France there are 24 hours of lessons and 20 hours of training per week; in Belgium students have 20 hours of lessons and 12 hours of sport.

In general, sports training takes place at the school sports facilities and at local centers of excellence. It is to be noted that in case of Canada, the Canadian National Sport School offers year-round schooling.

In most countries (Australia, Belgium, Germany, Finland, Netherlands, Singapore, and Sweden, to mention a few) student athletes are allowed to extend the duration of their studies by one year.

When it comes to the selection process, in all countries, sports federations are involved in the selection process, whereby the young athletes needing to achieve some form of sporting excellence status from their relevant sports federation in order to be considered for admission as a student athlete. In addition to this, the student's academic merit is also considered.

The most widespread model in the number of sports offered at sports schools, is that of having a variety of core sports (Australia, Singapore, Canada, Germany, Netherlands, Belgium, France, Italy).

High emphasis is placed on the coaches who train at sports schools. The coaches should be of high standard and qualified in the sports they train and are approved coaches by the sports federation of that particular sport.

It should be noted that despite the commitment to sports schools in many countries, the post-secondary school arrangements for combining sport with academic studies is more limited.

The Ofsted report, already mentioned here above, carried out a study by assessing the achievements in sport by the ten independent schools with

a strong track record of sporting excellence to explore the factors underpinning their sporting success. They have also looked at 35 state schools.

The study revealed that where there was a strong sporting ethos and culture based on the sustained commitment of school leaders and teachers to provide the ideal conditions for students to practice, train for and take part in competitive sport, irrespective of the background of the school, success was achieved and the schools provided elite sportsmen.

The report highlights a variety of interlocking elements which underpin sporting success. One can list such components as being:

- Investment in excellent sports facilities and effective expert coaching staff;
- Having separated responsibility for teaching physical education (PE) and coaching sport, which gave PE teachers and coaches the time to do both well;
- Having a director of sport – a full-time position with responsibility for organising teams and coaches. Teams of teachers and coaches ran house competitions and school teams that all students were expected to take part in;
- Instilling a strong recognition of the wider benefits of competitive school sport in building school culture and identity, ensuring academic achievement and developing well-rounded individuals.

3.2 ***Local Scenario***

In Malta the National Sports School was first established in 2012 and the inherent concept was to provide a specialized institution dedicated to sports. At a policy level there was a clear understanding and agreement that sports in Malta had potential which was not being tapped. This happened at a time when Maltese athletes were experiencing successes at international level. For example, Carmel Busuttil, Johnny Buttigieg, Noel Turner, Stefan Giglio, Justin Haber, Andrew Hogg, Andre' Schembri, Michael Mifsud and Danijel Bogdanovic in football and William Chetcuti in shooting. This triggered an unprecedented drive for investment in the sports sector. This occurred both at an infrastructural level as well as with regards to the athletes themselves and sports programmes and policy implementation.

The main and major investment at the time was obviously the National Sports School in Pembroke.

The initial days of National Sports School were characterized by the formulation of a curriculum, identification of stakeholders and academic staff as well as identification of resources both human and capital involved in the running of such institution.

However, when one looks into the initial curriculum prepared by the School, the focus was not based on sports with the academic aspect as complimentary but the other way round or equally. In fact, according to the mission statement:

'In collaboration with parents and sports associations, the mission of the National Sports School is to provide as students with exceptional education that motivates them to reach their full potential and which will enable them to develop their sporting talents, pursue their goals and dreams, succeed at post-secondary and tertiary education and thrive in the workforce and as engaged and productive citizens".

During the inaugural speech Hon Clyde Puli, Parliamentary Secretary responsible for sports said that the newly opened National Sport School, which forms part of St Benedict College in Kirkop, has welcomed its first group of 38 students (25 boys), who were **selected for having exceptional talent in the sport they practise.**

Hon Clyde Puli stressed that the idea behind the school is to prepare students for a dual career path, so there will be a sense of flexibility and balance between academic subjects and sports. He said the new school is one of many strategic initiatives and measures that the government has been working on to give the sports sector a boost. He mentioned, in particular, the sports scholarships, the Armed Forces of Malta (AFM) sports scheme (which offers athletes the opportunity to take up a career with the AFM, applying their expertise acquired from the world of sports to their daily tasks in the army), as well as the 20/20 scheme (whereby athletes work for 20 hours and train for 20 hours as part of their normal working week).

The students who were selected to join the school practise eight different sports: football, athletics, swimming, gymnastics, karate, basketball, rugby and bowling. However, football is the most popular, with 18 boys and five girls practising the sport.

The students will have 28 lessons per week in academic subjects and 12 lessons linked to sport; eight (four double) of these lessons will be in the sport they practise, three lessons will cover the basic sport fundamentals (athletics, swimming and gymnastics) and one lesson will be about the students' holistic development.

The students will also have regular visits by a sports psychologist and a nutritionist. They will have the same number of lessons as other schools in the following subjects: Maths, English, Maltese, Science and Religion.

As for the other subjects, the students will not have any Physical Education lessons and will have one lesson per week in each of the following: History, Geography, Personal and Social Development (though the holistic development sessions will make up for this), and Information and Communication Technology. Some other state schools have one extra lesson per week in each of these subjects.

3.3 *Conclusions*

Research carried out by a number of international scholars, shows that athletes who follow a dual career pathway, may have a more balanced lifestyle, enhanced employment prospects and enhanced support systems.

Other studies encourage universities that currently do not support elite-level student athletes in post graduate studies, to do so and accommodate such students within their fold.

When it comes to the selection process, sports federations should be involved in the selection process, whereby the young athletes needing to achieve some form of sporting excellence status from their relevant sports federation in order to be considered for admission as a student athlete. In addition to this, the student's academic merit should also be part of the eligibility criteria, albeit at a lower weighting.

The coaches engaged by Sports Schools, should be of high standard and qualified in the sports they train and are approved coaches by the sports federation of that particular sport.

Despite the commitment to sports schools in many countries, the post-secondary school arrangements for combining sport with academic studies is more limited and this should be looked at to offer such students continuity in their practiced sports so as to have a potential elite athlete.

- **Meetings with stakeholders and outcomes**

4.1 ***<u>Focus Groups - present students attending the National Sports School</u>***

Five focus groups, one focus group for each scholastic year level, were scheduled. The interviews were held during the month of March 2021.

The National Sports School administration was asked to choose two students, a male and a female, from each Year, for the interview session.

The feedback from the interviews can be summarized as follows:

- All the students interviewed, except those of form one, are national players within their sports discipline and practice their sports with a local team.

- They all praised the level of the coaching staff and mentioned that a good number of the coaches are also national coaches of the particular sports.

- All students, when asked about nutritional information and diets, commented on lack of such a direction. They highlighted this as an area where one can improve upon.

- The majority of the students interviewed do not use the canteen facilities, mentioning that they prefer to bring food from home since they belief that the food will be more genuine.

- The absolute majority think the sports to academic curriculum ratio is balanced and if they had to improve, they would allocate additional time for the sports activities.

- The training camps abroad are being missed and all students look forward to such opportunities.

- When asked whether they would welcome the school having the facilities to have live-ins for a week or two, the students from form three upwards, were in favour while the younger ones expressed themselves that they would be home-sick, even for a week.

- The absolute number of students remarked that they are not asked from their coaches (NSS coaches and their team's coaches) of what training sessions they are doing when they are not training with them – only a couple said that they are asked about the training programmes.

- All students do daily training with their team and three-day training with the school.

- A couple of students raised concern about the selection criteria stating that there are a couple of students who should not have made the grade and should not have been accepted to be enrolled, stating also that these students are the least disciplined.

- On improvements of facilities, a couple of students mentioned that they would welcome if there is a swimming pool on the premises to eliminate the time it is taking them to go to the Tal-Qroqq National Pool. They mentioned that it takes them 20 to 30 minutes each way travelling time.

- 6 out of 8 students (form two upwards) mentioned that they would like to eventually play abroad. This trend was mainly witnessed in those students who are practicing waterpolo and football.

- 4 students out of 8 (form two upwards), when asked what they would like to do after they finish school, mentioned that they

would like to pursue a professional academic career – architect; medical doctor or an accountant.

- Of those interviewed, 5 students practice waterpolo/swimming; 2 students practice football and 3 students practice other sports (bowling; basketball and triathlon).

4.2 ***Interviews with past students***

Out of the one hundred eighty-seven past students, I have interviewed them to trace the success that each of the past student had achieved, both in the sports scene and in the academic/employment environment.

One has unfortunately to register that the sports achievements by past students, do not follow the expectations for which the National Sports Schools was founded for, that of producing elite sportsmanship.

More data is given in section 5.4 of this report.

4.3 ***Questionnaires***

A number of questionnaires were sent to all present students attending the National Sports School; their parents and past students.

Regrettably, it is to be reported that the reply was non-existent, where only one student had replied to the questionnaire.

I am reproducing here below the questions which were posed in the mentioned questionnaires.

QUESTIONAIRE FOR STUDENTS AND EX -STUDENTS OF NSS

- What made you opt to attend NSS in your educational pathway?

- Are you satisfied with the choice you made? YES NO ☐

- Why?

- Are you/were satisfied with the mix between hours dedicated to academic and sports components?

- Why?

- What improvements would you like to see at NSS to enhance its

  mission statement?

- As an ex-student of NSS did the education experience acquired from the school help

  you achieve your aspirations in your professional career?

  From an academic aspect:

  Why/How?

From a sports aspect YES ☐ NO ☐

Why/How

- As a student of NSS are you satisfied with the structure and what level of confidence do you have that NSS will help you achieve your aspirations in a professional career?

From academic aspect rate from 1 to 10 ____

From sports aspect rate from 1 to 10 ____

- Would you recommend to other students to attend the NSS?

YES ☐ NO ☐

- Why?

THIS QUESTIONAIRE HAS TO BE SUBMITTED BY 26.2.2021

4.4 ***Focus Group with Administration personnel and sports teaching personnel***

In the limited time that I had, I had an extensive meeting with the Head of School, Mr. Robert Magri, Head of Sports of the National Sports School Mr. Paul Zammit.

There was a general consensus that there should be a review of the eligibility criteria; extend the number of hours the student spends on the School Campus; improve the sports facilities available; extend the number of years which the student spends at school – by at least two years; there should be more collaboration with the Sports Associations.

4.5 ***Focus Group with Sports Associations***

From the scheduled discussions with the various Sports Associations, I had only met the President and Vice President of the Malta Football Association, Mr Bjorn Vassallo and Dr Angelo Chetcuti; and the President of the Aquatic Sports Association of Malta, Mr Joe Caruana Curran.

Other planned meetings which were scheduled, included the Presidents of the Malta Olympic Committee; The Malta Basketball Association; the Malta Athletics Association; the Malta Tennis Association; amongst others.

There is a concrete proposal from the Malta Football Association, which proposal is being included in Annex 1 of this report.

A similar proposal is being drafted by the Aquatic Sports Association (ASA).

The agreement in principle with ASA is that the Aquatic students athletes, will attend daily at the Pixxina Nazzjonali at Tal-Qroqq and

follow an identical school schedule to the one prepared by the National Sports School, with the School supplying the educators teaching academic subjects.

The proposal of ASA will be included in Annex 2 of this report.

5. Information Data Gathering and Analysis

The data in this study, as furnished by the National Sports School, refers to students who enrolled with the school since the foundation of the school in 2012 and includes all the present students who are attending the school.

5.1 ***Student Population***

In the nine years since the sports school opened its doors, it welcomed two hundred and sixty-six (266) male students and one hundred and fifty-two (152) female students, for a total of four hundred and eighteen (418) students.

The intake by gender is that of 64% male students and 36% female students.

The average students' intake per scholastic year, is of 46 having a mix of 29 male students and 17 female students. It is worth noting that for scholastic year 2014/15, there was almost an equal gender intake (49% female and 51% male students).

5.2 ***Sports Disciplines***

The number of different sports disciplines chosen by the students in any particular scholastic year, saw a sharp increase during the last two years.

For seven out of the nine scholastic years, the number of different sports disciplines chosen by students never exceeded ten in a scholastic year. Scholastic years 2015/16 and 2020/21 were exception to this trend, whereby enrolled students came from 13 and 15 different sports disciplines, respectively.

Presently, students are following 19 different sports disciplines.

The different sports disciplines have been classified according to whether it is a team sport or an individual sport activity.

Based on this definition, there are 5 team sports disciplines (Football; Basketball; Waterpolo; Handball and Rugby) presently being practiced by students and 14 individual sports disciplines (Athletics; Judo; Swimming; Table Tennis; Badminton; Karate; Triathlon; Squash; Tennis; Bowling; various types of Gymnastics; Synchronised Swimming and Taekwondo).

Over the years, the ratio between intake of team sports disciplines to individual sports disciplines was 3 to 2 (60% of intake came from team sports disciplines against the 40% of students practicing individual sports disciplines). Recently one is noticing a shift in students intake practicing individual sports disciplines – in fact, during this current scholastic year, 55% of the students' intake are practicing individual sports disciplines.

74% of the students practicing team sports disciplines, come from the field of football. It is to be highlighted that there were years where, although a student practices a team sports, only one student was enrolled for a particular sports discipline.

When it comes to individual sports disciplines, 30% of the students come from Athletics' sports discipline. This discipline is followed by students practicing Karate and Gymnastics, each with 12% of the total students.

More details can be found in Graphs 1 to 11.

5.3 ***Academic Studies***

Students in Year 7 and Year 8 have a choice of which two languages they want to study. In Year 9, students have to choose two additional subjects, apart from the core subjects.

The statistics refer to the students who currently are attending the National Sports School.

When it comes to languages, Italian remains the most chosen language. In fact, on average, for 54% of students, Italian is the first foreign language choice. This is followed by Spanish (22% of the students); French (16% of the students) and German (8% of the students).

Chemistry (22% of students) and Biology (19% of students) are the two most chosen subjects as First Option from the two additional subjects, students have to choose to study during Years 9, 10 and 11. Physical Education is chosen by 13% of the students, followed by Accounts (11% of students) and Business Studies (8% of students). 27% of students chose a subject from the other six subjects offered by the school

(Graphical Communication; Home Economics; History; Art; Spanish and Computer Studies).

As the second subject chosen by the students, 36% of students chose Biology, followed by Physical Education (24% of students) and Graphical Communication (18% of students). The other 22% of students chose a subject from the other eight subjects offered.

Grouping both subject options, it shows that 27% of students chose Physical Education; 21% chose Biology; 15% chose Graphical Communication; 12% Chemistry and 9% Accounts. The other subjects were chosen by 16% of the students.

More details are given in Graphs 12 to 17.

5.4 *Demographic Distribution of Students*

Since its opening, the intake of students at the National Sports School, came from almost all the localities found in Malta and Gozo. In fact, students came from forty-nine localities from Malta and from five localities from Gozo.

Even when it comes to demographic distribution by region, one can highlight that intake of students from all the six districts had the opportunity to enroll at the School, with the percentage of students from each region, reflecting the population density of that region.

The Northern Harbour region supplied the most students (32% of all students who attended the School over the years), followed by the Southern Harbour region. (22%).

When it comes to the localities, Birkirkara had the highest number of students who attended the School (twenty-six students, closely followed by Marsascala, with twenty-four students.

Further details can be found in graphs 18 to 21.

5.5 ***Sports and Academic achievements of past students***

One hundred and eighty-seven (187) students had so far pursued their studies at the National Sports School and finished their schooling years between 2017 and 2020.

This study traced both the sport and the academic achievements of those past students who have reached the eighteen years of age, since they left the School.

For this study, by sports' achievements, the understanding is that the past student would have joined and played with a club of Premier or Challenge League status in Malta or played abroad. The same applies for Waterpolo; while in the case of other sports, the past students should have represented Malta in International competitions.

The survey shows that only 63% of past students are still active in the sports which they have studied at the National Sports School. A staggering 37% of past students are not practicing any sports!

Of those still active in the sports, only 3 percentage points are competing abroad; and another 14 percentage points are competing locally at highest level competitions.

37 percentage points of the ex-students are competing in the lower National league levels.

Further details are given in graphs 22 and 23.

The feedback from the parents and ex-students was that there must be upgrade of the facilities and in the admitting criteria, as there is a lack in consistency and transparency. Another issue mentioned was that time is being wasted on traveling to and from the School to some of the sports facilities.

5.6 ***Administrative and Teaching Personnel of School***

The ratio of educators and supporting staff to number of students, is 1:4.

Although data is scarce in this field, data given by Finnish sports schools give such ratio as 1:8.

Comparison is not straightforward since it also depends on the number of sports disciplines being practiced.

However, one can safely deduct that there is the correct balance of educators when considering the number of students who attend the National Sports School.

Further details are given in graphs 24 to 26.

5.7 ***Teaching Timetable***

One should consider having the following daily timetable:

Time-Table for Years 7; 8 and 9					

	Monday	Tuesday	Wednesday	Thursday	Friday
07:30 - 08:00	Breakfast	Breakfast	Breakfast	Breakfast	Breakfast
08:00 - 08:30	Maths	English	Maths	English	English
08:30 - 09:00	English	Maths	English	Maths	Maths
09:00 - 09:30	Technology	Foreign Lang	Technology	Foreign Lang	Sports
09:30 - 12:00	Sports	Sports	Sports	Sports	
12:00 - 12:45	Lunch	Lunch	Lunch	Lunch	Lunch
12:45 - 13:15	Science	Science	Science	Science	Foreign Lang
13:45 - 14:15	Maltese	Maltese	Maltese	Maltese	Showers
14:15 - 15:30	Sports	Sports	Sports	Sports	
15:30 - 16:00	Showers	Showers	Showers	Showers	
16:00 - 16:30	Snack	Snack	Snack	Snack	

Total weekly hours: Sports coaching - 18 hours (62%); Academic coaching 11 hours (38%)

Time-Table for Years 10; 11; 12 and 13					
	Monday	Tuesday	Wednesday	Thursday	Friday
07:30 - 08:00	Breakfast	Breakfast	Breakfast	Breakfast	Breakfast
08:00 - 08:30	Maths	English	Maths	English	English
08:30 - 09:00	English	Maths	English	Maths	Maths
09:00 - 09:30	Subject 2	Subject 1	Subject 2	Subject 1	Sports
09:30 - 12:00	Sports	Sports	Sports	Sports	
12:00 - 12:45	Lunch	Lunch	Lunch	Lunch	Lunch
12:45 - 13:15	Subject 1	Subject 2	Technology	Subject 2	Subject 1
13:45 - 14:15	Maltese	Maltese	Maltese	Maltese	Showers
14:15 - 15:30	Sports	Sports	Sports	Sports	
15:30 - 16:00	Showers	Showers	Showers	Showers	
16:00 - 16:30	Snack	Snack	Snack	Snack	
Total weekly hours: Sports coaching - 18 hours (62%); Academic coaching 11 hours (38%)					

5.8 *School Facilities*

Following a visit to the National Sports School, carried out during March 2021, the following observations were made:

- The premises are well kept and there is no need for an extensive maintenance but there is a need for more investment in facilities.
- The school needs a facelift.
- The roof of the main building can be better utilized by adding more sports facilities.
- The present athletics track should be removed from its present allocation and integrated within the development of a new football pitch in the derelict area.
- One should consider having dormitories; rest areas and dining rooms for eventual live-ins.
- No filming facilities within the training areas exist; and training sessions are not filmed.
- Classrooms still have the whiteboards technology.
- One is to make sure that the progress made by the students is electronically kept and eventually forwarded to the coaches who will train the students once they leave the school.
- More investment is needed in the physiotherapy area.
- The nutritional and dietary aspects should be taken more seriously – the engagement of nutritionists (even on a part-time basis) is a must.
- Although the school focusses mainly on sports, the school should make sure that the necessary material, including the equipment used at the science oratories, will be equipped in the same way other mainstream schools are being equipped.

6. Recommendations

- ***School's Autonomy***

A Sports School is a very specialized institution and for it to deliver its main mission, it cannot be administered like any mainstream school.

Currently, the National Sports School falls under the jurisdiction of a College and is, for all intends and purposes, another normal mainstream school. This could lead to an increase in bureaucratic processes when it comes to investment and onerous when it comes to taking of decisions. This type of management style might manifest itself in hindrance for the school's administration to implement necessary initiatives.

It is thus being recommended that the National Sports School will be run autonomous from the present Colleges' structure.

There should be a Board of Governors, made of a chairperson and four Board Members. The Board of Governors should be answerable to the Minister responsible for Education. The Minister for Education will appoint the chairperson and two other Board members. Another Board member is to be nominated by the Minister responsible for Sports, while the other member should be nominated by the Malta Olympic Committee.

The answerability of the Board of Governors should be directly answerable to the Minister Responsible for Education. The Board of Governors will have the responsibility to propose to the Minister for Education, a periodic 5-year strategic plan for the School; oversee that the School administration is implementing the approved policies and oversee that the School administration is running the school in a professional manner.

For day to day management, the school should employ a Chief Executive Officer, who will be directly answerable to the Board of Governors.

Government should finance the operations of the School, both recurrent and capital expenditure, through a direct subvention.

6.2 ***School Campus***

The existing school building complex, although it could have served its purpose during this last decade, is going to be a bottleneck for the school to expand and meet the strategic plans which this report is proposing.

To transform the National Sports School into a state-of-the-art regional sports school, it is imperative to look for an alternative site where a new Sports School campus will be built.

The new Sports School Campus should be sited into a more central area of Malta, whereby one would go for a sports purpose building, and not refurbish an existing building. The site to be chosen must have ample grounds to build a "mini sports village", while catering for a higher intake of students.

The Sports Complex should include not just classrooms and indoor/ outdoor sports grounds/facilities, for various sports disciplines, but also clinics, canteens, audio visual center and dormitories, amongst other facilities.

It is a must that all training areas and training sessions, be filmed so that the coaches can discuss the techniques used by the students when they

were practicing their sports activities and thus improve on their techniques.

- ***Internationalization of the Sports Campus***

It is being recommended that in the building of this Sports Campus, one is to consider finding a strategic partner to invest and possibly administer this sports school complex.

Other Mediterranean countries/ regions have such sports campuses and these campuses are attractive to international students. Malta should study whether there are interested parties who are willing to not only invest but offer their expertise in this economic activity.

The idea of having an International Sports University, built on this campus should not be discarded.

6.4 ***Students' eligibility criteria to enroll to the Sports School***

The Sports School should mainly focus on the sports ability of the prospective student. Thus, more importance should be given on the sports abilities of the student.

It is being recommended that at least sixty-five percentage points of the assessment marks, should be assigned to the sports abilities of the prospective candidate.

Moreover, it is being recommended that each applicant, should undergo a one-week trial period before an assessment is given.

- ***Exit Criteria***

Assessing the capabilities of a student at a tender age of 11 year, is a mammoth task and there is a possibility that the promising student will fail to perform along the years.

All avenues for the student to opt out from the sports school and go to a mainstream school, in the eventuality that the student does not perform, should be an available option.

At present, such an option is not available.

It is being recommended that such an option be introduced as from the forthcoming scholastic year.

Any vacancy thus created, should be filled by another promising student who would have originally obtained the next highest marks during the one-week trial test.

6.6 ***Extending the school years***

At present, a student leaves the sports school at the age of 16, when he is still an amateur sportsman. There is a two-year gap, until the student reaches the 18 years of age when he/she can register as a semi-profession/ profession status.

Moreover, due to the cramped schedule of study and sports activities, a high percentage of such students find it difficult to cope with the academic studies.

It is thus being recommended that a student attending the sports school, will follow a 7-year course. The student will leave the school at the age of 18.

The two additional years, can either be an extension of the secondary school, for the student to sit for his SEC exams; or if he/she would have been successful to sit for the SEC exams at the 5th year, he/she would be given the opportunity to prepare for the MATSEC exams.

6.7 ***School hours***

The Sports school should adopt a holistic approach to prepare the student to become a professional athlete.

This entails, coaching the student not just from an academic and sport curriculum, but instill discipline; time-management and educate him to follow a healthy lifestyle.

It is thus being recommended that the school hours would be between 08:00 and 16:00 from Monday to Fridays.

The school will provide a healthy breakfast; lunch and a snack before leaving school. Following the school diet and eating at the school canteen facilities, should be a must and not an option which the student can decide whether to follow or not.

6.8 ***Training with local sports clubs***

The idea behind extending the school hours, is also intended to have the students engaged into a professional training environment, whereby the student will not be allowed to train with their clubs from Monday to Thursdays. The necessary training sessions that the student athlete needs, would have been covered by the training done at the school.

On Fridays and over the weekend, the athlete can join the club to play the competitive matches.

6.9 ***Competitive Sports***

The importance of participating at competitive matches, must be highlighted. Presently, the National Sports School, does not have its own teams participating at National level competitions organized by the individual Sports Associations. This is a missing link if one wants to have the formation of a complete athlete.

It is recommended that the Sports School should have its own various sports teams, which should participate in various National Associations' competitions.

6.10 ***Maintenance Students Grants/Stipends***

Students attending the sports school should be treated like all other students following courses at mainstream schools.

Thus, if the recommendation to extend the school years till the student reaches the age of 18, as from the age of 16, the students should also be

entitled to the students maintenance grants/stipends which other students attending the Junior Colleges, are getting.

6.11 ***Collaboration with National Sports Associations***

A pilot project, to start as from the scholastic year 2021/22, with the Aquatic Sports Association, will be launched.

Similar agreements should then be entered into with other Sports Associations.

6.12 ***A holistic approach to sports***

Sports should not be considered as an activity reserved for those aspiring to practice it at a competitive level or aspire to become elite athletes

Sports must be seen as one of the first building blocks for a healthy lifestyle; an important tool to address the issue of obesity.

To achieve such aims, one should seriously recommends having a more structured physical education sessions, FOR ALL, from an early age – thus having these sessions from pre-primary school education, right through to secondary level education.

One also recommends that there should be inter-school competitions, for a number of team sports' disciplines.

To achieve the utmost positive results from all such activity, the collaboration with Sports Associations is a must. Education Institutions and Sports Associations complement each other.

Finally, it is recommended that there should be in place a mechanism, short of having profession set-up in our sports clubs, for the promising students who would have successfully finished the National Sports School, at the age of 18, to join the Armed Forces Sports scheme.

In the eventuality that Malta would have its own Sports University, such promising athletes, could enroll with this University to continue to practice their sports leading to elite level. The Sports University would be ideal for individual sports disciplines.

Annex 1 – Proposal by the Malta Football Association

Annex 2 – Proposal by the Aquatic Sports Association

8. L-Onorevoli Dr Justyne Caruana
Ministru għall-Edukazzjoni

Sommarju tax-xhieda tal-Onorevoli Justyne Caruana

Data:	It-Ħamis 26 t'Awwissu 2021
Preżenti:	Dr George Hyzler, Kummissarju għall-Istandards fil-Ħajja Pubblika Charles Polidano, Direttur Ġenerali fl-uffiċċju tal-Kummissarju Dr Sarah Pace Warrington, Investigatur fl-uffiċċju tal-Kummissarju L-Onorevoli Dr Justyne Caruana, Ministru għall-Edukazzjoni
Post:	L-uffiċċju tal-Kummissarju
Għan:	Sabiex l-Onor. Caruana tixhed bil-ġurament kif mitlub fl-ittra ta' taħrika datata 9 t'Awwissu 2021 dwar il-każ K/036.

L-Onor. Caruana ħalfet bil-ġurament li tgħid is-sewwa.

Dwar il-konoxxenza tagħha tas-Sur Bogdanovic

Il-Ministru stqarret illi ilha taf lis-Sur Boganovic għal ħafna snin bħalma taf ħafna nies oħrajn, inkluż il-mara tiegħu u l-familja tagħha. Qalet li fl-2014 jew l-2015, kienet ħadmet miegħu fuq programm ta' inklużjoni max-Xewkija Tigers. Spjegat illi s-Sur Bogdanovic kien ħadem fuq programmi simili meta kien lagħab barra minn Malta. Il-Ministru stqarret li matul is-snin kien hemm okkażjonijiet oħrajn fejn ħadmu flimkien, per eżempju fuq proġetti tal-karità.

Stqarret illi meta saret Ministru għal Għawdex is-Sur Bogdanovic kien diġà qiegħed mal-istess Ministeru, u li qatt ma kellhom kuntatt dirett. Stqarret illi sabitu hemm u li kien daħal fi żmien meta l-Ministru kien Anton Refalo. Il-Ministru Caruana kkonfermat illi s-Sur Bogdanovic kien wieħed minn numru ta' nies li daħlu f'diversi skemi ta' xogħol f'Għawdex.

Stqarret illi meta ma baqgħetx Ministru, kienu jikkommunikaw, jitkellmu u jiltaqgħu, flimkien ma' nies oħra, fuq l-istrateġija politika tagħha.

Is-Sur Bogdanovic bħala membru tas-segretarjat tagħha

Il-Ministru Caruana spjegat li meta ġiet nominata bħala Ministru għall-Edukazzjoni, membri tat-tim tagħha bdew jidentifikaw nies biex jiffurmaw parti mis-segretarjat tagħha. Stqarret illi bħalma kien hemm nies oħra li ma komplewx bil-proċess, is-Sur Bogdanovic kien wera interess, imma qatt ma ġie iffinalizzat bħala membru tas-segretarjat.

Il-Ministru qalet li d-deċiżjoni li s-Sur Bogdanovic ma jkomplix bil-proċess biex isir parti mis-segretarjat ġiet miż-żewġ naħat. Mistoqsija għaliex, il-Ministru spjegat illi ħafna mix-xogħol tas-segretarjat tagħha għandu x'jaqsam mal-customer care. Qalet illi l-impenji tas-Sur Bogdanovic ma kienx kompatibbli max-xogħol tas-segretarjat, speċjalment minħabba l-ħinijiet involuti. Mistoqsija jekk forsi kien il-każ illi isem is-Sur Bogdanovic ġie sottomess lill-Uffiċċju

tal-Prim Ministru għall-approvazzjoni, u li din l-approvazzjoni ma ngħatatx, il-Ministru qalet li ma dehrilhiex li kien il-każ, però ma tidħolx fil-proċeduri hi.

Allegazzjonijiet dwar perkaċċi u benefiċċji li ngħataw lis-Sur Bogdanovic

Fir-rigward ta' perkaċċi u benefiċċji li allegatament ingħataw lis-Sur Bogdanovic, bħal 'tag' u business cards li indikaw li s-Sur Bogdanovic kien uffiċjal fis-segretarjat, il-Ministru spjegat illi kien hemm ċertu għaġla biex isiru l-affarijiet meta daħlet bħala Ministru tal-Edukazzjoni per l-affarijiet żgħar, in-"nitty gritties", ma tidħolx fihom u għalhekk ma setgħetx tagħti risposti dwarhom. Qalet però illi kien hemm ċertu għaġla, u ġimgħatejn wara li daħlu fil-Ministeru, missierha ġie ddijanjostikat b'marda serja, allura kien perjodu stressanti ħafna.

Fuq il-kwistjoni ta' dawn it-tags u cards, il-Ministru qalet: *"imma dan, skużani, skużani ħa ngħidlek imma fuq business cards, fuq tags, I wouldn't know".* Dwar l-allegazzjoni illi s-Sur Bogdanovic kellu xi perkaċċi rilatati mal-użu ta' telefown u laptop, il-Ministru qalet:

> "*Telephones ħadd ma ngħata, lanqas jien m'għandi telephone, jiena li nagħ…għadni kemm, għandi kemm tajt il-kontijiet, iġġifieri minn Novembru issa tajthom il-kontijiet. Il-…il-…it-telephone erm, din, li għandna safejn naf jien, jien, ic-chief of staff, u u ħadd mis-segretarjat, l-oħrajn m'għandhomx concession tat-telephone*".

Mistoqsija jekk dawn ikunu telephone allowance jew telephone fiżiku il-Ministru qalet:

> "*kull min għandu tiegħu [interruzzjoni] Il-concession safejn naf jien, parti mill-perks, jiena, iċ-chief of staff, il-head of secretariat għax lanqas għadu chief of staff, iġġifieri huma the high, the top ones that have it*".

Mistoqsija dwar l-użu ta' laptop, il-Ministru qalet "*li naf kellu wieħed mill-Ministeru għal Għawdex li qas tajtulu jien, iġġifieri, qas qatt ma dħalt fiha*".

Il-Ministru rrispondiet ukoll għall-allegazjoni illi s-Sur Bogdanovic mar magħha meta żaret il-Libja. Il-Ministru qalet illi hi marret il-Libja mas-Segretarji Permanenti tal-Ministeri tal-Edukazzjoni u tal-Affarijiet Barranin, kif ukoll ma' rappreżentant tal-MCAST. Stqarret illi kienet marret l-ajruport bix-xufier tagħha. Stqarret ukoll illi s-Sur Bogdanovic ma marx magħha l-ajruport, u li, la ma kienx parti mid-delegazzjoni li marret il-Libja, ma kellux għalfejn ikun l-ajruport. Spjegat illi hi għaddiet mill-VIP Ministerial Lounge fl-ajruport ta' Malta, li jirrikjedi awtorizzazzjoni.

Kwistjoni dwar il-preżenza tal-Ministru waqt logħba futbol

Il-Ministru ġiet mistoqsija ukoll dwar logħba futbol li saret f'Diċembru 2020, u li hi allegatament attendiet għaliha għaliex is-Sur Bogdanovic kien qed jilgħab, u weġġa' fil-kors ta' din il-logħba. Il-Ministru tat kuntest f'dan ir-rigward:

> *"Iva. Kont qatt ma mort nara logħba futbol jien f'ħajti. Mela, kont ħierġa minn ġimgħa l-isptar ma' missieri, kien hemm Johnny Camilleri Head of Secretariat, qalli isma', qalli għax inti ma tistax tkompli għaddejja hekk, mix-xogħol għad-dar, mid-dar għax-xogħol, qalli you need a break. Qalli isma', qalli ħa tiġi l-mara tiegħi għalik, qalli, kemm tgħaddu*

siegħa flimkien qalli imbagħad morru ħudu kafè. U jekk tgħidli min lagħab, x'għamlu u dan, ma nafx."

Mistoqsija dwar rapporti illi dakinhar, membri tal-pubbliku ma setgħux jidħlu jaraw il-logħba minħabba restrizzjonijiet biex tnaqqas it-tixrid tal-koronavirus, però li l-Ministru insistiet li tidħol, il-Ministru ċaħdet l-allegazzjoni:

"*Ma insistejtx li nidħol, ma insis... ma kellix għalfejn ninsisti nidħol jien. Jiena kull ma... kull ma kien hemm, din, qed ngħidlek kont għadni ġejja minn ġimgħa l-isptar għax missieri kien għadu kemm għamel biopsy. Tista'…tis…tista' [mhux ċar] id-dati."*

Mistoqsija x'kienet ir-raġuni li marret tara dik il-logħba partikolari il-Ministru rreferiet għat-trattament mediku li kien qed jingħata missierha u qalet li hu stess kien qalilha "*mur ħu nifs għax ma jistax ikun tkompli sejra hekk*".

Ir-rapport dwar l-Iskola Nazzjonali tal-Isport

Il-Ministru ġiet mistoqsija dwar id-deċiżjoni li jinkiteb rapport dwar l-Iskola Nazzjonali tal-Isport. Hi tat stampa tas-sitwazzjoni li waslet għad-deċiżjoni:

"*Mela, l-NSS* [National Sports School] *dejjem kienet hot potato, f'kull żmien, minn meta fetħet s'issa, u onestament meta sirt naf illi l-isports mhux taħti, għidt għall-erwieħ, ħa neħles minnha. Però ma kienx il-każ għaliex l-NSS mhijiex sports imma hija academic, education allura spiċċat ġo ħoġri. Iġġifieri, l-allegazzjonijiet, l-insinwazzjonijiet, kulħadd jaf x'inhuma. Meta dħalt fil-Ministeru, l-ewwel ħaġa li ġiet f'ħoġri, lejliet li ħa jiftħu l-applikazzjonijiet biex jidħlu l-istudenti, ġabuli quddiemi biex napprova il-bidla fil-kriterji."*

Mistoqsija jekk din kienet bidla fil-kriterji tal-ammissjoni tal-istudenti, il-Ministru qalet iva u kompliet tgħid:

"Issa int ħa tifhimni mill-ewwel, mela, għadni dieħla, jgħidu din ma taf xejn, m'għandhiex idea, ħa nagħtuha dawn, ħa tapprovahom. Ma rridx nimputa intenzjoni ħażina lil ħadd, però, erm, ma naħseb li ħadd ma seta' jippretendi li għadni dieħla u napprova xi ħaġa li naf li hija hot potato, u kulħadd jaf li hi hot potato."

Fuq talba tal-Kummissarju l-Ministru speċifikat li l-bidla fil-kriterji ġiet proposta *"min naħa taċ-ċivil"*, speċifikament mis-Segretarju Permanenti tal-ministeru, u ukoll mill-kap tal-Iskola Nazzjonali tal-Isport. Il-Ministru rreferiet ukoll għall-"*insinwazzjonijiet li kien hemm, u li jafhom kulħadd, kif tidħol, kif ma tidħolx, min jintgħażel, kif, eċċetera.*" Qalet ukoll li proprju lejlet li kellhom jiftħu l-applikazzjonijiet daħlulha xi rapporti anonimi dwar l-istess materja.

Il-Ministru kompliet tgħid:

"In the meantime ukoll, kelli meetings mal-MFA, l-ewwel ħaġa li qaltli, isma aħna ħerġin mill-NSS. Immaġina, il-bulk tal-, tal-NSS li huwa football, toħroġli mill-MFA hemmhekk, għadni dieħla bħala Ministru tal-Edukazzjoni, tista' timmaġina, x'...x'daqqa kont ser nieħu."

Mitluba tikkjarifika għaliex l-MFA riedu joħorġu mill-NSS, il-Ministru qalet "*Riedu joħorġu għax l-affarijiet ma kinux sew.*" Hija speċifikat li ma kenitx qed tirreferi biss għall-mod ta' kif l-istudenti jintgħażlu iżda għal "*ħafna affarijiet, ħafna affarijiet*". Dan wassalha biex tikkonkludi li kien hemm bżonn studju dwar l-iskola:

> "*Kompetenti miniex, jiena I'm not a sportsperson, I'm not a competent person. L-ewwel ħaġa li għamilt, għidt, għidt alright, mela nikkummissjunaw studju, rapport, biex jagħtuni snapshot, ħalli almenu nifhem x'hemm. U jiena nħobb nara l-affarijiet jien, imma I'm not competent to do it. U l-ewwel li ħsibna huwa li mmorru għal dawn id-ditti li mmorru ssoltu. Imbagħad konna qed nitkellmu ma' Bjorn* [Vassallo, il-president tal-MFA]*, kellimt ukoll ma' ma' ma', Joe* [Caruana Curran, il-president tal-Aquatic Sports Association]*, tal-…u speċi, u issa ħa nuża kelma, qaluli tkunx ċ--. Qaluli to catch a thief you need a thief, qaluli iġġifieri inutli tqabbad xi ditta, qaluli trid 'il xi ħadd illi, illi, he's on the ground, jaf l-affarijiet, is-settur eċċetera. U qaluli inti taf 'il xi ħadd? Għidtilhom heqq, indikawli u…nara hu. U taf int, kelma ġġib lill-oħra u speċi jiena, 'l Danijel Bogdanovic nafu. Tkellimna, semmejnieh, u speċi, eħe, he is the right person to do it. Però jien ma qgħadtx fuq dak is-suġġeriment biss, iġġifieri jekk xi ħadd jaħseb li jiena, the name cropped up u jiena just qgħadt fuq dak il-parir, mhux dak il-każ.*"

Mistoqsija jekk kienx il-każ mela, li hi ssuġġeriet lis-Sur Bogdanovic, u mhux ingħatat parir biex tqabbdu, il-Ministru qalet:

> "*Le le le, konna qed nitkellmu u ssemma Busuttil, issemma…issa jiena miniex intiża iġġifieri I wouldn't know, Justin Haber, insomma ssemmew ħafna nies. Dawn huma nies illi huma impjegati, apparti Danijel Bogdanovic, dawn l-oħrajn huma impjegati mal-…mal-aġenzija tal-litteriżmu, iġġifieri sibthom hemm, ma daħħal…, ma impjegajthomx jien…*"

Il-Ministru spjegat li l-aġenzija tal-litteriżmu tmexxi programm ta' qari relatat mal-isport u "*il-plejers tan-nazzjonal, prattikament huma impjegati hemmhekk.*" Kompliet tgħid:

> *Li għamilna imbagħad, through, through, through Paul Debattista għax jiena, ilni nafu snin, u malli bdejt fil-Ministeru jiena konsulent ilu għandi. Għamilna eżerċizzju kumparattiv. L-ewwelnett fuq l-esperjenza, però, erm, kriterju importanti illi ġibduli l-attenzjoni fuqu kienet illi ma jrid…dik il-persuna ma jrid ikollha x'taqsam xejn jew qatt ma kellha x'taqsam xejn mal-NSS. A totally, erm, a total outsider mill-…mis-sistema tal-NSS. U, u, fil-fatt sar rapport, sar-rapport, erm…u l-għażla saret hekk.*"

Fuq talba tal-Kummissarju, il-Ministru speċifikat li r-rapport kien dwar min kellu jintgħażel biex jagħmel l-istudju dwar l-Iskola Nazzjonali tal-Isport. Qalet li r-rapport kien "*a totally objective exercise.*"

Il-Kummissarju staqsa jekk il-Ministru kinitx talbet lil Dr Debattista biex ifassal terms of reference u kriterji tal-għażla, u jekk kinitx hi li tatu isem is-Sur Bogdanovic. Il-Ministru wieġbet:

> "*Iva, mela mela mela mela le. Ħa mmorru, mela. L-isem kien għandna, tajjeb? Però jiena ma striħajtx biss fuq isem. Ridt nagħmel evalwazzjoni biex nara jekk dan l-isem huwiex the right one, sewwa? U dik saret. Imbagħad ovvjament saru t-terms of reference tal-*

…tal-…tal-...ta' li ridt jiena, u u kien hemm, issa bħala kuntratti eċċetera, u hekk ma dħaltx fiha jien imma I wouldn't know. Però l-isem, l-isem, ma ġejtx bih jien waħdi. There were expert people who were indicating that he might be the right person, imma imbagħad, sar eżerċizzju biex naraw jekk hemmx persuni oħra li jistgħu jikkwalifikaw. U l-unika persuna li ma kellu x'jaqsam xejn mal-NSS, u bl-esperjenza barra u x'naf jien, dak ġie ikkonfermat minn dan l-eżerċizzju li sar li mind you, I didn't do it, I'm not competent to do it."

Wara l-ispjegazzjoni li tat, il-Ministru ġiet mistoqsija dwar it-terms of reference, li indikaw mhux biss l-idea li tittieħed 'snapshot' tas-sitwazzjoni, iżda anki li jitfassal pjan għall-futur tal-NSS. Il-Ministru kkonfermat dan:

"Yes as well, mela. U u u meta, meta erm bdew isiru l-laqgħat, Robert Magro, li huwa l-Head, tant faħhar l-eżerċizzju illi llum il-ġurnata, niltqagħu ta' spiss, jgħidli ħasra, marelli kemm konna sejrin tajjeb, ħasra."

Mistoqsija għalfejn l-eżerċizzju ma tkompliex minn ħaddieħor jekk kien daqshekk importanti, il-Ministru rrispondiet:

"Mela, mela, mela. Kien importanti ħafna però we missed the boat, ħa ngħidlek għalfejn. Għaliex aħna ridna, erm nagħmluh in a short period of time biex imbagħad inlaħħqu għas-sena skolastika li jmiss. Tajjeb? Issa we missed that boat għax aħna ċertu riformi ridna ndaħħluhom issa."

Mistoqsija jekk l-eżerċizzju setax jitkompla bil-ħsieb li jiġi implimentat fis-sena skolastika ta' wara, il-Ministru qalet:

"Ta' wara iva, imma jiena, immaġina, erm, b'kull intenzjoni tajba, u b'kull responsabbilta' għamilt dan l-eżerċizzju, tajjeb, imbagħad intefa' dan id-dell ikrah fuq dan l-eżerċizzju, immaġina kieku bdejt nimplimentah qabel ma jiġi eżawrit l-eżerċizzju hawnhekk."

Il-Kummissarju qal li qed jifhem illi l-proċess ta' implimentazzjoni ma setax isir peress illi l-eżerċizzju tal-NSS ma kienx komplut. Qal ukoll illi kellu diversi mistoqsijiet fuq l-eżerċizzju, fir-rigward ta' kif ingħata l-kuntratt, u r-riżultat tiegħu. Il-Ministru kompliet:

"Il-mod, il-mod ta' kif ingħata l-kuntratt, bl-awtorizzazzjoni, kien hemm il-proċess kollu taċ-ċivil, iġġifieri, jiena mhux l-ewwel darba li kont involuta erm, fi proċessi ta' kon...ta' ta' konsulenzi eċċetera iġġifieri dan għadda mill-proċess taċ-ċivil, erm, bl-awtorizazzjoni tal-Ministeru tal-Finanzi, erm, mhux tad-Dipartiment tal-Kuntratti għaliex huwa ammont relattivament żgħir, erm, illi safejn naf jien, ma tħallasx, jekk tħallas in, in in parti, erm, ir-rapport, mhux konkluż, però infurmata li kien hemm biżżejjed biex wieħed jista' qisu jibda' jaħdem fuqu. Imma, immaġina, kieku bdejt, jien duttura ħafna.

Il-Ministru qalet li hi għandha atteġġjament konservattiv fejn jidħol l-infiq ta' flejjes pubbliċi:

Jiena għandi riga, dejjem imxejt biha. Fil-fatt f'kull ministeru li kont, jiena dejjem ippruvajt nirregolarizza affarijiet li saru, mingħajr ma nitfa' dell ikrah fuq ħadd. Dejjem hekk għamilt. Jien anki jekk toqgħod tara kemm għandi konsulenti jew kemm kelli

konsulenti, mill-inqas. Kuntratti li tajt? Mill-inqas. Jien dejjem hekk ħdimt. Li nista' nagħmel jien ma ntihx lilek tagħmlu. Anke affarjiet legali, min jaf kemm għam…min jaf kemm ktibt liġijiet jiena biex ma nħallsux, biex ma nonfqux flus żejda. Jekk tiġi tara l-uffiċju tiegħi, aqqas…xejn ma biddilt. Iġġifieri qatt ma nfaqt one cent. Lil kull Permanent Secretary li kelli, naħseb tistgħu ssejħulhom, jien dejjem imxejt biex ma nonfoqx flus, l-NAO, tal-NAO jgħidlek. Jien b'one cent nipprova nġib ta' five. U għalhekk imbagħad inħossni daqxejn, mhux urtata ta, erm, imma tweġġa'. Tweġġa'. U aqqas dħalt f'pagamenti, iġġifieri jien, ma …ma kkwantifikajtx…"

Lejn l-aħħar tal-laqgħa il-Ministru ġiet mistoqsija min kienu l-esperti li ddiskutew isem is-Sur Bogdanovic għal dan il-proġett. Ikkonfermat illi dawn kienu Bjorn Vassallo tal-MFA u Joe Caruana Curran tal-ASA. Qalet ukoll illi kellmu lil *"nies oħrajn iġġifieri nies oħrajn, nipprova...imma nies involuti fl-isports iġġifieri jiena miniex, jekk tgħidli sports qisek qed tgħidli, jien naf, xi ħaġa aljena, I'm not into it. Imma… inti tħabbat l-ideat. Ovvjament, erm, imbagħad għamilna dak l-eżerċizzju biex naraw jekk iffittjax fil-…fil-…jew jekk kienx hemm nies oħajn li setgħu jiffittjaw. Dika wkoll. Dika għen Dr Debattista għax jiena miniex…"*

Ikkonfermat illi l-irwol ta' Dr Debattista kien:

"Ridna naraw, ridna naraw jekk jekk, erm, ħa ngħidlek, normalment meta inti tagħżel xi ħadd biex jagħmillek xi ħaġa, iġġifieri jiena, hija l-prerogattiva tal-Ministru, tajjeb? Iġġifieri jiena dejjem hekk għamilt, iġġifieri jekk ridt nagħmel xi ħaġa fuq din, nara min hu l-aħjar, u dejjem hekk sar. Ħadd qatt ma kkwesċinjali xi ħadd, tajjeb, però f'dan il-każ erm, jerġa' morna oltre minn hekk, biex inkunu ċerti illi, l-ewwelnett l-NSS għidtlek, it's a hot potato, it's a hot potato. U mhix, mhix, it's still hot, iġġifieri meta tmur hemmhekk, hemm potenzjal enormi u l-iskola mhix qed tipproduċi l-atleti li skont il-mission statement tagħha stess, erm, per eżempju inti għandek, erm, kont hemmhekk għall-graduation. Għandek min qed jara l-iskola as a platform biex jkomplu fil-…fil-…fl-isports, għandek oħrajn għaliex akkademikament it-tfal huma iktar sheltered, u allura jistgħu jipprogredixxu akkademikament, imma aħna x'irridu minn din l-iskola? Erm, illi mmexxu fuq l-akkademja jew fuq l-isports? Il-focus għandu jkun fuq l-isports, fil-fehma tiegħi. Però il-kif, imbagħad, ma nistax nasal għalihom waħdi. I'm not, I'm not competent to do it, għandi kompetenzi oħrajn, għandi s-sens komun iva, but I don't have the knowledge about these things, bħalma m'għandix f'affarijiet oħra iġġifieri, fil-visual and performing arts l-istess ħaġa, I'm not competent, qatt ma kantajt, qatt ma żfint…żfint iva imma kont żgħira, erm, imma trid nies illi huma on the ground."

Ikkonfermat ukoll illi c-chief of staff tas-segretarjat tagħha huwa Steve Mifsud, li kien Brussell u daħal ħafna wara li bdew fil-Ministeru, ċioe fis-sena 2021.

It-Terminazzjoni tal-Kuntratt

Il-Kummissarju spjega illi hu kien fehem illi l-Prim Ministru ordna illi l-kuntratt jiġi tterminat fit-23 ta' Marzu 2021, u li fl-istess ġurnata, il-kuntratt ġie tterminat mis-Segretarju Permanenti, u s-Sur Bogdanovic ġie mitlub biex jissottometti x-xogħol li kien lest sa dak il-punt. Kompla jispjega illi dan ir-rapport li ġie ippreżentat, liema rapport kull xhud stqarr li ma kienx iffinalizzat, kellu paġna ta' quddiem (kopertina), konklużjonijiet, u sommarju eżekuttiv. Il-Kummissarju spjega illi mhijiex normali illi l-konklużjonijiet jitlestew qabel ir-riċerka (dan peress illi kulħadd, inkluż is-Sur

Bogdanovic, ikkonferma illi kien fadal riċerka x'isir). Fid-dawl tal-kwistjoni illi parti kbira ta' dak ir-rapport ma nkitibx mis-Sur Bogdanovic, il-Kummissarju staqsa jekk is-Sur Bogdanovic irċieva xi għajnuna, jew jekk xi ħadd ingħata xi għajnuna biex jikteb ir-rapport. Il-Ministru rrispondiet: "*No. L-unika, l-unika erm, erm, sostenn, ejja ngħidulu hekk, li kien hemm, għaliex, u nafha through Paul, għaliex biex jidħol l-NSS, biex, biex ikun hemm intervisti u dan, ried ikun hemm xi ħadd ieħor miegħu minħabba, erm ma nafx, data protection, whatever, what have you, iġġifieri…"*. Il-Ministru ġiet mistoqsija jekk kienet qed tirreferi għall-intervisti li saru fl-NSS u li għalihom preżumibbilment Dr Debattista kien preżenti għalihom. Il-Ministru wieġbet: *"Dak l-uniku sostenn illi naf li kien hemm addizzjonali, jekk nistgħu nsejħulu hekk".*

Mistoqsjia jekk hija stramba illi konsulent jattendi bħala sostenn, il-Ministru wieġbet: *"Imma ħa ngħidlek, erm, jiena konsulent wieħed biss għandi, mhux kwistjoni ta'…ħela kieku għandi xi erba' konsulenti…".*

Il-Kummissarju qal illi kienet tkun ħela fil-kuntest illi xi ħadd li xogħolu ta' kuljum huwa ta' messaġġier jitqabbad biex jagħmel rapport. Il-Ministru qalet:

> "*Iġġifieri meta qed nitkellmu, meta qed nitkellmu fuq rapporti oħrajn, qas biss jgħaddili minn rasi li nqabbad xi ħadd b'dawk, dak il-background, imma dan kien sports-related, u meta konna qed nitkellmu…iġġifieri jiena, I'm not an expert, meta kont qed nitkellem man-nies li jifhmu, dana man-nies li jifhmu konna qed nitkellmu iġġifieri, kieku kont qed nitkellem ma' xi ħadd bħali ngħid fiha u ma fihiex, imma that that that was it u u onestament, rapporti jsiru ħafna. U ninkwieta meta jsiru rapporti u ma jiġux implementati. F'dan il-każ, l-Education isiru ħafna rapporti, anke sal-bieraħ stess, sal-bieraħ stess kelli laqgħa importanti fuq ir-riforma tal-MATSEC u qed jirreferuni għal xi rapport li sar erm, xi ħames, sitt snin ilu li ma twettaq xejn. Issa jiena f'dan il-każ, jiena li ridt, illi jkun hemm xi ħadd, li jifhem, li jmurli hemmhekk, jarali x'hemm, u ħa, ħa, ħa nkun, ħa nuża l-kel… hemmhekk, l-allegazzjonijiet hu, hu, hu li hemm duda. Jien, in-nies ma nafhomx. Bilfors irrid ikolli 'l xi ħadd illi ġej minn dik id-dinja. It's a totally unknown world to me."*

Il-Kummissarju esprima dubju dwar kemm ir-rapport li sar jindirizza l-kwistjoni tad-"duda". Semma' l-inklużoni fir-rapport ta' rakkomandazzjonijiet dwar it-timetable tal-istudenti u dettalji dwar il-persentaġġi ta' studenti li ħadu ċerti suġġetti. Il-Kummissarju staqsa jekk persuna li xogħolu huwa ta' footballer kellux jidħol fil-qasam akkademiku. Il-Ministru rrispondiet: "*Jekk din waqt l-eżerċizzju li kien qed jagħmel, irriskontraha, allaħares ma highlightjahiex*". Kompliet:

> "*Jiena kieku kelli rapport konkluż ovvjament wieħed kien ukoll, jiena dejjem hekk nagħmel, fil-fatt kellna, erm, għandna għandna konferenza issa dalwaqt fuq id-dokumenti illi rrivedejna, iġġifieri ħa jkun hemm, apparti konsultazzjoni pubblika, ikun hemm, għadna kemm għamilna per eżempju, strateġija oħra illi għandna laqgħa ta' konsultazzjoni interna, iġġifieri once li, kieku kelli rapport komplut jiena hekk kont ser nagħmel iġġifieri, nara imbagħad mal-istakeholders kollha u u u, u nħabbtu dan ir-rapport. Però, il-…id-dubju li hemm għaliex hu u mhux ħaddieħor, nerġa' ngħidlek, l-isem ma ġejtx bih waħdu, waħdi, imma imbagħad sar eżerċizzju biex naraw jekk l-għażla hijiex idonea jew le. U naħseb qalilkom Dr Debattista li għamilna eżerċizzju kumparattiv u u min kien hawn u min kien hemm."*

Il-Kummissarju irrisponda illi Dr Debattista qal illi l-Ministru talbitu biex jagħmel terms of reference u kriterji, li għamilhom, u imbagħad il-Ministru ssottomettietlu isem is-Sur Bogdanovic. Dan kien il-kuntrarju ta' dak li stqarret u ċioe, illi isem is-Sur Bogdanovic ġie propost għall-kunsiderazzjoni jew "stress tested". Il-Ministru irrispondiet:

"Ara, bħala segwenza ejja ngħidu ma kinitx daqshekk, waħda wara l-oħra, ejja ngħidu li kien qed isir kollox f'daqqa. Erm, iġġifieri, mhux biex immeri lil Dr Debattista jew għandi r-raġuni, imma kien qed isir kollox fl-istess, fl-istess, qisu fl-istess ħinijiet. Però iċ-ċirkostanzi kienu dawn, iġġifieri, mhijiex kwistjoni li tajt kuntratt lil xi ħadd li naf. Dik jien ma naċċetahiex. I'm sorry. Qatt ma imxejt hekk. U qatt mhu ser nimxi hekk. Jien qatt ma ħallatt ħaġa ma' oħra."

Kwistjoni ta' jekk il-Ministru għandhiex relazzjoni mas-Sur Bogdanovic

Il-Kummissarju staqsa l-Ministru jekk għandha relazzjoni mas-Sur Bogdanovic, jew jekk kellha relazzjoni miegħu dak iż-żmien. Il-Ministru rrispondiet: *"Ma kellix. Ma kellix. Ma kellix. Issa, ħbiberija, għandi kemm trid."*

Il-Kummissarju staqsa jekk il-Ministru fehmitx għalfejn poġġa d-domanda. Hija qalet:

"Ħeqq imma ħa ngħidlek, qed, qed niċħad li kien hemm xi relazzjoni u qed ngħidlek hekk għaliex kollox qisu it boils down to that point. Issa. Il-ħajja tie…il-ħajja politika tagħna, hija dinja tal-irġiel. Kull meta sifirt barra minn Malta, membri staff tal-irġ…irġiel kienu li ġew miegħi. Jekk tara l-istaff comp… complement tiegħi, il-biċċa l-kbira huma rġiel. Il-konsulenti tiegħi huma rġiel. Il-Heads of Secretariat li dejjem kelli huma rġiel. Din hija dinja tal-irġiel."

Il-Ministru qalet ukoll:

"... li kieku kont raġel jien, issa jiena narahom il-kollegi tiegħi, min jieħu ritratt ma' dik u min jieħu ritratt mal-oħra, għal dawk ħadd ma jgħid xejn. Imma jiena jekk inkun, jien naf, qiegħda x'imkien u nieħu drink ma' xi ħadd, eh qegħda ma' dak. Issa ovvjament hemm il-fatt li llum jiena separata. Eqq. Mid-dar għax-xogħol u mix-xogħol għad-dar jien."

Il-Kummissarju staqsa lill-Ministru jekk tifhem li ċ-ċirkostanzi li ġew ppubblikati jagħtu wieħed x'jifhem illi hemm din ir-relazzjoni. Il-Ministru rrispondiet:

"I'm an easy target. I'm an easy target. Kien hemm il-kumplikazzjoni ta' ta'...ta' li kelli separazzjoni allura sakemm kont miżżewġa qisu wieħed. L-istess affarijiet bħal meta kont miżżewġa qed nagħmel. Jekk kont insiefer mal-Head of Secretariat li dakinhar kien raġel, illum kieku kelli nerġa' nsiefer… mhux raġel ukoll? Pero dakinhar kont miżżewġa u illum miniex..miniex, I mean, separat."

F'dan l-istadju il-Kummissarju qal illi jaf li jeżistu filmati li ma talabhomx, u li l-Ministru taf dwarhom ukoll għaliex bdiet proċeduri legali kontra l-ex mara tas-Sur Bogdanovic minħabba 'stalking'. Il-Ministru rrispondiet billi ddeskriviet l-inkontri li kellha mal-ex mara tas-Sur Bogdanovic u r-raġunijiet għaliex ħasset li kellha tagħmel kwerela lill-pulizija.

Il-Kummissarju staqsa jekk dawn il-filmati juru lill-Ministru dieħla d-dar tas-Sur Bogdanovic f'ċertu ħin ta' bil-lejl. Il-Ministru rrispondiet:

> *"Mela mess, mela messha, mela messha, mela messha ġabet il-filmati kollha tiegħi għand in-nies. Għax jien, parti minn xogħoli li nidħol għand in-nies. Issa meta kien hemm iċ-ċirkostanzi tal-Covid, tajjeb, għandu dħalt, għand Johnny Camilleri dħalt, għand Andrew Refalo dħalt, għand Stephen Gauci dħalt, iġġifieri dawn huma nies li jien naħdem magħhom kuljum. Jiena politiku. Apparti x-xogħol tal-Ministeru, jien għandi x-xogħol tal-kostitwenza. Eh x'nagħmel? Ma mmurx inħabbat bibien? Ma mmurx għand in-nies? Il-...il-kuntest, faċli tgħid li dħalt għand raġel. Dar ta' raġel jew ġo dar ta' mara. Imma hemm ukoll il-fattur tal-kredibbiltà. Jien miniex dak it-tip li noqgħod nidħol ġod-dar tan-nies, skużi il-kelma, biex noqgħod nagħmel affarijiet inappropriate. I go there because I have to do something, related, to my…to my job. Issa, jekk hemm xi insinwazzjoni ta' relazzjoni, jiena llum miniex, miniex, miniex tifla żgħira. L-adulti meta jkollhom relazzjoni, jmorru jgħixu flimkien, ma nafx x'jagħmlu jien, I mean, that's what they usually do. Jiena ngħix id-dar m'ommi, qabel ma miet missieri kont ngħix ma' missieri ukoll. Iġġifieri ommi, missieri, jien u t-tfal. Illum, ommi, jien u t-tfal."*

Il-Ministru tat kuntest dwar il-familja tal-Ilmentatriċi u kkaratterizzat x'setgħet kienet il-motivazzjoni għas-sottomissjoni tal-ilment. Kompliet billi qalet:

> *"It's not fair, it's not fair. It's not fair. U jiena għax inkun nieħu kafè ma' xi ħadd, u xi ħadd jeħodli ritratt iġġifieri qiegħda ma' xi ħadd? Meta jien parti minn xogħoli…allaħares ma nagħmilx kuntatt man-nies. Jiena l-ħin… aħna qisna mejda tal-qubbajd. Issa sfortunatament, aħna, erm, kienet qalthieli Giovanna Debono din. Illi, illi, speċi raġel jgħaddi kollox, u aħna għax nisa trid, trid, erm, you have to prove yourself il-ħin kollu, trid tkun qisek il-…il-…il-…ix-xemgħa il-ħin kollu, ma tistax b'xi mod jew ieħor. Issa jien dħalt fil-politika żgħira. Eqq, eqq. X'nagħmel, ma nilbisx? X'nagħmel, ma…ma…ma…ma nkunx mara normali? Għax lili ukoll jgħiduli, għax…anke l-apparenza tiegħek taħdem kontra tiegħek. Imma x'ħa nagħmel jien? Nagħmel il-…il-…il-velu?"*

Il-Ministru qalet ukoll *"it all boils down to this. There's a person trying to harm me għax qed taħseb li għamiltilha xi…għamilt xi ħaġa lilha. Which is not the case. Issa jekk jiena għamilt xi ħaġa ħażina fix-xogħol tiegħi, tajjeb li niġi quddiemek u tiskrutinizzani, imma allegazzjonijiet bħal dawn…allaħares…din sitwazzjoni perikoluża immens".*

It-Terminazzjoni tal-Kuntratt

Mistoqsija dwar it-terminazzjoni tal-kuntratt mill-Prim Ministru, li jidher illi saret malajr u li ġiet mħabbra pubblikament, il-Ministru rrispondiet:

> *"Ifhimni, jiena, il-Prim Ministru, jekk ħa dik id-deċiżjoni li ħass li kellu jeħodha għamel sew. Però, il-…il-hype illi inqala'…u jien ma ntihx tort. Eqq dan qala' kjass, qisu tajt xi kuntratt ta' ta' ħmistax-il elf fix-xahar. Għax il-…il-…il-mod ta' kif ġiet…dan, taf inti, id-direct orders jiġu ppubblikati. Iġġifieri kieku, kieku kien hemm xi ħadd ried jaħbi xi ħaġa, sorry ta, erm, hemm mod u mod ta' kif wieħed jaħbiha. Erm, seta' ġie spezzettat b'tali mod u manjiera u ma jiġix ppubblikat. Dan ma kien hemm… ma kienx hemm xejn hawn x'naħbu. Għax ġie ppubblikat fuq il-gazzetta tal-Gvern. L-impressjoni li ngħatat fuq il-*

gazzetti, li kien xi xogħol, erm, xi, xi, xi, xi xogħol ma nafx, erm jibqa' għaddej, u kull xahar jitħallas so much. Fil-verità it was just a task. Issa l-Prim Ministru ttih tort illi kien hemm dak il-kjass fuq il-gazzetti, u b'xi mod jew ieħor ried, ried, ried jokkontejnjaha? Anzi, jien anke meta ġejt biex irriżenjajt, jien stess għidtlu, għidtlu mhux ħa nkun il-liability tiegħek jiena, ma tarax għadek tibda Prim Ministru. U offrejtlu r-riżenja. Avolja affarijiet li ma kellix x'naqsam jien. U rriżultaw bl-iktar mod ċar illum wara…Politiku responsabbli hekk jaġixxi. Jieħu d-deċiżjonijiet li huma fl-aħjar interess u skont iċ-ċirkostanzi, u għamel sew".

Il-Kummissarju kompla u qal illi l-Prim Ministru qal pubblikament illi ttermina il-kuntratt, imma li formalment il-kuntratt ġie tterminat mis-Segretarju Permanenti tal-Ministeru għall-Edukazzjoni. Il-Ministru qablet u qalet:

"u safejn naf jien kien hemm anke ittra li erm…ma…mhinix ċerta imma jekk hux għal dik jew għal xi ħaġ'oħra ta…illi qed jiġi…illli qed juri li mhux interessat, ma nafx jekk hux għal dan il-każ jew għax…"

Il-Kummissarju reġa' staqsa u kkjarifika d-domanda, ċioe jekk l-ordni għat-terminazzjoni ġiet mingħand il-Ministru, jew jekk is-Segretarju permanenti ħa l-ordni dirett mill-Prim Ministru. Il-Ministru rrispondiet illi saru t-taħdidiet u imbagħad ittieħdet id-deċiżjoni.

Sommarju magħmul minn: Dr Sarah Pace Warrington

Data tal-aħħar reviżjoni: 27 t'Ottubru 2021

Sommarju ta’ laqgħa għall-finijiet tal-artiklu 18(3) tal-Kap. 570

Każ: K/036

Data: 1 t’ Ottubru 2021

Preżenti: Dr George Hyzler, Kummissarju għall-Istandards fil-Ħajja Pubblika
Charles Polidano, Direttur Ġenerali fl-uffiċċju tal-Kummissarju
Dr Sarah Pace Warrington, Investigatur u Analista fl-uffiċċju tal-Kummissarju

L-Onorevoli Dr Justyne Caruana, Ministru għall-Edukazzjoni

Il-Kummissarju spjega l-proċedura tal-investigazzjonijiet tiegħu. Spjega illi qabel ma jikkonkludi rapport, għandu obligu ta’ *disclosure*. Spjega illi jekk il-Ministru tkun trid iżżid mal-provi dan ikun possibbli. Il-Kummissarju qal li filwaqt illi l-liġi ma tispeċifikax li persuna taħt investigazzjoni tista’ tressaq xhieda, jekk il-Ministru tixtieq ittella’ xhud ieħor, dan ikun possibbli ukoll.

Il-Ministru ġiet murija erba’ files ta’ provi, tnejn minnhom ta’ dokumentazzjoni li jinkludu xhieda fil-forma ta’ traskrizzjoni jew sommarji. Il-Kummissarju fakkar lill-Ministru illi hemm reġistrazzjonijiet ta’ kull laqgħa ma’ kull xhud fil-każ li jkun hemm bżonn li ssir riferenza għalihom. L-aħħar żewġ files kienu ta’ emails ipprintjati mill-mailbox tas-Sur Bogdanovic, li ġie pprovdut mill-MITA. Il-Kumissarju spjega illi kien hemm ħafna iktar *emails* minn dawk inklużi fil-files, għaliex dawk l-emails li dehru irrelevanti għall-każ ġew esklużi u mhumiex ser jintużaw għall-iskopijiet tar-rapport finali.

Il-Kummissarju kompla jgħid illi dak li mhuwiex strettament rilevanti għall-każ mhux ser jiġi ppubblikat.

Il-Ministru qagħdet fl-uffiċċju tal-Kummissarju biex tara l-materjal ta’ ġol-files, b’membru tal-istaff tal-Kummissarju preżenti. Hija damet madwar erba’ sigħat. Meta spiċċat informat lid-Direttur Ġenerali li xtaqet tippreżenta sottomissjonijiet fid-dawl tal-evidenza li kienet rat, iżda kienet għadha ma ddeċidietx jekk għandhiex tagħmel dan bil-fomm jew bil-miktub. Ġie miftiehem li sal-Erbgħa 6 ta’ Ottubru 2021 hija kienet se tinforma lill-uffiċċju tal-Kummissarju kif xtaqet tipproċedi.

Sommarju magħmul minn: Dr Sarah Pace Warrington

Data tal-aħħar reviżjoni: 4 t’Ottubru 2021

GOVERNMENT OF MALTA
MINISTER FOR EDUCATION

22 ta' Ottubru 2021

Dr George Hyzler
Kummissarju għall-Istandards fil-Ħajja Pubblika
11, Triq San Pawl
Valletta

Għażiż Kummissarju,

Rif: Każ K/036 - Ingaġġ tas-sur Danijel Bogdanovic mal-Ministeru għall-Edukazzjoni

Riferribilment għat-talba tiegħi biex nagħmel sottomissjonijiet finali, qed nissottometti bir-rispett is-segwenti:

A. Il-każ

1. Dan il-każ ġie skattat fuq żewġ lanjanzi:
- Ta' Arnold Cassola.
- Ta' Alison Bogdanovic/Apap.

2. Illi riferribilment għall-ewwel lanjanza tal-Profs Arnold Cassola, l-ilment huwa għaliex il-sottofirmata allegatament tat kuntratt - fi kliem il-Profs Cassola - 'lil boyfriend'. Il-provi mressqa kienu jikkonsistu f'artikoli li dehru fil-gażżetti.

3. Illi riferribilment għat-tieni lanjanza l-punti ewlenin imressqa fl-ilment huma marbuta essenzjalment ma' :
- allegat ingaġġ u perkaċċi ta' l-ex żewġha
- allegati *direct orders* lil ħuħ

u dan in konsegwenza ta' allegazzjoni ta' relazzjoni bejn is-sottofirmata u l-ex żewġha.

4. Illi dwar it-tieni lanjanza, ix-xhud ewlenija kienet appuntu Alison Bogdanovic/Apap;

 Great Siege Road, Floriana, Malta
T +356 2598 1001 **M** +356 9944 0470 **E** justyne.caruana@gov.mt
www.education.gov.mt

5. Illi mill-inkartament tal-proċess jirriżultaw xhieda oħrajn biex appuntu jiġu verifikati l-fatti iżda pero' jidher li dawn ix-xhieda ma' tressqux mill-persuna li ressqeet l-ilment.

6. Illi dawn ix-xhieda inter alia kienu : Rappreżentanti tad-District Operations, Sur Frank Fabri Segretarju Permanenti Ministeru tal-Edukazzjoni, is-Sur John Borg Segretarju Permanenti Ministeru għal Għawdex, Daniel Bogdanovic, Dr Paul Debattista, Glenn Micallef, Johnny Camilleri, informazzjoni miksuba mill-MITA, Kummissarju tat-Taxxi Nterni, Joyce Cassar u ohrajn u kif ukoll is-sottofirmata li meta tajt ix-xhieda tiegħi kien għad ma kellix kunjizzjoni tax-xhieda mogħtija mill-istess Alison Bogdanovic/Apap u tal-inkartament tal-proċess.

B. Il-provi

7. ILLI Alison Bogdanovic/Apap tat xhieda pjuttost estensiva u bil-ġurament ibbażata fuq allegazzjonijiet foloz, inveritieri u motivati kemm minn malafede u iktar minn hekk bi spirtu ta' vendetta fil-konfront tas-sottofirmata għal cirkostanzi li jien sottofirmata ma għandi ebda konnessjoni magħhom u inqas u inqas tajt lok għalihom.

8. ILLI filwaqt li dak kollu li ntqal minn Alison Bogdanovic/Apap qed jigi kkontestat bil-qawwa kollha, il-biċċa l-kbira ta' dak kollu li xehdet bil-ġurament kien ukoll fil-gażżetti u kien ta' konsum pubbliku. Minkejja li bil-ġurament tagħha ddikjarat li ma kienitx hi li forniet l-informazzjoni lill-gażżetti, mix-xhieda tagħha jirriżulta ampjament li dak kollu li ħolqot u vvintat kienet hi stess li għaddietu lill-ġurnalisti u/jew assigurat li dan isir tramite 'ħbieb' tagħha . Jingħad li meta bdew jidhru l-istejjer fil-gażżetti, is-sottofirmata stiednet lill-press biex isiru l-verifiki meħtieġa min-naħa tagħhom u li appena dawn saru, l-istejjer waqfu ħesrem.

9. ILLI l-qlajjiet personali marbuta ma' allegazzjonijiet ta' relazzjonijiet extra maritali, [redacted] u istanzi oħrajn jixhdu kemm il-persuna li għamlet l-ilment ibbażat l-azzjoni tagħha fuq pettegolizzi maħluqa u mxerrda minnha stess li għalihom trid tassumi r-responsabilita'.

10. Illi jiżdied jingħad – u dan fuq ammissjoni tagħha stess – li għal xhur sħaħ Alison Bogdanovic/Apap ippersegwitatni, tiġri warajja, taqla qlajjiet, tavviċina membri tal-familja tiegħi u dan f'mumenti sensittivi bħal marda terminali ta' missieri li f'temp ta' sitt ġimgħat (20 ta' Diċembru 2020 – 6 ta' Frar 2021) tilef ħajtu. [redacted]

11. ILLI meta jien sottofirmata wasalt f'punt li bdejt nibża' minn dan il-fastidju assidwu u ossessjonat, irrikorrejt għall-protezzjoni legali bħal kull ċittadin ieħor billi għamilt kwerela lill-Pulzija u eventwalment ittieħdu passi ġudizzjarji

kemm fil-konfront ta' Alison Bogdanovic/Apap kif ukoll fil-konfront ta' membru tal-familja tagħha li wkoll kienet ripetutament involuta fil-fastidju fil-konfront tiegħi.

12. Illi għall-darb'oħra u bl-aktar mod malizjuż, Alison Bogdanovic/Apap reġgħet irrikorriet għall-media biex tipprova tikseb vantaġġ u simpatija billi tallega abbuż ta' poter min-naħa tiegħi għaliex tlabt il-protezzjoni legali kif kelli kull dritt li nagħmel bħal kull ċittadin ieħor.

13. Illi l-proċeduri ġew irtirati minn naħa tiegħi peress li temporanjament kien waqaf il-fastidju. Dan il-fastidju reġa' beda ftit wara li waqqaft il-proċeduri u għadu jippresisti b'iktar assidwita' sal-lum. Il-fatt tal-insegwiment u tal-fastidju ġie kkonfermat minn Alison Bogdanovic/Apap stess f'dawn il-proċeduri u kien ukoll fil-ġurnali lokali presumibbilment fuq informazzjoni ta' Alison Bogdanovic/Apap stess.

C. <u>Osservazzjonijiet</u>

14. ILLI filwaqt li dwar gideb ta' natura personali, dawn qed jiġu miċħuda bil-qawwa kollha, u li huma estranej għall-funzjoni ta' dan l-uffiċċju, allura ser niffoka fuq allegazzjonijiet marbuta mal-irwol pubbliku tiegħi - in partikolari dak ta' Ministru. Ovvjament is-sottomissjonijiet tiegħi ser ikunu limitati għal dawk l-allegazzjoni li dwarhom għandi kunjizzjoni tagħhom. Allegazzjonijiet oħra li ma għandix kunjizzjoni tagħhom, se mai kellhom jiġu sostanzjati.

15. ILLI hemm punti li tajjeb li jiġu ċċarati *ab initio*:

a. Il-karozza GM 25 tinsaq biss mix-xufier Felix Cutajar ID [redacted] M – ħadd qatt ma saq din il-vettura, la bin-numru GM u lanqas mingħajru.

b. Il-Libja morna fil-għodu u ġejna filgħaxija fl-14 ta' Diċembru 2020. Meta ħarġet l-istorja fil-ġurnali saret *'right of reply'* konġunta bejn il-Ministeru għall-Edukazzjoni u l-Ministeru tal-Affarijiet Barranin u Ewropej. Daniel Bogdanovic ma kienx parti mid-delegazzjoni uffiċċjali u ma ġiex l-Libja.

c. Allegazzjoni dwar każ ta' serq ta' mobile u dwar allegat involviment tiegħi biex ma jittieħdux proċeduri kontra min għamel dan ir-reat, qed niċħadha bil-qawwa kollha u jien totalment estraneja għal każ. Dan il-każ kien issemma wkoll fil-ġurnali lokali.

d. Mhux minnu li użajt jew eżerċitajt pressjoni biex nidħol fil-ground biex insegwi logħba futbol. Bħal kull membru parlamentari ieħor, aħna għandna aċċess bħala VIP's u hemm żona riservata għalina.

e. Mhux minnu li tajt xi direct orders għall-xogħolijiet lil Goran Bogdanovic – kull direct order tiġi pubblikata fuq il-Gazzetta tal-Gvern u allura faċilment tista'

tiġi verifikata. Dan ukoll kien issemma fil-gażżetti u ssemmew figuri eżorbitanti ta' mijiet ta' eluf ta' ewro.

f. Mhux minnu li żidt il-paga b'€500 lil Daniel Bogdanovic – dan irriżulta mix-xhieda tar-rappreżentant tad-District Operations Ltd.

g. Mhux minnu li Daniel Bogdanovic ingħata xi perkaċċi ta' użu ta' karozza, fuel u mobile. Riferribilment għal-vetturi ġie ampjament ikkonfermat li dawn jintużaw minn diversi persuni u skont il-bżonn u ħtieġijiet tax-xogħol. Dwar perkaċċi oħra qed issir riferenza għax-xhieda mogħtija minn Dr Frank Fabri li kkonferma li ma hemmx.

h. Illi riferribilment għal dati u ġranet imsemmija f'Diċembru, Jannar u Frar dwar allegati inkontri, ngħid biss li missieri ddaħħal l-isptar il-Ħadd 20 ta' Diċembru 2020 proprju waqt li kont attivita' politika f'Għawdex indirizzata mill-Prim Ministru fil-Gozo Innovation Hub. Malli ġejt infurmata bqajt sejra dritt l-isptar u kien proprju dak in-nhar meta ġie djanjostikat f'kanċer aggressiv terminali. Lill-missieri tlifnieh fis-6 ta' Frar 2021. F'dan il-perijodu apparti mpenji ta' xogħol, il-bqija tal-ħin iddedikajtu għall-missieri bejn Mater Dei, SAMOC u l-Isptar Ġenerali ta' Għawdex fejn biss biss bejn il-25 u 29 ta' Jannar kellu ġimgħa sħiħa radjo-terapija u jien kont miegħu. Il-ġranet u ġimgħat ta' wara t-telfa tiegħu kien l-għar perijodu ta' ħajti u l-iktar esperjenza trawmatika li qatt kelli f'ħajti. Kien ukoll perijodu li fih ridt nieħu ħsieb lill-ommi li għandha 74 sena u lill-uliedi. Peress li jien tifla unika u *single mother*, ir-responsabilitajiet tal-familja kienu kollha fuqi. Kull riferenza għal dan il-perijodu minn Alison Bogdanovic/Apap hija bla skruplu, kattiva u malinna.

16. Illi apparti l-punti minn a sa h hawn fuq, jidher li l-pern ta' kollox huwa dwar l-ingaġġ tas-Sur Bogdanovic li skont Alison Bogdanovic/Apap huwa marbut ma' allegata relazzjoni mal-ex żewġha.

17. Illi mix-xiehda li ngħatat jirriżulta ċar li a kuntrarju għal dak li kien qed jiġi allegat, l-ingaġġ oriġinali ta' Daniel Bogdanovic sar taħt Ministru għal Għawdex ieħor fejn kien hemm diversi skemi viġġenti u meta nħtart jien bħala Ministru għal-Għawdex, ġbarthom f'waħda u tejjibt il-kundizzjonijiet biex nelimina kwestjonijiet ta' prekarjat. Daniel Bogdanovic kien wieħed fost mijiet ta' individwi li gawdew minn din ir-riforma li jien għamilt.

18. Ir-rikjesta sabiex isir it-trasferiment mill-Ministeru għall-Għawdex għal Ministeru għall-Edukazzjoni, ġiet mis-Segretarju Permanenti fi ħdan il Ministeru għal-Għawdex. Is-Segretarju fi ħdan il-Ministeru għall-Edukazzjoni, iffaċilita biss din it-talba/rikjesta.

19. Illi riferribilment għall-fatt li nbdew proċeduri biex Daniel Bogdanovic jifforma parti mis-segretarjat (li ma mmaterjalizżatx) kif ukoll biex jagħmel l-istudju fuq

ir-riforma tal-Iskola Nazzjonali tal-iSport, jirriżulta wkoll mid-dokumenti preżentati fil-kors tal-investigazzjoni, li l-proċeduri tas-Servizz Pubbliku stipulati fl-ingaġġ ta' tali persuni, kollha ġew osservati.

20. Illi mhux minnu li dan l-ingaġġ ingħata a bażi ta' xi relazzjoni personali u li partikolarment mhix permessa mill-Kodiċi ta' Etika. F'dan l-istadju qed issir riferenza għall-Manwal ta' Proċeduri tal-Kabinet senjatament paġna 5 paragrafu 5.6 fejn inter alia qed jiġi stabbilit li l-Ministri ma għandhomx jappuntaw fis-segretarjat privati tagħhom konjuġi jew qraba b'konsangwinita' sal-ewwel grad. Daniel Bogdanovic ma jaqa' taħt l-ebda minn dawn l-istanzi u fi kwalunkwe każ l-ingaġġ tiegħu bħala membru tas-segretarjat ma mmaterjaliżżax għall-raġunijiet li rriżultaw kemm mix-xhieda tiegħu stess kif ukoll tas-sottofirmata. Dan il-fatt ġie kkonfermat minn Dr Fabri, Glenn Micallef u Joyce Cassar.

21. Illi kwantu għall-inkarigu marbut mal-Iskola Nazzjonali tal-Isport, irriżulta b'mod ampju li dan kien meħtieġ – partikolarment trid tingħata piż lix-xhieda tas-Sur Bjorn Vassallo, President tal-MFA u r-rekwiżit li min jingħata l-inkarigu jrid ikun **'ġej mid-dinja tagħhom'.**

22. Illi isem Daniel Bogdanovic ma ssemmiex fl-arja u inqas u inqas l-għażla li saret. Fil-fatt sar ukoll ezerċizzju kumparattiv li wasslet għal tali għażla u rriżulta bl-iktar mod ċar li Daniel Bogdanovic kellu r-rekwiżiti neċessarji biex jagħmel dan l-istudju. Bħal kull każ fejn tidħol għażla ta' persuna għal xi biċċa xogħol, persuni diversi ikollhom opinjonijiet diversi. Iżda dan il-fatt m'għandux jinċidi fuq l-għażla li saret jew fuq il-kompetenza tal-individwu li jkun intagħżel. Is-sur Bjorn Vassallo wkoll ikkonferma li l-persuna magħżula għandha l-kompetenzi kollha meħtieġa. Dwar dak li xehed is-Sur Joe Caruana Curran, jerġa' jiġi kkonfermat li hu qabel mal-għażla li saret.

23. Illi jerġa' jiġi emfasiżżat li tali għażla ma saritx abbażi ta' ħbiberija jew għal xi raġunijiet personali. Dawn ġew miċħuda u mill-asjem tal-provi jirriżulta wkoll li huma frott ta' stqarrijiet u diċeriji li ġew imressqa minn persuna li għal raġunijiet personali tagħha, bniet storja u għamlet kull mezz possibbli biex din tikber sproporzjonalment u saħansitra tasal quddiem dan l-uffiċċju. Jiżdied jingħad li dan l-uffiċċju kellu kull opportunita' li jisma, josserva u jevalwa kemm l-istqarrijiet kif ukoll l-komportament leġġer li bihom saru allegazzjonijiet serjissimi u insinwazzjonijiet taħt is-sottoministrazzjoni tal-ġurament. Dawn l-allegazzjonjiet u insinwazzjonijiet lili sottofirmata mhux biss urtawni u weġġgawni imma li ħassejtni inġurjata u malafamata u ġejt impinġija bħala mara bla valuri u bla skrupli – li ċertament minix bħal ma kulħadd jaf.

24. Illi żgur li din il-persuna li mhix midħla tar-responsabilita' li ġġorr il-ħajja politika u li mhix parti minnha – ma tistax tifhem il-portata ta' dan l-irwol u

dak li hu rikjest fil-'ħajja tagħna'. Dan ix-xogħol ma għandux ħinijiet u kull minn qiegħed fiħ jaħdem *as required* bl-ikbar sens ta' sagrifiċċju u dover. Trid taħdem ma' kulħadd - rġiel u nisa. Anzi, ngħidu x'ngħidu din hija dinja li għadha prevalentement maskili u minkejja kull livell ta' emanċipazzjoni, in-nisa fil-politika għadhom isoffru minn preġudizzji kbar li l-kollegi maskili lanqas biss joħolmuhom. Dan il-każ huwa 'a case in point'.

25. Illi jien ħdimt għall-pajjiż u għall-poplu għal dawn l-aħħar għoxrin sena fejn tajt servizz mingħajr interessi jew tebgħa. Anzi meta kien hemm każ li jien kont totalment estraneja għalih, imma li seta' jixħet dubju fuq l-integrita' tiegħi, kont jien stess li b'mod immedjat u mingħajr riservi ta' xejn li irriżenjajt minn ministru minnufih.

26. Illi huwa inammissibli u perikoluż, li individwu, minħabba skopijiet ulterjuri, u b'mod l-aktar viljakk, juża u jabbuża minn uffiċċji u meżżi pubbliċi biex jagħmel assassinju ta' karattru, li jwassal ukoll li jipperikola s-saħħa fiżika u mentali, tal-persuna investigata u tal-familjari tagħha.

27. Illi għalhekk minkejja l-allegazzjonijet invertieri u supposizzjoniet ibbażati fuq fatti assurdi, mix-xhieda u provi prodotti ma' hemm ebda prova li wettaqt xi aġir abbużiv minn naħa tiegħi fuq dan il-każ li qed jiġi investigat u nittama li l-proċess jiġi konkluż sabiex jitneħħa l-inkubu u l-istress li ntefa' u nħoloq lili.

28. Illi fi stadju ieħor tax-xhieda ta' Alison Bogdanovic/Apap, saru allegazzjonijiet u tqajjmu dubji dwar il-kapacita' li Daniel Bogdanovic jikkumpila rapport. Illi żgur mhux forsi l-persuna konċernata ma għandha ebda kompetenzi jew ħiliet meħtieġa biex tagħmel tali asserzjonijiet u li huma motivati minn skopijiet ulterjuri.

29. Illi dwar ir-rapport meħtieġ, il-linji gwida ta' x'hix kellu jkopri dan l-istudju, kien maqbul fit-Terms of Reference li ġew mfassla. Dawn il-linji gwida huma l-punt tat-tluq għal djalogu bejn min ikkommissjona l-istudju ma' min sejjer jagħmel l-istudju. Jekk ma jkunx hemm dan id-djalogu kontinwu matul l-istudju, hemm riskju kbir li jiġi preżentat rapport li ma jkunx jindirizza u ma jilħaqx l-obbjettiv li l-kummissjonant tal-istudju xtaq.

30. Illi bħal ma' jiġri meta student ikun qed jikteb teżi għal akkwist tat-Masters jew Dottorat, jkun assenjat lilu superviżur biex jiggwidah fil-proċess kollhu li tinvolvi l-preżentazzjoni ta' teżi. Il-rwol tas-superviżur huwa dak li jipprovdi lil min qed jagħmel l-istudju u jikteb ir-rapport, b'dak l-appoġġ u riżors matul il-fażijiet kollha tal-istudju, liema appoġġ jinkludu d-diskussjoni fuq l-għarfien u l-letteratura ta 'sfond rilevanti, kif ukoll il-metodoloġija u teknika meħtieġa matul dan l-istudju. Superviżur għandu mhux biss ikun aċċessibbli, iżda jinvolvi ruħu f'diskussjoni u kritika kostruttiva tal-ideat; tal-informazzjoni li tkun qed tinġabar; tar-riżultati tar-riċerka u tar-rakkomandazzjonijiet li sejrin ikunu preżentati fir-rapport finali.

31. Il-fatt li kien hemm timeframe qasir sa meta dan ir-rapport ried jiġi preżentat, kien hemm il-ħtieġa ta' d-diskussjoni u r-reviżjonijiet li kellhom isiru, anki fejn jidħol preżentazzjoni u t-text tar-rapport. Kif ġie kkonfermat mis-Segretarju Permanenti Dr Fabri u Dr Paul Debattista, il-perijodu qasir kien attribwibbli għall-fatt li uħud mir-rakkomandazzjonijiet riedu jiġu mplimentati biex ikunu addottati għas-sena skolastika li kienet ser tibda f'Ottubru ta' din is-sena.

32. Illi wieħed irid iżomm f'moħħu, li rapport bħal dan, biex ir-rakkomandazzjonijiet li kienu ser jiġu preżentati, jiġu approvati, kien ser ikun hemm approvazzjoni tal-Kabinett, kif ukoll konsultazzjoni pubblika. Għalhekk, kien hemm bżonn is-superviżjoni ta' persuna li taf il-mekkaniżmu u kif jopera Kabinett. Żgur li kull persuna li ma kinietx esposta għal dan l-ambjent, ma tkunx taf kif rapport għandu jiġi preżentat fil-forma li tiffaċilita' lil-membri tal-Kabinett jieħdu deċiżjoni għaġġiliha fuq rapport preżentat lilhom. F'dan l-isfond, l-intervent ta' Dr Paul DeBattista f'dan l-istudju, kien isegwi dawn il-binarji u linji gwida ta' superviżur.

33. Illi l-fatt li hu wkoll il-konsulent personali tiegħi, kien f'pożizzjoni li jaf eżatt l-obbjettiv aħħari tal-użu ta' dan ir-rapport, u l-interventi tiegħu kienu sabiex fiż-żmien stipulat fit-Terms of Reference, ikun hemm rapport li seta' immedjatament jiġi ppreżentat lil-membri tal-Kabinett għad-diskussjoni u biex uħud mir-rakkomandazzjonijiet msemmija, jiġu implimentati qabel ma' tibda s-sena skolastika 2021/22.

34. ILLI dan pero' ma jneħħi xejn mill-fatt li l-awtur tar-rapport huwa Daniel Bogdanovic u li jista' jiġi kkonfermat li fl-ebda istanza ma ngħatat xi raġuni li xi ħadd jiddubita minn dan il-fatt. Hija biss l-persuna li tat lok għal kaz li qajmet dubju – persuna li bid-dovut rispett ma jirrizulta minn inkien li hija persuna istruwita jew li ghandha xi livell intelletwali rilevanti.

35. Illi nonostante dan kollu u kull dubju li seta' tqajjem hi x'inhi l-motivazzjoni, bl-ebda mod ma jista' jiġi attribwit lili sottofirmati jew li b'xi mod u majiera jista' jikkostitwixxi ksur ta' etika jew li b'xi mod mhux skont l-istandards fil-ħajja pubblika tiegħi.

D. <u>Konklużżjoni</u>

36. Illi b'mod konklussiv jingħad li għoxrin sena fil-ħajja pubblika mhumiex ftit. Dejjem emmint li l-politika hija servizz u li biex tagħti dan is-servizz trid tkun denju u integru. Dejjem hekk għamilt u matul dawn is-snin kollha rnexxili nakkwista stima u rispett minn kull naħa tal-isfera politika, kemm lokalment kif ukoll internazzjonalment, mhux biss fuq bazi professjonali imma wkoll minħabba l-mod rett kif dejjem agixxejt – kemm fl-irwoli ministerjali, parlamentari u pubbliċi iżda wkoll fuq bażi personali partikolarment

attribwibbli għall-komportament tiegħi bħala persuna, anzi mara, tal-affari tiegħi li ridt u rrid nagħti eżempju lill-oħrajn speċjalment lill-uliedi.

Daqstant għandi x'nissottometti umilment.

Dr Justyne Caruana MP
Karta tal-identita' numru [redacted]

9. Is-Sur Joseph Caruana Curran
President tal-Aquatics
Association ta' Malta

Sommarju tax-xhieda tas-Sur Joe Caruana Curran

Każ: K/036

Data: 1 ta’ Settembru 2021

Preżenti: Dr George Hyzler, Kummissarju għall-Istandards fil-Ħajja Pubblika
Charles Polidano, Direttur Ġenerali fl-uffiċċju tal-Kummissarju
Dr Sarah Pace Warrington, Investigatur u Analista fl-uffiċċju tal-Kummissarju

Is-Sur Joe Caruana Curran, President tal-Aquatic Sports Association ta’ Malta

---

Is-Sur Caruana Curran ħalef bil-ġurament li jgħid is-sewwa.

Mistoqsi jekk qatt iltaqax ma’ uffiċjali tal-Ministeru għall-Edukazzjoni in konnessjoni mal-kuntratt li ngħata s-Sur Danijel Bogdanovic biex jagħmel studju dwar l-Iskola Nazzjonali tal-Isport, is-Sur Caruana Curran qal li hu kien irċieva stedina mingħand Dr Paul Debattista biex jiltaqa’ mal-Ministru Justyne Caruana. Il-laqgħa saret fit-22 ta’ Marzu 2021 fl-10.00 jew fl-10.30 ta’ filgħodu fil-ministeru l-Furjana. Preżenti kien hemm il-Ministru, Dr Debattista, u Danijel Bogdanovic. Ma kien hemm ebda persuna oħra mill-ministeru preżenti.

Is-Sur Caruana Curran qal li hu ġie informat li kien qed isir studju dwar kif setgħet tiġi ameljorata l-Iskola Nazzjonali tal-Isport, u ġie mitlub jgħid x’jaħseb hu f’dan ir-rigward. Waqt il-laqgħa huwa ta xi ideat, u suppost kellu jibgħat noti bil-miktub lis-Sur Bogdanovic biex jiġu kkunsidrati bħala parti mir-rapport li kien qed jitlesta. Biss is-Sur Caruana Curran ma bagħat xejn għax imbagħad ħarġet l-aħbar li l-kuntratt tas-Sur Bogdanovic ġie tterminat. Dakinhar tal-laqgħa stess kien qara fil-midja, x’aktarx fil-*Malta Today*, li kien hemm problema dwar l-għoti tal-kuntratt.

Is-Sur Caruana Curran qal li milli seta’ jifhem dakinhar tal-laqgħa, ir-rapport diġà kien wasal biex jiġi konkluż. Safejn kien jiftakar hu, il-kuntratt kien għal tliet xhur u kelli jispiċċa f’April, allura kien jagħmel sens li r-rapport diġà kien qiegħed jinkiteb.

Mistoqsi jekk kienx jaf lis-Sur Bogdanovic personalment, is-Sur Caruana Curran wieġeb fl-affermattiv. Qal li s-Sur Bogdanovic kien player mat-tim tal-Belt meta huwa kien il-president tal-istess klabb. Mistoqsi jekk, fil-fehma tiegħu, is-Sur Bogdanovic kienx kompetenti jikteb rapporti bħal dak dwar l-Iskola Nazzjonali tal-Isport, is-Sur Caruana Curran qal: “*Mhix deċiżjoni tiegħi min jiġi mqabbad jagħmel rapporti bħal dawn, però naħseb li hemm ħafna iktar nies kompetenti fil-pajjiż illi jistgħu jagħmlu rapporti bħal dawn ukoll.*”[1]

---

1 Reġistrazzjoni tax-xhieda, 8:02.

Rigward l-għoti tal-inkarigu lis-Sur Bogdanovic biex jagħmel studju dwar l-Iskola Nazzjonali tal-Isport, is-Sur Caruana Curran qal: "*Ġejt informat li kien ġie mqabbad hu għax huwa persuna kompetenti biex jagħmel dan ix-xogħol*."[2] Qal ukoll: "*Ma ġejtx ikkonsultat jekk huwiex il-persuna idejali. Ġejt informat, ġejt informat, li kien se jagħmlu hu għax huwa persuna kompetenti*."[3] Ġie informat waqt il-laqgħa u mhux qabel.

Is-Sur Caruana Curran qal li l-laqgħa ġiet iffissata permezz ta' skambju ta' messaġġi ma' Dr Paul Debattista, u ma kienx hemm korrispondenza formali. Fuq talba tal-Kummissarju, is-Sur Caruana Curran bagħat screenshots tal-iskambju tal-messaġġi dak il-ħin stess lid-Direttur Ġenerali fl-uffiċċju tal-Kummissarju.

Sommarju magħmul minn: Charles Polidano

Data tal-aħħar reviżjoni: 15 ta' Settembru 2021

---

2 Reġistrazzjoni, 9:27.

3 Reġistrazzjoni, 9:58.

B/JCC/2

12:48
New Message
Cancel
To: Dr Paul Debattista
Text Message
Tue, 16 Mar, 11:05
Can I call you later?
Can I call you later?
Ok. It is Paul DeBattista
Call you shortly Paul.
Thu, 18 Mar, 11:43
Tinsiex fuq data ghal meeting
How does Monday morning sound?
Ok. Shall we say at 9.30am
Text Message

B/JCC/2a

12:49
3G
New Message
Cancel
To: Dr Paul Debattista
Ok. Shall we say at 9.30am
Perfect. See you Monday.
Ok
Thu, 18 Mar, 17:47
Can we make it at 10.00am since i was called for another meeting at 9.30?
Thu, 18 Mar, 19:00
Sure no problem.
Tks. See you
Text Message

10. Is-Sur Bjorn Vassallo
President tal-Malta Football Association

Sommarju tax-xhieda tas-Sur Bjorn Vassallo

Każ: K/036

Data: 16 ta' Settembru 2021

Preżenti: Dr George Hyzler, Kummissarju għall-Istandards fil-Ħajja Pubblika
Dr Sarah Pace Warrington, Investigatur u Analista fl-uffiċċju tal-Kummissarju

Is-Sur Bjorn Vassallo, President tal-Malta Football Association

---

Is-Sur Vassallo ħalef bil-ġurament li jgħid is-sewwa.

Is-Sur Vassallo beda billi qal li Danijel Bogdanovic huwa membru affiljat mal-Malta Football Association (MFA) bħala coach ma' klabb li huwa membru ta' assoċjazzjoni affiljata (il-Gozo Football Association), apparti li huwa wkoll membru tal-Fifty Plus Club tal-MFA bħala ex-plejer li lagħab aktar minn ħamsin darba mat-tim nazzjonali.

Is-Sur Vassallo ikkonferma li huwa ltaqa' mal-Ministru Justyne Caruana "*għal darba darbtejn*" dwar l-Iskola Nazzjonali tal-Isport. Huwa kien diġà beda jiddiskuti dan is-suġġett mal-ministru ta' qabel, Owen Bonnici, u anki qabel, fi żmien meta ma kienx president tal-MFA, fuq stedina tal-Prim Ministru Joseph Muscat li qal li l-gvern kien lest jgħin l-assoċjazzjonijiet sportivi jwettqu l-istrateġija tagħhom. Qal li l-pożizzjoni tal-MFA kien li l-iskola kellha tagħżel it-tfal skont it-talent tagħhom fl-isport, mhux l-abbiltà akkademika, biex it-tfal fl-iskola jkunu dawk li għandhom l-aktar talent fl-isport. Huwa kien qal lill-Ministru Caruana li jekk ma jsirx dan l-MFA kienet lesta ttemm l-involviment tagħha fl-iskola. L-MFA kienet responsabbli għall-kurrikulu tal-football u kienet anki tibgħat il-coaches tagħha biex jagħtu t-taħriġ fl-iskola, bi ħlas minn fondi pubbliċi, iżda l-MFA kienet qegħda twaqqaf fondazzjoni bil-għan li din tassumi l-irwol tat-trawwim ta' players żgħar. Sussegwentement il-coaches tal-MFA ma baqgħux involuti fl-Iskola Nazzjonali tal-Isport u din l-iskola qabbdet coaches hi stess.

Is-Sur Vassallo qal li l-laqgħat mal-Ministru saru fil-perjodu ta' bejn Diċembru 2020 u Mejju 2021, meta ġie ffirmat memorandum of understanding bejn l-MFA u l-ministeru. L-MoU mhux relatat direttament mal-Iskola Nazzjonali tal-Isport iżda jaħseb biex il-coaches tal-MFA jinvolvu ruħhom fl-iskejjel normali. L-MFA tat rapport dwar dan kollu lill-ministeru, mhux lil Danijel Bogdanovic. L-MFA ma kellha ebda involviment fl-għażla tas-Sur Bogdanovic biex jagħmel l-istudju dwar l-Iskola Nazzjonali tal-Isport. Dwar dan is-Sur Vassallo qal: "*Jekk issaqsini malli ħareġ isem Danijel Bogdanovic jekk jien kontx kuntent, hawn Malta ma tantx hawn fiex titfixkel fil-football, jiġifieri professjonisti ma tantx kien hawn. Danny kien wieħed minnhom. Jiġifieri persważ bl-esperjenza li kellu li meta npoġġu fuq mejda u qed nitkellmu u*

qed nagħmlu rapport, programm, analiżi, emm, kapaċi jagħmilha aktar minn kwalunkwe persuna li mhux fil-, fil-football."[1]

Mitlub jikkonferma li l-MFA ma kenitx ikkonsultata dwar l-għażla tas-Sur Bogdanovic, iżda li lilu ma dejqitu xejn l-għażla, is-Sur Vassallo wieġeb: "*Le assolutament, mhux hekk?*"[2]

Is-Sur Vassallo qal li kien hemm żewġ laqgħat bejn l-MFA u l-ministeru, waħda f'Jannar/Frar 2021 u l-oħra fil-bidu ta' Marzu, u f'din il-laqgħa l-MFA intalbet tpoġġi dak kollu li kien ġie diskuss f'rapport għaliex kien qed isir audit tal-Iskola Nazzjonali tal-Isport. Wara li ċċekkja d-djaru tiegħu is-Sur Vassallo qal li l-MFA bagħtet ir-rapport tagħha fit-23 ta' Marzu 2021. Ir-rapport kien fih erba' paġni. F'dak l-istadju s-Sur Vassallo ma kienx jaf min qiegħed jagħmel dan l-audit, iżda qal "*Tlabt illi, emm, ikun xi ħadd illi jkun ovvjament b'meritokrazija, li jkun ġej mid-dinja tagħna, li jista' jifhem ċertu aspetti u forsi mhux il-kumpanija illi tiġi hemmhekk biex at the end of the day, emm, tagħmel rapport u r-rapport ikun mhux fid-dettall u aktar fil-prinċipju*."[3]

Sommarju magħmul minn: Charles Polidano

Data tal-aħħar reviżjoni: 23 ta' Settembru 2021

---

[1] Reġistrazzjoni tax-xhieda, 9:40.

[2] Reġistrazzjoni, 10:10.

[3] Reġistrazzjoni, 16:20.

11. People and Standards Division
Uffiċċju tal-Prim Ministru

Kummissarju għall-Istandards fil-Ħajja Pubblika

6 ta' Settembru 2021

Dr Joyce Cassar
Segretarju Permanenti
People and Standards Division
Uffiċċju tal-Prim Ministru

Bl-email fuq joyce.cassar@gov.mt

Dr Cassar,

Każ K/036 – talba għal evidenza skont l-artikolu 19 tal-Att dwar Standards fil-Ħajja Pubblika

Bis-saħħa tal-artikolu 19 tal-Att dwar Standards fil-Ħajja Pubblika (il-kapitolu 570 tal-liġijiet ta' Malta), inti qegħda tiġi mħarrka biex tipprovdini bl-informazzjoni li tidher hawn taħt:

(a) jekk is-Sur **Danijel (Daniel) Bogdanovic**, karta tal-identità numru [redacted]M, jidhirx fuq il-payroll tal-Gvern, jew jekk deherx għal kwalunkwe perjodu mill-1 ta' Diċembru 2020 'l hawn;

(b) jekk fl-affermattiv, x'inhi jew x'kienet il-kariga u l-iskala ta' salarju tiegħu;

(c) f'każ li s-Sur Bogdanovic huwa jew kien ingaġġat bħala persuna ta' fiduċja, kopja tal-kuntratt u d-dokumentazzjoni relatata, kif fornuti lill-uffiċċju tiegħek ai termini tal-kapitolu 7 tal-Manual on Resourcing Policies and Procedures.

Inti mitluba tipprovdi din l-informazzjoni sa mhux aktar tard mill-**Ġimgħa 10 ta' Settembru 2021**. Nuqqas ta' koperazzjoni mingħandek jista' jwassal għal pieni skont kif ipprovdut fl-Att.

Dr George Marius Hyzler
Kummissarju għall-Istandards fil-Ħajja Pubblika

B/PSD/2

PEOPLE &
STANDARDS
DIVISION

UFFIĊĊJU TAL-PRIM MINISTRU

7 ta' Settembru 2021

Dott. George Marius Hyzler

Kummissarju għall- Istandards fil-ħajja Pubblika

Għażiż Dott. Hyzler,

Nagħmel referenza għall-ittra tiegħek dwar il-Każ K/036. Nixtieq nikkonferma li s-Sur Danijel Bogdanivic, karta tal-Identita' numru [redacted] M, ma jinstabx fuq il-payroll tal-Gvern.

Dejjem tiegħek,

Joyce Cassar PhD
Segretarju Permanenti (People & Standards)

People & Standards Division
Uffiċċju tal-Prim Ministru
3, Pjazza Kastilja, Il-Belt Valletta
t: (+356) 2200 1318 w: psd.gov.mt e: psd.opm@gov.mt

B/PSD/3

Kummissarju għall-Istandards fil-Ħajja Pubblika

8 ta' Settembru 2021

Dr Joyce Cassar
Segretarju Permanenti
(People and Standards)
Uffiċċju tal-Prim Ministru

Bl-email fuq joyce.cassar@gov.mt

Dr Cassar,

Każ K/036 – talba għal evidenza skont l-artikolu 19 tal-Att dwar Standards fil-Ħajja Pubblika

B'ittra tiegħi tas-6 ta' Settembru inti ġejt imħarrka biex tipprovdini bl-informazzjoni li tidher hawn taħt:

(a) jekk is-Sur Danijel (Daniel) Bogdanovic, karta tal-identità numru [redacted]M, jidhirx fuq il-payroll tal-Gvern, jew jekk deherx għal kwalunkwe perjodu mill-1 ta' Diċembru 2020 'l hawn;

(b) jekk fl-affermattiv, x'inhi jew x'kienet il-kariga u l-iskala ta' salarju tiegħu;

(c) f'każ li s-Sur Bogdanovic huwa jew kien ingaġġat bħala persuna ta' fiduċja, kopja tal-kuntratt u d-dokumentazzjoni relatata, kif fornuti lill-uffiċċju tiegħek ai termini tal-kapitolu 7 tal-Manual on Resourcing Policies and Procedures.

Ħadt nota tar-risposta tiegħek li s-Sur Bogdanovic ma jinstabx fuq il-payroll tal-Gvern, iżda nosserva wkoll li din ir-risposta ma tindirizzax adegwatament it-talba tiegħi fl-intier tagħha.

Għalhekk inti qegħda terġa' tiġi mitluba tipprovdini b'din l-informazzjoni:

(a) jekk is-Sur Bogdanovic deherx fuq il-payroll tal-Gvern għal kwalunkwe perjodu mill-1 ta' Diċembru 2020 'l hawn;

(b) jekk fl-affermattiv, x'kienet il-kariga u l-iskala ta' salarju tiegħu;

(c) f'każ li s-Sur Bogdanovic kien ingaġġat bħala persuna ta' fiduċja, kopja tal-kuntratt u d-dokumentazzjoni relatata, kif fornuti lill-uffiċċju tiegħek ai termini tal-kapitolu 7 tal-Manual on Resourcing Policies and Procedures.

Inti mitluba tipprovdini b'din l-informazzjoni sa mhux aktar tard mill-**Ġimgħa 10 ta' Settembru 2021**. Nuqqas ta' koperazzjoni mingħandek jista' jwassal għal pieni skont kif tipprovdi l-liġi.

Dr George Marius Hyzler
Kummissarju għall-Istandards fil-Ħajja Pubblika

B/PSD/4

PEOPLE & STANDARDS DIVISION

UFFIĊĊJU TAL-PRIM MINISTRU

9 ta' Settembru 2021

Dr George Marius Hyzler

Kummissarju għall- Istandards fil-ħajja Pubblika

Dr Hyzler,

Nagħmel referenza għall-ewwel risposta tiegħi tas-7 ta' Settembru 2021 dwar il-Każ K/036.

Nixtieq nerġa nikkonferma li mill-informazzjoni li dan l-uffiċċju għandu għad-dispożizzjoni tiegħu, s-Sur Danijel Bogdanovic, karta tal-Identita' numru [redacted]M, la jidher u anqas kien jidher fuq il-payroll tal-Gvern mill-1 ta' Diċembru 2020 'l hawn.

Nixtieq nikkonferma wkoll li din id-Diviżjoni, li hi responsabli mis-salarji li jiffurmaw parti mill-payroll tal-Gvern, qatt ma rċeviet kopja ta' kuntratt tas-Sur Bogdanovic bħala persuna ta' fiduċja kif mitlub f'Kap 7 tal-Manual on Resourcing Policies and Procedures u għalhekk mhux imdaħħal fil-payroll tal-Gvern.

Niskuża ruħi jekk ma kontx spjegajt ruħi ċar fl'ewwel risposta li għaddejtlek.

Dejjem tiegħek,

Joyce Cassar PhD

Segretarju Permanenti (People & Standards)

People & Standards Division
Uffiċċju tal-Prim Ministru
3, Pjazza Kastilja, Il-Belt Valletta

t: (+356) 2200 1318 w: psd.gov.mt e: psd.opm@gov.mt

12. Accountant General

Ministeru għall-Finanzi u x-Xogħol
It-Teżor
L 2-3, Development House, St. Anne Street, Floriana FRN9010 | Tel: +356 25967100
Web: http://www.treasury.gov.mt | Email: treasury.malta@gov.mt

B/AcG/1

Ref: TR 774/2021

9 ta' Settembru 2021

Dr George Marius Hyzler
Kummissarju għall-Istandards fil-Ħajja Pubblika

Dr. Hyzler,

B'referenza għat-talba tiegħek għal evidenza rigrawd il-Każ K/036 ta' Danijel Bogdanovic, nixtieq ninfurmak li t-Teżor għamel ir-riċerki tiegħu mis-sistemi tal-Gvern (DAS u CFMS).

L-unika pagament li instab relatat ma' dan l-individwu għall-perjodu ndikat huwa dan imsemmi hawn isfel. In-narrativa hawn taħt murija b'text skur hi kif tinstab fis-sistema tad-DAS.

Vote 22 – Ministry for Education
1402000965
2021000862
Account 3060 – Contractual Services
€5,900.00
Department File: MEDE 77/2021
Being payment to Mr Danijel Bogdanovic to provide an overview of the modus operandi of the 'Skola Nazzjonali tal-Isport' carried out during the period of 21/01/2021 to 02/02/2021.
Invoice 001 @ red 14 refers
Processed by Treasury – 10th March 2021

Nixtieq nikjarifika li t-Teżor jipproċessa l-pagamenti li jkunu saru mid-Dipartimenti rispettivi rigward xogħolijiet u servizzi li jkunu saru għall-Gvern. U allura ma għandnix informazzjoni rigward pagamenti li jkunu saru mill-entitajiet jew inkella mis-sistema tad-Dakar minn fejn jinħarġu s-salarji.

Tislijiet,

Sa Paulanne Mamo
Accountant General
It-Teżor

13. Misc.

B/Misc/1

Search results

BD Bogdanovic Danie at MFED
Ministry for Education

BD

Bogdanovic Daniel at MFED

Contact Notes Organisation

Calendar

Schedule a meeting

Send email address

Email: daniel.bogdanovic@gov mt

Work

Job title: Secretariat Officer

Department: Ministry Secretariat - MFED

Company: Ministry for Education

Office: Ministry Secretariat - MFED

D rectory

Address

Business

GREAT SIEGE ROAD Floriana FRN 1810
Malta