



CASE REPORT

Case No:	K/019
Complaint:	Acceptance of a gift of three bottles of wine (Château Pétrus) worth €5,800
Complainant:	Prof. Arnold Cassola
Complaint Date:	27 December 2019 and 25 January 2020
Report Date:	1 July 2020

This case report is a translation of the Maltese original. Extracts from correspondence that are quoted in the text have been translated, but the attachments remain in their original form.

The Complaint

1. By means of an email dated 27 December 2019 (email annexed and marked Document A), Prof. Arnold Cassola asked me to investigate the conduct of the Hon. Dr Joseph Muscat, who at that time held office as Prime Minister of Malta, for allegedly receiving and accepting a gift consisting of three bottles of wine worth €5,800 in February 2019.

2. This email was followed up by another email on 27 December 2019. This included a copy of an email which was addressed to the President of the Commission Against Injustices (annexed and marked Document B).¹

¹ It appears, in fact, that this email was sent to the Permanent Commission Against Corruption. See <https://timesofmalta.com/articles/view/anti-corruption-watchdog-is-probing-muscats-gifts.762675>



3. The allegation set out in the complaint is that “... a donation of 3 bottles of wine worth 5800 euro was made in February 2019, that is to say two years after Mr Yorgen Fenech had commissioned the assassination of Ms Daphne Caruana Galizia and at least 8 months after the Prime Minister had become aware that Fenech was one of the suspects”.

4. By means of an email dated 25 January 2020 I was asked to “extend the investigation to all gifts received by Dr Muscat from October 2018 onwards, both gifts to the state and private ones”.

Decision on the Inadmissibility of Part of the Complaint

5. The request to investigate “all gifts received by Dr Muscat from October 2018 onwards, both gifts to the state and private ones” cannot be regarded as a complaint which may be considered by me insofar as no specific conduct in breach of any provision of the codes of ethics is being alleged. This request may lead this office into a fishing expedition, apart from the fact that this matter, as indicated by Document B and according to what Prof. Cassola has publicly stated, is being investigated by the Permanent Commission Against Corruption, before which he has testified.²

6. Prof. Cassola links his complaint to the accusation that Yorgen Fenech commissioned the assassination of Daphne Caruana Galizia. Mr Fenech is also a controversial person because of allegations that he was implicated in acts of corruption. On 9 November 2018, three months before the party, he was identified according to media reports as the owner of the company 17 Black, which allegedly was to hand over large sums of money to companies belonging

² <https://timesofmalta.com/articles/view/anti-corruption-watchdog-is-probing-muscats-gifts.762675>.



to Keith Schembri, the Chief of Staff of the Prime Minister, and Minister Konrad Mizzi.³

7. It is not my remit under the Standards in Public Life Act to investigate matters that are of a criminal nature, including allegations about corruption. Aside from this, the Act does not allow me to investigate matters that are already under investigation by the police or subject to a magisterial inquiry, or that are the subject of ongoing proceedings in a court or tribunal established by law. For these reasons I shall not go into the merits of the criminal charges and allegations of corruption against Yorgen Fenech.

8. According to what was stated by the Hon. Dr Joseph Muscat himself, he acted on the advice and with the knowledge of the security services when he invited Mr Fenech to the party at which Mr Fenech gifted him the three bottles of wine which are the subject of this complaint. In order to investigate whether this is true or not, I would have to request the testimony of security service officers. I do not feel that this would be wise or useful in the current circumstances.

9. One might ask whether I should investigate the complaint, since I cannot go into these aspects. However, even if one ignores the charges and allegations of a criminal nature against Yorgen Fenech, the fact remains that Mr Fenech is a leading entrepreneur with important business relationships with the Government, among others through Electrogas. This in itself raises the question of whether a Prime Minister should invite such a person to a private party and accept gifts from him of relatively high value. This is purely a matter of ethics, but it is an important issue that merits investigation. This report will focus on this issue.

³ <https://timesofmalta.com/articles/view/exclusive-17-black-owner-identified-as-local-power-station-businessman.692998>.



Legal Basis for the Complaint

10. In his complaint, Prof. Cassola did not refer to any article of the Code of Ethics for Ministers and Parliamentary Secretaries, which is found in the Second Schedule of the Standards in Public Life Act (Chapter 570 of the laws of Malta).

11. The provisions of this Code which I consider relevant to the case are:

“4.7 Ministers shall ensure that there is no conflict of interest between their public duties and personal interests.”

“4.8 Ministers shall not accept any gifts or benefits, except as provided in this Code, that may or may reasonably create an impression that they are compromising their judgement or place them under an inappropriate obligation.”

“5.7 Honesty – Ministers shall avoid entering into conflicts of interest between the public interest and their private interest and shall provide complete and correct information to Parliament, to the Cabinet and the public in general.”

“5.9 Leadership – Ministers shall embrace and be inspired by these values in order to lead by example.”

“8.4 No Minister shall accept gifts, donations, hospitality or services from anyone, that may place him under an obligation towards such person or persons and this shall also apply to immediate family members of the Minister. In case of doubt, the Prime Minister shall be consulted.”

Decision to Investigate

12. I decided that the conduct of the Hon. Dr Joseph Muscat merited investigation as it potentially constituted a *prima facie* breach of the above



provisions of the Code of Ethics forming part of the Standards in Public Life Act (chapter 570).

The Context

13. In February 2019, on the occasion of his birthday, the Hon. Dr Joseph Muscat, then Prime Minister, held a party at his official residence at Girgenti Palace. A small number of friends were invited to this party. Amongst the guests was Yorgen Fenech, who was the CEO of the TUMAS group and director of the company Electrogas, which operates a power station, a wealthy person whose family companies had various business relationships with the Government.

14. According to what was reported, on this occasion Mr Fenech gifted three bottles of wine of the prestigious brand “Château Pétrus”. One of the bottles was from 1974 (the year of birth of the Hon. Dr Joseph Muscat himself) and the other two were from 2007 (the year of birth of Dr Muscat’s twin daughters), with an overall value, if purchased online, of almost €6,000.

15. This incident was reported on extensively in the local media.⁴ There were also several allegations concerning other gifts given by Yorgen Fenech to the Hon. Dr. Joseph Muscat, including a Bulgari watch worth circa €20,000, which in fact appears in the annexed inventory (Doc G) but which cannot be investigated by me as it falls under the prescription imposed by article 14(1) of Chap. 570. The same inventory includes a number of other gifts of a personal nature which the Prime Minister bequeathed to the State.

16. At the time when this investigation began a number of protests and demonstrations were taking place in the streets of Valletta, which led to the

⁴ For example, <https://timesofmalta.com/articles/view/yorgen-fenech-gifted-muscat-expensive-wine-at-february-party.759657>.



resignation of the Hon. Dr Joseph Muscat from the office of Prime Minister. This resignation in fact occurred on 13 January 2020, and the Hon. Dr Robert Abela was elected Prime Minister.

Investigation Procedure

17. I wrote to the Principal Permanent Secretary (PPS) on 3 January 2020 (copy of email herewith annexed and marked Doc C) and requested him to tell me in a general manner what criteria were used to determine whether gifts given to the Hon. Dr Joseph Muscat were considered personal or gifted to the state; where they are kept and how they are recorded; and whether a policy exists in practice. I also requested him to forward a copy of the inventory of gifts and to state who was responsible for this inventory.

18. This information was requested not for the purpose of this investigation but for the purpose of the recommendations which I propose to issue on the acceptance of gifts, as I am empowered to do under article 13(1)(g) of Chap 570.5 I am mentioning this here because of a point raised subsequently by the Prime Minister, as indicated later on in this report.

19. The Principal Permanent Secretary replied on 10 January 2020 (copy of email annexed and marked Document D). He stated that the system which was being followed was that used in previous years, and that no distinction was made between Prime Ministers, Ministers or Parliamentary Secretaries. He also said that *“Protocol dictates that programmes of official visits would include if that is the case, exchange of gifts. Hence an ‘official’ gift is clearly determined. There is an administrative procedure which would then include*

⁵ Article 13(1)(g): “... make recommendations for the improvement of any Code of Ethics applicable to persons who are subject to this Act and in particular but without prejudice to the generality of the foregoing, to make recommendations on the acceptance of gifts”.



that gift in the inventory of the room in which it is kept or displayed. Inventories are entered into an electronic system governed by the Ministry of Finance as per MF Circular 15/99.⁶ Personal gifts which are left to the State follow the same procedure. This administration has enhanced the procedure by including the personal gifts in the room inventories. Inventories are signed by both the official responsible for the inventories update and the person responsible for the room or property.”

20. In the same email an issue was raised as to whether the Commissioner for Standards is obliged to inform the person under investigation before collecting such information.

21. On 14 January 2020 I wrote to the Hon. Joseph Muscat (copy annexed and marked Document E) wherein I referred him to the articles of the Code of Ethics which I considered relevant and requested him to provide his reactions on the allegations in question.

22. He replied on 31 January 2020 (copy herewith annexed and marked Document F) as follows:

“I refer to your email of 14 January 2020 concerning the investigation, which you were asked to carry out by Arnold Cassola, into a media report about a gift of wines given to me on my birthday.

In the report indicated by Cassola in his email, I already answered and explained my position. Just as the media reported the ‘gift’ of wines, it also reported what I said about the same case. I have already explained

⁶ In fact the circular is MF Circular No 14/99 (not 15/99), issued by the Ministry for Finance on 24 November 1999 and available from https://treasury.gov.mt/en/Documents/Government_Accounts_Directorate/Accrual_Accounting_Circulars/MF_14-1999_Government_Accrual_Accounting_Revised_Inventory_Control_Regulations.pdf.



that I was acting in accordance with my responsibilities as Prime Minister in the context of the ongoing investigations into the assassination of Ms Daphne Caruana Galizia. Every action I took in this regard, I took with the full knowledge of the country's security services, and under their guidance. I have stated this publicly.

So much so that I did not take this 'gift' and use it but I left it in the Prime Minister's summer residence in Girgenti, as can be confirmed. All this was also reported in the media.

I also draw attention to the fact that the articles of the Standards in Public Life Act quoted by you make it clear that there is no case of conflict of interest (4.7). Moreover, my judgement was so uncompromised that the decisions I took, a number of which are already in the public domain, led to substantial developments in the case of the assassination of Ms Daphne Caruana Galizia (5.7 and 8.4).

Not only have I not breached any rules of conduct imposed on the post of Prime Minister, but I have acted with full responsibility.

I reaffirm the statement I have already made in public, that what is being said about gifts I was supposedly given, apart from being incorrect, is presumably intended by a party involved in the case to construct a narrative for further use at another stage of the process. I believe that the institutions should not allow themselves to be used to second such a narrative for reasons of substance and perception which are obvious.

To this I also link the action taken by your office when it requested from the Office of the Prime Minister information and documentation on the same case regarding which you wrote me this email, at a time when I was still in office, without informing me that I was under investigation by you. After the Principal Permanent Secretary drew attention to this, the



version of your request to the Office of the Prime Minister changed. I feel that this in itself risks prejudicing any fair process.”

23. I took note of a reply to parliamentary question PQ 12669 concerning a list of gifts received by the Prime Minister from the year 2013 until Monday 13 January 2020. The document, in the form of an inventory which is attached to the reply is being annexed to this report and marked Doc G.

24. I should take this opportunity to point out that the way in which the inventory is maintained (at least if that attached to PQ 12669 reflects the formal inventory) does not appear to comply with what is required by the Ministry for Finance to be notified to the Auditor General in accordance with circular MF 14/99. Among the requirements which do not appear to have been observed, the “asset ID”; “asset type”; dept code; report date; and signatures of the room officer and the officer responsible for the inventory are missing.

Preliminary Consideration

25. An argument has been made regarding the fact that I wrote to the PPS and requested information about the policy on gifts before I informed the Prime Minister that he was under investigation.

26. I should take this opportunity to explain the procedure.

27. The procedure which in my opinion I should follow, and my obligation to provide information to the party under investigation, emerge from paragraphs (2) and (3) of article 18 of Chap. 570, which read as follows:

“(2) The Commissioner may hear or obtain information from such persons as he thinks fit, and may make such enquiries as he thinks fit.

(3) The Commissioner shall not make any finding or recommendation about a person being investigated without having granted such person



access to all evidence and having afforded to that person a right to be heard in accordance with the principles of fair trial.”

28. Contrary to what the Hon. Dr Joseph Muscat and the Principal Permanent Secretary have understood, I:

- i. am under no obligation to inform individuals that they are under investigation as soon as I initiate my investigation;
- ii. am under no obligation to inform other persons from whom I request information that I am investigating a particular person;
- iii. am obliged to inform individuals that they are under investigation, and to give them access to all evidence and the right to be heard in accordance with the principles of fair trial, before I make any finding or recommendation, and not at any previous stage of my investigation.

29. It is my understanding that I have the power to require information from such persons (third parties) as I deem appropriate, and that I may make such inquiries as I deem appropriate without satisfying such persons as to the reason why I am requesting the information.

30. In addition, when I receive a report I sometimes gather information before formally initiating an investigation. The aim is to avoid wasting resources should my findings lead me to the conclusion that there is no basis to open proceedings.

31. However, the important thing is to establish that when I request information from third parties (including the PPS), I am not obliged to inform them that I am investigating someone. The expectation that I should provide such information has no basis in logic or in the practice of how investigations should be conducted.



32. Therefore while I agree that *“the institutions should not allow themselves to be used”* by anyone with ulterior motives, I absolutely disagree that I was obliged to notify Dr Muscat before I wrote to the Principal Permanent Secretary, or that the absence of such a notification *“in itself risks prejudicing any fair process”*.

33. It is not clear what process the former Prime Minister is referring to although I cannot think of any process that could be vitiated because of my request for information about the procedure relating to the acceptance of gifts by the Prime Minister and whether a policy exists on this matter.

Considerations on the Merits

34. The fact that gifts were given and were accepted consisting of three bottles of wine of the brand Château Pétrus with an overall value of almost €6,000 on the occasion of the then Prime Minister’s birthday has not been contested. Rather, it has been confirmed by the former Prime Minister himself as well as by the document attached to the reply to PQ 12669, which states that these bottles are in the library (the first room) at Girgenti Palace, as evidenced by the copy of the inventory (Doc G).

35. What gives rise to concern is the value of the gift and the relationship between the donor and the recipient.

36. To appreciate the relevance of the value of the gifts, beyond the codes of ethics one should consider the provisions of the Civil Code⁷ which state that unless a donation is made by public deed it is null, except for gifts, *“manual gifts of money or of other movable corporeal things ... when the sum or value*

⁷ Chapter 16 of the laws of Malta, article 1753(1) and (2).



thereof is moderate, regard being had to the condition of the persons and to other circumstances”.

37. Therefore, the question is what is “*moderate [value], regard being had to the condition of the persons and to other circumstances*”?

38. Yorgen Fenech’s financial situation at the time was known. On this basis, I do not think that a few thousand euro would have any impact on his wealth. On the other hand, a gift of that value to a person living on a Prime Minister’s salary is different. For the Hon. Dr Joseph Muscat a gift of €6,000 cannot be considered as a gift of little value, and this therefore represents a *prima facie* breach of articles 4.8 and 8.4 of the Code of Ethics for Ministers and Parliamentary Secretaries.

39. Dr. Muscat’s defence consists essentially of three points:

- i. he was acting with the knowledge of the security services and under their guidance;
- ii. he did not keep the gift and bequeathed it to the state; and
- iii. the gift did not compromise his judgment.

40. I will address these points one by one.

Dr Muscat was acting on the advice of the security services

41. In his reply (Doc F), the Hon. Dr Joseph Muscat maintains “*that I was acting in accordance with my responsibilities as Prime Minister in the context of the ongoing investigations into the assassination of Ms Daphne Caruana Galizia. Every action I took in this regard, I took with the full knowledge of the country’s security services, and under their guidance.*”

42. Dr Muscat does not specify what the security services advised him to do in connection with the holiday and the gift. However, he refers me to what was



reported by the media when the case became known. He says that *“Just as the media reported the ‘gift’ of wines, it also reported what I said about the same case.”*

43. The media has published several reports relating to this case.⁸ The Times of Malta report of 27 December 2019, which revealed the gifting of the wines, quoted *“a spokesman for OPM”* who said that *“the Prime Minister had attended a number of events around the Christmas 2018 period where members of the Fenech family were present. After consultations with the Malta Security Services, it was decided that Yorgen Fenech and Mrs Fenech should not be excluded from the list of invitees for the Prime Minister’s birthday party, for which the couple attended briefly.”* The same report adds that *“Sources close to Dr Muscat insisted that the prime minister had been instructed by investigators not to change his behaviour in any way that could tip him [Yorgen Fenech] off”*.⁹ Given that this report was never denied by Dr Muscat, and indeed he himself is referring me to media reports, I understand that I should consider it as constituting part of his defence.

44. Aside from this, Dr Muscat himself published a statement on Facebook on 20 June 2020¹⁰ where he said: *“Regarding the ‘famous’ party at Girgenti, I have already said that the invitation was sent in agreement with the Security Services. The reason the invitation was sent is obvious and maybe one day I will*

⁸ See for example <https://timesofmalta.com/articles/view/yorgen-fenech-gifted-muscat-expensive-wine-at-february-party.759657>; <https://www.ramonadepares.com/the-real-story-behind-the-girgenti-invitations/>; <https://timesofmalta.com/articles/view/yorgen-fenech-muscat-asked-me-if-schembri-was-in-the-recordings.800013>; and <https://www.independent.com.mt/articles/2019-12-04/local-news/BREAKING-PM-continued-to-text-Yorgen-Fenech-after-consulting-MSS-OPM-6736217036>.

⁹ <https://timesofmalta.com/articles/view/yorgen-fenech-gifted-muscat-expensive-wine-at-february-party.759657>.

¹⁰ <https://www.facebook.com/josephmuscatdotcom/posts/10160150500424741>.



have the opportunity to explain it for the benefit of those who may not have understood it yet."

45. It seems therefore that since Mr Fenech was a person of interest in a murder investigation, Dr Muscat felt that before all else he should seek the authorisation of the security services to act normally towards Yorgen Fenech, as if to avoid alerting him or possibly other guests to the fact that Fenech was being investigated.

46. As I have already stated, it is not my responsibility to look into the criminal charges brought against Yorgen Fenech, nor should I investigate whether or not it is true that the security services were informed that the Hon. Dr Muscat was going to invite Mr Fenech to the party. The relevance of this is in the implication that clearly emerges from it, namely that had Yorgen Fenech not been a person of interest in the investigation, Dr Muscat would have felt comfortable inviting him to a private and restricted party and accepting gifts from him despite the fact that Mr Fenech had close business relationships with the Government.

47. Therefore this defence, credible or not, which may shed light on the comportment of the Hon. Dr Joseph Muscat in proceedings concerning the murder of Daphne Caruana Galizia, does not shed good light on his conduct with an entrepreneur who was extensively engaged in business with the Government led by the Hon. Dr Muscat.

Muscat did not keep the gift and bequeathed it to the State

48. The Hon. Dr Joseph Muscat stated that he bequeathed the wine in question to the State, as can be seen also from the reply to parliamentary question no. 12669.

49. However, it is clear that the gift was of a personal nature and was not intended to be given to the state, both because of the circumstance in which



it was given (a private party to celebrate Dr Muscat's birthday) and the fact that the vintage of the three bottles had a personal meaning to the Prime Minister and not to others. Dr Muscat accepted this gift as an individual and not as head of the Government, thus incurring a personal obligation towards Yorgen Fenech. The fact that Dr Muscat did not keep the gift and left it at the official residence of the Prime Minister in Girgenti does not change anything and is, at best, irrelevant.

The gift did not compromise Dr Muscat's judgment

50. The Hon. Dr Muscat's third defence is that the gift did not compromise his judgment, so much so that he took decisions that *"have led to substantial developments in the case of the assassination of Mrs Daphne Caruana Galizia"*.

51. An evaluation of this argument would require a detailed review of the merits of the investigation of the assassination of Daphne Caruana Galizia. However, such an exercise is not necessary for the purposes of this report. Article 4.8 of the Code of Ethics for Ministers states that Ministers should refrain from accepting gifts not only if the gifts would compromise their judgment, but also if the gifts *"may reasonably create an impression that they are compromising their judgement"*. Article 8.4 of the same Code does not even go into the merits of whether a gift compromises the judgment of the Minister who receives it: it says only that a Minister should not accept gifts *"that may place him under an obligation"*. Therefore it is not necessary to find that any actual decision has been compromised in order to conclude that these articles have been breached. The perception is sufficient.

52. It should be recalled that there is an ongoing controversy about the extent to which the Electrogas agreement represents value for Maltese taxpayers even if one ignores the accusations of corruption. There is also controversy over changes in the local plan that will enable a consortium which includes Yorgen Fenech's company to build high-rise buildings in Imrieħel. I am



not passing judgement on these cases: I am mentioning them to show how easily suspicions can emerge that major entrepreneurs are exerting untoward influence, even if one disregards the allegations of a criminal nature specifically concerning Yorgen Fenech, and how important it is for the Prime Minister and Ministers to always maintain an appropriate social distance from such persons. This is why articles 4.8 and 8.4 of the relevant Code emphasise perceptions.

53. Similarly, once a Minister, or the Prime Minister, is in a position to take decisions affecting the interests of persons from whom he has received a substantial gift, he is in a conflict of interest with respect to those persons. For the purposes of articles 4.7 and 5.7 of the Code, it is not necessary to prove that a particular decision was actually compromised.

54. This case also represents a *prima facie* breach of article 5.9, which obliges each Minister to set an example in embracing the values contained in the Code of Ethics. This obligation is particularly important in the case of the Prime Minister, who should set an example to Ministers and may take action if any Minister acts in breach of the Code.

55. It should also be recalled that under a previous administration serious and valid accusations had been made by Dr Muscat, then Leader of the Opposition, against a Minister who travelled on a private plane (incidentally owned by the same company belonging to Yorgen Fenech, which at that time also had major business relations with the Government) to watch a football match, and on another occasion that the same Minister accepted the gift of a traditional Maltese clock of a relatively small value from a person who also had business relations with an entity which fell under the responsibility of that Minister. And rightly so, because it is not ethically correct for a Minister to accept hospitality, gifts or other benefits from a person with business relations and interests with the Government. Therefore, especially after that experience, the Prime Minister should have shown more consideration when



he himself invited Yorgen Fenech to a private and restricted party and accepted gifts from him.

Conclusion

56. For the reasons listed above the alleged conduct which forms the basis of this report in my opinion constitutes a *prima facie* breach of the following provisions of the codes of ethics:

“4.7 Ministers shall ensure that there is no conflict of interest between their public duties and personal interests.”

“4.8 Ministers shall not accept any gifts or benefits, except as provided in this Code, that may or may reasonably create an impression that they are compromising their judgement or place them under an inappropriate obligation.”

“5.7 Honesty – Ministers shall avoid entering into conflicts of interest between the public interest and their private interest and shall provide complete and correct information to Parliament, to the Cabinet and the public in general.”

“5.9 Leadership – Ministers shall embrace and be inspired by these values in order to lead by example.”

“8.4 No Minister shall accept gifts, donations, hospitality or services from anyone, that may place him under an obligation towards such person or persons and this shall also apply to immediate family members of the Minister. In case of doubt, the Prime Minister shall be consulted.”

57. This report is being sent to the Committee for Standards in Public Life as provided for in article 22(1)(b) of Chap. 570 for any action it may deem appropriate in terms of article 28 of Chap. 570. In accordance with the



procedure agreed by the Committee on 2 April 2019, I shall not publish this report, but I shall inform Prof. Cassola and the Hon. Dr Joseph Muscat that I have submitted the report to the Committee. It is up to the Committee to decide when to release the report.

Dr George Marius Hyzler

Commissioner for Standards in Public Life



Annexed Documents

- Document A Email dated 27 December 2019 from Prof. Arnold Cassola.
- Document B A further email dated 27 December 2019 from Prof. Arnold Cassola, which includes an email with the same date to the Commission Against Injustices.
- Document C Email dated 3 January 2020 to the Principal Permanent Secretary.
- Document D Reply dated 10 January 2020 from the Principal Permanent Secretary.
- Document E Letter to the Hon. Dr Joseph Muscat dated 14 January 2020.
- Document F Reply dated 31 January 2020 from the Hon. Dr Joseph Muscat.
- Document G Document attached to the reply to parliamentary question No 12669, as delivered on 3 February 2020.

Charles Polidano - Office of the Commissioner for Standards in Public Life

From: Arnold Cassola <arnoldcassola@gmail.com>
Sent: Friday, 27 December 2019 08:02
To: Charles Polidano - Office of the Commissioner for Standards in Public Life
Subject: Yorgen Fenech gifted Muscat expensive wine at February party

Ghaziz Kummissarju Hyzler,

F'ilment precedenti li jien kont ghamilt mieghek, int kont ikkonkludejt li din l-festa privata fil-Girgenti ma kenitx tikkostitwixxi ksur ta' etika.

Issa qed johrog li f'dan il-festin privat fil-proprjeta' tal-istat, il-Prim Ministru nghata rigal ta' imbejjed li jiswew 5800euro (ara link) minn Yorgen Fenech, li sena qabel kien ikkummissjona l-assassinju tas-Sinjura Daphne Caruana Galizia.

Naf li ser tghidli li d-data tal-festin u tar-rigali kienet 8 xhur qabel il-hatra tieghek.

Madankollu, nahseb li l-gravita' tal-fatti timmerita investigazzjoni serja.

Inselli ghalik,

Arnold Cassola

<https://timesofmalta.com/articles/view/yorgen-fenech-gifted-muscat-expensive-wine-at-february-party.759657>

Charles Polidano - Office of the Commissioner for Standards in Public Life

From: Arnold Cassola <arnoldcassola@gmail.com>
Sent: Friday, 27 December 2019 08:53
To: Charles Polidano - Office of the Commissioner for Standards in Public Life
Subject: Fwd: cassola corrigendum

Fil-fatt, ir-rigal inghata fi Frar ta' din is-ena 2019, jigifieri: Donazzjoni ta' 3 fliexken inbid tal-valur ta' 5800 ewro fi Frar ta' 2019, jigifieri sentejn wara li s-Sur Yorgen Fenech kien ikkummissjona l-assassinju ta- Sinjura Daphne Caruana Galizia u almenu 8 xhur wara li l-Prim Ministru kien jaf li Fenech kien wiehed mis-suspettati.

Dana ghalhekk jaqa' taht irremet tal-Kummissarju.

Tislijiet,

Arnold Cassola

----- Forwarded message -----

From: **Arnold Cassola** <arnoldcassola@gmail.com>
Date: Fri, 27 Dec 2019, 14:28
Subject:
To: Claire Bonello <drcbonello@gmail.com>

Lill-President
Kummissjoni kontra l-Ingustizzji

Sur President,

Qieghed nitlobok tindaga zewg donazzjonijiet li s-Sur Yorgen Fenech ghamel lill-Prim Ministru disgrazzjat ta' Malta, Joseph Muscat.

1. Donazzjoni ta' arlogg li jiswa 20, 000 ewro fl-2014, ftit jiem biss qabel il-Gvern Malti dahhal bil-mohbi artijiet proprjeta' tas- Sur Yorgen Fenech fl-Imriehel fl-iskema ta' bini highrise. Ara hawn:

https://www.maltatoday.com.mt/news/national/40446/high_rise_planning_policy_mrriehel_included_by_stealth#.XgWu5NSIZax

2. Donazzjoni ta' 3 fliexken inbid tal-valur ta' 5800 ewro fi Frar ta' 2018, jigifieri sena wara li s-Sur Yorgen Fenech kien ikkummissjona l-assassinju ta- Sinjura Daphne Caruana Galizia. Ara hawn:

<https://timesofmalta.com/articles/view/yorgen-fenech-gifted-muscat-expensive-wine-at-february-party.759657>

Stante il-gravita' ta' dawn ir-rivelazzjonijiet, li jinvolve mhux biss reat ta' tixhim, izda wkoll assassinju u theddid ghad-demokrazija, qiegħed nitlobok tezamina l-kaz bil-massima speditezza.

Inselli għalik,

Charles Polidano - Office of the Commissioner for Standards in Public Life

From: Charles Polidano - Office of the Commissioner for Standards in Public Life
Sent: Friday, 3 January 2020 11:52
To: Cutajar Mario at OPM
Cc: George Hyzler - Office of the Commissioner for Standards in Public Life
Subject: Policy on and inventory of gifts retained by the state

Principal Permanent Secretary

Reference is made to recent reports concerning high-value gifts allegedly given to the Prime Minister and in the possession of the state.

You are kindly requested to state what criteria are used to determine which gifts given to the Prime Minister are considered personal and which are to be retained by the state; where such gifts are held; and how such gifts are recorded. If there is a written policy on this matter, please forward a copy to this office.

You are also kindly requested to forward a copy of the current inventory of gifts so retained and to state who is the person responsible for maintaining it.

The Commissioner for Standards in Public Life would appreciate a reply to this email by not later than **Wednesday 8 January 2020**.

Charles Polidano
Director General



Office of the Commissioner for Standards in Public Life

11 St Paul Street, Valletta VLT 1210, Malta
+356 27 269 593 www.standardscommissioner.com

Charles Polidano - Office of the Commissioner for Standards in Public Life

From: Cutajar Mario at OPM <mario.cutajar@gov.mt>
Sent: Friday, 10 January 2020 15:42
To: Charles Polidano - Office of the Commissioner for Standards in Public Life
Cc: George Hyzler - Office of the Commissioner for Standards in Public Life
Subject: RE: [EXTERNAL] - Policy on and inventory of gifts retained by the state

Mr Polidano

Thank you for your email subjoined.

Though it is not my intention to dwell on such trivialities but your latest communication gives the impression that your initial email was simply far removed from any notion of an ongoing investigation by the Commissioner. Apart from the fact that during our telephone conversation you verbally confirmed that the questions put were linked to an investigation allow me to remind you that your opening statement of your initial email states: "Reference is made to recent reports concerning high-value gifts allegedly given to the Prime Minister and in the possession of the state."

Your original email concentrates specifically on the Prime Minister and consistent with the first paragraph, the gifts he received (vide your second paragraph). No mention was made of Ministers and Parliamentary Secretaries nor of any revisions of codes or policies.

It is also pertinent to point out that the fact that your email was addressed to the undersigned and not to the Prime Minister does not rule out an ongoing investigation. On different occasions the Commissioner wrote directly to me regarding investigations being carried out by his office (examples: 5 and 7 March 2019).

Having said that, as to your re-dimensioned request the current regime is not different from the one used in previous years and previous administrations and makes no distinction between the Prime Minister and Ministers or Parliamentary Secretaries.

Protocol dictates that programmes of official visits would include if that is the case, exchange of gifts. Hence an 'official' gift is clearly determined. There is an administrative procedure which would then include that gift in the inventory of the room in which it is kept or displayed. Inventories are entered into an electronic system governed by the Ministry for Finance as per MF Circular 15/99. Personal gifts which are left to the State follow the same procedure. This administration has enhanced the procedure by including the personal gifts in the room inventories.

Inventories are signed by both the official responsible for the inventories update and the person responsible for the room or property.

Mario Cutajar

Principal Permanent Secretary and Cabinet Secretary
Office of the Principal Permanent Secretary

t +356 22001489 e mario.cutajar@gov.mt
www.opm.gov.mt | www.publicservice.gov.mt
Valletta 2018 - European Capital of Culture www.valletta2018.org
Kindly consider your environmental responsibility before printing this e-mail

OFFICE OF THE PRIME MINISTER
AUBERGE DE CASTILLE, VALLETTA, MALTA

From: Charles Polidano - Office of the Commissioner for Standards in Public Life
<charles.polidano@standardscommissioner.com>

Sent: Tuesday, 07 January 2020 16:06

To: Cutajar Mario at OPM <mario.cutajar@gov.mt>

Cc: George Hyzler - Office of the Commissioner for Standards in Public Life
<commissioner@standardscommissioner.com>

Subject: RE: [EXTERNAL] - Policy on and inventory of gifts retained by the state

Principal Permanent Secretary

I am directed by the Commissioner for Standards in Public Life to inform you that the questions put to you in my email of the 3 January 2020 were not tied to the investigation into the allegations made in the reports referred to.

In fact, the email was addressed to you and not to the Prime Minister, as would have been the case had the questions been made in the context of such an investigation. Moreover, the questions were not limited to the items mentioned but were of a general nature.

As you may be aware, the Commissioner is in the process of proposing revised codes of ethics (for MPs and for Ministers and Parliamentary Secretaries) as well as recommendations on the acceptance of gifts (including benefits and hospitality) in pursuance to art 13(g) of Chap 570, and therefore the current regime is of interest also from this perspective. I would assume that the answers would also refer to the practice adopted by Ministers and Parliamentary Secretaries in general.

Charles Polidano
Director General



Office of the Commissioner for Standards in Public Life

11 St Paul Street, Valletta VLT 1210, Malta
+356 27 269 593 www.standardscommissioner.com

From: Cutajar Mario at OPM <mario.cutajar@gov.mt>

Sent: Friday, 3 January 2020 12:58

To: Charles Polidano - Office of the Commissioner for Standards in Public Life
<charles.polidano@standardscommissioner.com>

Cc: George Hyzler - Office of the Commissioner for Standards in Public Life

[<commissioner@standardscommissioner.com>](mailto:commissioner@standardscommissioner.com)

Subject: Re: [EXTERNAL] - Policy on and inventory of gifts retained by the state

Mr Polidano

I will be back in office this coming Monday afternoon and in all probability, considering that Tuesday is Cabinet day and presently, as the procedure goes whenever there is a change of Prime Minister/Minister the inventories of all offices and properties concerned are checked and verified, the deadline imposed cannot be realistically met. I believe that today week is a better option if I may suggest to the Commissioner.

Regards

M Cutajar
PPS

Sent from my iPhone

On 03 Jan 2020, at 11:51, Charles Polidano - Office of the Commissioner for Standards in Public Life [<charles.polidano@standardscommissioner.com>](mailto:charles.polidano@standardscommissioner.com) wrote:

Principal Permanent Secretary

Reference is made to recent reports concerning high-value gifts allegedly given to the Prime Minister and in the possession of the state.

You are kindly requested to state what criteria are used to determine which gifts given to the Prime Minister are considered personal and which are to be retained by the state; where such gifts are held; and how such gifts are recorded. If there is a written policy on this matter, please forward a copy to this office.

You are also kindly requested to forward a copy of the current inventory of gifts so retained and to state who is the person responsible for maintaining it.

The Commissioner for Standards in Public Life would appreciate a reply to this email by not later than **Wednesday 8 January 2020**.

Charles Polidano
Director General

<image001.jpg> **Office of the Commissioner for Standards in Public Life**

11 St Paul Street, Valletta VLT 1210, Malta
+356 27 269 593 www.standardscommissioner.com



14 ta' Jannar 2020

L-Onor Joseph Muscat MP

Bl-email fuq l-indirizz
joseph.muscat@gov.mt

Onorevoli,

Każ K/019: aċċettazzjoni ta' inbejjed ta' valur għoli bħala rigal

Jiena ġejt mitlub ninvestiga rapport fil-media fejn ġie allegat li fi Frar tal-2019 is-Sur Yorgen Fenech irregalalek inbejjed ta' valur għoli f'għeluq sniek. Qed nibgħatlek kopji taż-żewġ emails dwar dan il-każ li rċevejt mingħand l-ilmentatur.

Jiena qed nikkunsidra dan il-każ fil-kuntest tal-kodiċi ta' etika għall-ministri u s-segretarji parlamentari, li jinsab fit-tieni skeda tal-Att dwar Standards fil-Ħajja Pubblika (il-kapitolu 570 tal-liġijiet ta' Malta). Id-dispożizzjonijiet fil-kodiċi li jidhru relevanti huma s-segwenti:

4.7 Il-Ministri għandhom jassiguraw illi ma jkun hemm l-ebda konflitt ta' interess bejn id-doveri pubbliċi tagħhom u l-interessi personali.

4.8 Il-Ministri m'għandhom jaċċettaw ebda rigali jew benefiċċji, salv kif provdut f'dan il-Kodiċi, li jistgħu jew jistgħu raġonevolment joħolqu impressjoni li qed jikkompromettu l-ġudizzju tagħhom jew li jpoġġuhom taħt xi obbligazzjoni mhux xierqa.

5.7 Onestà – il-Ministri għandhom jevitaw li jidhlu f'konflitti ta' interess bejn l-interess pubbliku u dak privat tagħhom u għandhom jagħtu informazzjoni sħiħa u korretta lill-Parlament, lill-Kabinett u lill-pubbliku ingenerali.

5.9 Tmexxija – il-Ministri għandhom iħaddnu u jkunu ispirati minn dawn il-valuri biex b'hekk imexxu bl-eżempju.

8.4 Ebda Ministru m'għandu jaċċetta rigali, donazzjonijiet, ospitalità jew servizzi mingħand xi hadd, li jistgħu jpoġġuh taħt obbligazzjoni lejn dik il-persuna jew persuni u dan għandu wkoll japplika



għall-membri tal-familja immedjata tal-Ministru. F'każ ta' dubju għandu jiġi kkonsultat il-Prim Ministru.

Inti għentilment mitlub tagħti r-reazzjonijiet tiegħek b'mod ġenerali dwar l-allegazzjonijiet in kwistjoni.

Napprezza risposta sa nhar l-**Erbgħa 22 ta' Jannar 2020**.

Inselli għalik,

George Marius Hyzler
Kummissarju għall-Istandards fil-Ħajja Pubblika

31 ta' Jannar 2020

Riferenza tiegħek: K/019

Kummissarju għall-iStandards fil-Ħajja Pubblika

Għażiż Dr Hyzler,

Nagħmel riferenza għall-email tiegħek tal-14 ta' Jannar 2020 dwar l-investigazzjoni, li intlabt li tagħmel minn Arnold Cassola, dwar rapport fil-media dwar rigal ta' inbejjed li ngħatajt f'għeluq snini.

Fir-rapport indikat minn Cassola fl-email tiegħu jiena diġa' weġibt u spjegajt il-pożizzjoni tiegħi. Bħalma l-media irraportat 'ir-rigal' tal-inbejjed, irraportat ukoll x'għidt jien dwar l-istess każ. Jiena diġa' spjegajt li kont qiegħed naġixxi skont ir-responsabbiltajiet tiegħi bħala Prim Ministru fil-kuntest tal-investigazzjonijiet li kienu u għadhom għaddejjin dwar l-assassinju tas-Sa. Daphne Caruana Galizia. Kull pass li għamilt f'dan ir-rigward, għamiltu bl-għarfien sħiħ tas-servizzi tas-sigurta fil-pajjiż u fuq gwida tagħhom. Dan għidtu pubblikament.

Tant hu hekk li dan ir-'rigal' ma ħadtux u ma użajtux iżda ħallejtu fir-residenza tas-sajf tal-Prim Ministru fil-Girgenti, kif jista' jiġi kkonfermat. Dan kollu ħareġ ukoll fil-media.

Niġbed ukoll l-attenzjoni li mill-artikli tal-Att dwar Standards fil-Ħajja Pubblika kkwotat minnek, huwa ċar li ma hemm l-ebda każ ta' kunflitt ta' interess (4.7). Aktar minn hekk, tant kemm il-ġudizzju tiegħi ma kienx kompromess, li d-decizzjonijiet li ħadt, li numru minnhom diġa' jinsabu fid-dominju pubbliku, wasslu għal żviluppi sostanzjali fil-każ tal-assassinju tas-Sa. Daphne Caruana Galizia (5.7 u 8.4)

Mhux biss ma ksirt ebda regola ta' imġieba imposta fuq il-kariga ta' Prim Ministru, iżda aġixxejt bir-responsabilità' sħiħa.

Nirriafferma dak li diġa' għidt pubblikament, li dak li qed jingħad fuqi dwar rigali li suppost ingħatajt, apparti li mhux korrett, huwa presumibilment intiż biex tinbena narrattiva minn naħa ta' parti involuta fil-kawża għal użu ulterjuri fi stadju ieħor tal-proċess. Nemmen li l-istituzzjonijiet m'għandhomx jippermettu li jiġu wżati biex jissekondaw tali narrattiva għal raġunijiet ta' sustanza u ta' perċezzjoni li huma ovvjji.

Ma' dan norbot ukoll dak li sar mill-uffiċċju tiegħek meta ntalbet informazzjoni u dokumentazzjoni fuq l-istess każ li dwaru ktibtli din l-email, lill-Uffiċċju tal-Prim Ministru, meta jien kont għadni fil-kariga, mingħajr ma jien kont avżat li kont qed niġi investigat minnek. Wara li ngibdet l-attenzjoni għal dan mis-Segretarju Permanenti Ewlieni inbidlet il-verżjoni tat-talba tiegħek lill-Uffiċċju tal-Prim Ministru. Inħoss li dan minnu nnifsu jirriskja li jippreġudika kwalunkwe proċess ġust.

Nirringrazzjak u nselli għalik.

Joseph Muscat

Site / Room	Room Description	Section Description	Asset Description	Qty.
0102	Cabinet Room	PM Secretariat	Mug of Artist Philippe Aguis Malta 2016	1
0102	Cabinet Room	PM Secretariat	Small ikona of the Sagra Familja (Donated post 2013)	1
0102	Cabinet Room	PM Secretariat	Glass Token from Malta Gas and Power Project (Donated post 2013)	1
0102	Cabinet Room	PM Secretariat	Glass Token from Malta Malayalee Association (Donated post 2013)	1
0102	Cabinet Room	PM Secretariat	Frame gifted by the Maltese Centre Astoria NY USA (Donated post 2013)	1
0102	Cabinet Room	PM Secretariat	Plaque gifted by the Maltese Centre Astoria NY USA (Donated post 2013)	1
0102	Cabinet Room	PM Secretariat	Valletta Crest Pennant (Donated post 2013)	1
0102	Cabinet Room	PM Secretariat	Citta di Castello Crest Pennant (Donated post 2013)	1
0102	Cabinet Room	PM Secretariat	Token given by the Cultural Flower Association Italy (Donated post 2013)	1
0102	Cabinet Room	PM Secretariat	Emblem - Malta Police Force (Donated post 2013)	1
0102	Cabinet Room	PM Secretariat	Silver Plate from Tennis Europe Annual General Meeting 2019	1
0102	Cabinet Room	PM Secretariat	Token in commemoration of the 97th year of the PL given by PN Kalkara (4/12/2017)	1
0102	Cabinet Room	PM Secretariat	Token in commemoration of the 97th year of the PL given by Kalkara Football Club (4/12/2017)	1
0102	Cabinet Room	PM Secretariat	Mug from the Assocjazzjoni Suldati Penzjonanti (Donated post 2013)	1
0102	Cabinet Room	PM Secretariat	Token given by Evolve Endurance Club (Aug 2019)	1
0102	Cabinet Room	PM Secretariat	Token by Malta Falconers Club (July 2018)	1
0102	Cabinet Room	PM Secretariat	Token by Valletta Futsal (2017/2018 season)	1
0102	Cabinet Room	PM Secretariat	OPM Window Sculpture on Maltese Stone (2014)	1
0102	Cabinet Room	PM Secretariat	Fimbank 25 years - Global Trade (Donated post 2013)	1
0102	Cabinet Room	PM Secretariat	Ghaqda tal-Penzjonanti Token 1987-2017 (2017)	1

Site / Room	Room Description	Section Description	Asset Description	Qty.
0102	Cabinet Room	PM Secretariat	Grimaldi Lines Token (Donated post 2013)	1
0102	Cabinet Room	PM Secretariat	NAO Token 2017	1
01203	PM's Office	PM Secretariat	Glass knife with gold handle and small red crystals on the handle (Donated post 2013)	1
0004	Former EUCI Registry	Cabinet Office	Gavox Watch (gift from Head of Government) Belgium (Donated post 2013)	1
0004	Former EUCI Registry	Cabinet Office	Unmarked autographed watch (gift from Secretary General of International Organisation) United Nations (Donated post 2013)	1
0004	Former EUCI Registry	Cabinet Office	Bvlgari Malta EU commemoration watch marked 02/25 (private gift from Yorgen Fenech), December 2014	1
0004	Former EUCI Registry	Cabinet Office	3 pairs of amber and other stone cufflinks (gift from Head of Government) Poland (Donated post 2013)	1

Site / Room	Room Description	Section Description	Asset Description	Qty.
18005	Long Room (Ground Floor)	Girgenti Palace	Statue - Mini Dragon (Donated post 2013)	1
18002	Study (Ground Floor)	Girgenti Palace	Wooden Boomerang (Donated post 2013)	1
18005	Long Room (Ground Floor)	Girgenti Palace	Religious silver icon (Donated post 2013)	1
18005	Long Room (Ground Floor)	Girgenti Palace	Frame with flowers Nangin Brocade (Donated post 2013)	1
18005	Long Room (Ground Floor)	Girgenti Palace	Book with paintings - THEORAMA (Donated post 2013)	1
18001	Entrance Hall (Ground Floor)	Girgenti Palace	Maltese Falcon, City of Granada, Spain (Donated post 2013)	1
18005	Long Room (Ground Floor)	Girgenti Palace	Eagle statue, President of Albania (Donated post 2013)	1
18002	Study (Ground Floor)	Girgenti Palace	Cruise ship MSC Seaview (Donated post 2013)	1
18002	Study (Ground Floor)	Girgenti Palace	Religious statue (Donated post 2013)	1
18002	Study (Ground Floor)	Girgenti Palace	Two hand palms with globe in middle (Donated post 2013)	1
18001	Entrance Hall (Ground Floor)	Girgenti Palace	Crystal Vase (Donated post 2013)	1
18011	Library (First Room)	Girgenti Palace	2 Petrus 2007 and 1 Petrus 1974 Wine bottles, February 2019	3
18005	Long Room (Ground Floor)	Girgenti Palace	Christmas tree coloured glass decoration (Donated post 2013)	1
18005	Long Room (Ground Floor)	Girgenti Palace	Tritoni in Glass - gift from Min for Transport (Donated post 2013)	1
18011	Library (First Room)	Girgenti Palace	Vin d`Algerie Cubee du President (Donated post 2013)	10
18014	Family room	Girgenti Palace	Painting - Lady Farmer with Chicks (Donated post 2013)	1

Site / Room	Room Description	Section Description	Asset Description	Qty.
18018	Blue Room (First Floor)	Girgenti Palace	Silver frame - Mother of Jesus (Donated post 2013)	1

Site / Room	Room Description	Section Description	Asset Description	Qty.
19008	Dining room upstairs	Villa Francia	Wooden Frame - Dubai Culture 2016	1
19009	Music room	Villa Francia	Centre piece with two angels (Donated post 2013)	1
19009	Music room	Villa Francia	Clarinet (Donated post 2013)	1
19009	Music room	Villa Francia	Trombone (Donated post 2013)	1
19009	Music room	Villa Francia	Silver coloured statue - Man with Globe on Back (Donated post 2013)	1
19009	Music room	Villa Francia	Piano (1st August 2017)	1
19009	Music room	Villa Francia	White Statue Girl (Donated post 2013)	1
19012	Drawing room	Villa Francia	Glass ornament Tokyo Skytree (July 2018)	1
19012	Drawing room	Villa Francia	Glass ornament of tree (2014)	1
19012	Drawing room	Villa Francia	Fibre material vase - Official visit to India, 2019	1
19012	Drawing room	Villa Francia	Gift from Collection given to Ms Muscat - Ganutel flowers in frame (Donated post 2013)	1
19012	Drawing room	Villa Francia	Wall hanging - Official China visit 2014	1
19002	Blue room	Villa Francia	Yellow bear figure (Donated post 2013)	1
19002	Blue room	Villa Francia	Ceramic plate Misericordia, 2016	1
19004	PM's office	Villa Francia	Silver tray Skolasajf 2015	1
19004	PM's office	Villa Francia	Wooden Clock, 2014	1
19004	PM's office	Villa Francia	Ink pot with Feather (Donated post 2013)	1
19004	PM's office	Villa Francia	Plaster ornament Delarue, (Donated post 2013)	1
19004	PM's office	Villa Francia	Wooden box with ornament (Donated post 2013)	1
19004	PM's office	Villa Francia	Gold metal Key, 2015	1
19004	PM's office	Villa Francia	Gold metal medal (Donated post 2013)	1
19004	PM's office	Villa Francia	Round silver tray (Donated post 2013)	1
19004	PM's office	Villa Francia	Silver tray St Peter's Band Club, 1st August 2017	1
19004	PM's office	Villa Francia	Wooden plaque with propeller, April 2018	1
19004	PM's office	Villa Francia	Electric windmill (Donated post 20103)	1

Site / Room	Room Description	Section Description	Asset Description	Qty.
19012	Drawing room	Villa Francia	Wall hanging Official visit to China, 2016	1
19005	Pink room	Villa Francia	Glass frame with Bled Tower view (Donated post 2013)	1
19005	Pink room	Villa Francia	Wooden Boat (Donated post 2013)	1
19005	Pink room	Villa Francia	Wooden bowl with turtles picture (2015)	1
19005	Pink room	Villa Francia	Glass decoration - aeroplane China Leasing Group (Donated post 2013)	1
19005	Pink room	Villa Francia	Macedonia frame Silver mask (Donated post 2013)	1
19005	Pink room	Villa Francia	Wooden frame - Gift from State of Qatar - Coins collection (Donated post 2013)	1
19005	Pink room	Villa Francia	Picture: Khanjar with blue crystals (Donated post 2013)	1
19001	Office (ground floor)	Villa Francia	Plastic aeroplane (Donated post 2013)	1
19001	Office (ground floor)	Villa Francia	Leopard Picture, 2015	1
19008	Dining room upstairs	Villa Francia	Ceramic plate - Rain Forest Pottery, Guyana 2015	1
19008	Dining room upstairs	Villa Francia	Two Figure Statue - Face to Face, 2013	1
19008	Dining room upstairs	Villa Francia	Frame - Gift Montenegro 2016	1
19008	Dining room upstairs	Villa Francia	Frame - Gift to Ms Michelle Muscat (round item) (Donated post 2013)	1
19008	Dining room upstairs	Villa Francia	Frame - Gift to Ms Michelle Muscat - Official visit Dubai 2016	1
19008	Dining room upstairs	Villa Francia	Black frame ornament with 14 small silver pictures (Donated post 2013)	1
19008	Dining room upstairs	Villa Francia	Glass ornament of Hen (Donated post 2013)	1
19008	Dining room upstairs	Villa Francia	Small box with gold medal (Donated post 2013)	1

Site / Room	Room Description	Section Description	Asset Description	Qty.
19008	Dining room upstairs	Villa Francia	Frame with two pigeons (Donated post 2013)	1
19009	Music room	Villa Francia	Decanter with two glasses (Donated post 2013)	1
19008	Dining room upstairs	Villa Francia	Woman statue, 2015	1
19008	Dining room upstairs	Villa Francia	Wooden frame, Sydney Opera House (Donated post 2013)	1
19008	Dining room upstairs	Villa Francia	Black plastic frame with volcano picture (Donated post 2013)	1
19008	Dining room upstairs	Villa Francia	Ceramic tile with painting of volcano (Donated post 2013)	1
19008	Dining room upstairs	Villa Francia	Wooden frame with fabric lion picture (Donated post 2013)	1
19008	Dining room upstairs	Villa Francia	Silver Tree on White Piece of Marble (Donated post 2013)	1
19008	Dining room upstairs	Villa Francia	Grey Marble Ornament, 2013	1
19008	Dining room upstairs	Villa Francia	Plaster Egyptian Bust (Donated post 2013)	1
19008	Dining room upstairs	Villa Francia	Silver /wooden clock, 2014	1
19008	Dining room upstairs	Villa Francia	Gold metal design on wood (Donated post 2013)	1
19008	Dining room upstairs	Villa Francia	Cotton Mill, 2019	1
19008	Dining room upstairs	Villa Francia	Marble ornament brown/light grey (Donated post 2013)	1
19008	Dining room upstairs	Villa Francia	Metal coffee Turkish style pot (Donated post 2013)	1

Site / Room	Room Description	Section Description	Asset Description	Qty.
19008	Dining room upstairs	Villa Francia	Flat Iron Building - New York (Donated post 2013)	1
19008	Dining room upstairs	Villa Francia	Silver/Gold Elephant design (Donated post 2019)	1
19008	Dining room upstairs	Villa Francia	Gold palace design with 8 flags in glass box (Donated posted 2013)	1
19008	Dining room upstairs	Villa Francia	Black/Grey Marble Sculpture (Donated post 2013)	1
19008	Dining room upstairs	Villa Francia	Ceramic painted plates (Donated post 2013)	2
19012	Drawing room	Villa Francia	Glass ornament, President of Parliament Montenegro, 2019	1
19005	Pink room	Villa Francia	Clock with glass and wooden stand, 2014	1
19002	Blue room	Villa Francia	Wooden frame Egyptian (Donated post 2013)	1
19008	Dining room upstairs	Villa Francia	Gold metal plate (Donated post 2013)	1
19008	Dining room upstairs	Villa Francia	Glass ornament with crown, 2015	1
19008	Dining room upstairs	Villa Francia	Plaster ornament (Donated post 2013)	1
19012	Drawing room	Villa Francia	Boat / Dghajsa tal- latini silver with three sails (Donated post 2013)	1
19012	Drawing room	Villa Francia	4 piece pottery set, brown/white (2019)	1
19002	Blue room	Villa Francia	Silver Plaque (Donated post 2013)	1
19002	Blue room	Villa Francia	Glass decoration (Donated post 2013)	1
19012	Drawing room	Villa Francia	Royal Marines Emblem (silver/wooden) (Donated post 2013)	1
19004	PM's office	Villa Francia	Wooden frame - Gift from China to Hon J. Muscat Official visit 2014	1

Site / Room	Room Description	Section Description	Asset Description	Qty.
19008	Dining room upstairs	Villa Francia	Wooden Frame - Gift - A Warrior's Treasure by Royal Selangar (Donated post 2013)	1
19008	Dining room upstairs	Villa Francia	Dark metal house ornament (Donated post 2013)	1
19011	Bedroom and bathroom	Villa Francia	Leather table cloth and cushions - Nigeria Gift (Donated post 2013)	1
19002	Blue room	Villa Francia	Ceramic Plate, Vienne Austria gift (Donated post 2013)	1
19009	Music room	Villa Francia	Ceramic statue - Woman with Horse (Donated post 2013)	1
19011	Bedroom and bathroom	Villa Francia	Coloured baby Jesus (Donated post 2013)	1
19011	Bedroom and bathroom	Villa Francia	Crib in egg with sheep (Donated post 2013)	1
19008	Dining room upstairs	Villa Francia	Coloured feather hand fan ornament (Donated post 2013)	1
19009	Music room	Villa Francia	Gold coloured vases - Japan Gifts (Donated post 2013)	2
19002	Blue room	Villa Francia	Gold metal and wooden ornament with bird picture (Donated post 2013)	1
19013a	First floor kitchen	Villa Francia	Holy Mary Painting (Donated post 2013)	1
19009	Music room	Villa Francia	Madonna ta' Pinu Picture in gold and silver colour frame (Donated post 2013)	1
19008	Dining room upstairs	Villa Francia	Marble white clock with horse statue (Donated post 2013)	1
19005	Pink room	Villa Francia	Picture: Al-Qusr Coffee Pot - South Arabia (Donated post 2013)	1
19005	Pink room	Villa Francia	Picture: Khanjar (Southern Region of Saudi Arabia) (Donated post 2013)	1

Site / Room	Room Description	Section Description	Asset Description	Qty.
19002	Blue room	Villa Francia	Silver frame gifted by the Foundation for Respite Care Services (Donated post 2013)	1
19002	Blue room	Villa Francia	Stone monument, De La Salle College Monument (Donated post 2013)	1
19012	Drawing room	Villa Francia	Wall hanging frame of Chinese Man, China Kung Zi (Donated post 2013)	1
19011	Bedroom and bathroom	Villa Francia	White baby Jesus (Donated post 2013)	1
19012	Drawing room	Villa Francia	White church ornament with wire attached (Donated post 2013)	1